- 1 This paper has been accepted for publication in *Géotechnique*
- 2

4

Strength-dilatancy and critical state behaviours of binary mixtures of graded sands influenced by particle size ratio and fines content

5 Yuksel Yilmaz, Ph.D.¹; Yibing Deng, Ph.D.²; Ching S. Chang, Ph.D.³; Aydin Gokce, MSc.⁴

6

7 ¹Professor (ORCID number 0000-0001-7630-7357), Gazi University, Ankara, Turkey, e-mail:

8 yyuksel@gazi.edu.tr

9 ²Research Assistant (ORCID number 0000-0001-5343-1988), University of Massachusetts Amherst,

10 Amherst, MA, USA, e-mail: yibingdeng@engin.umass.edu (Corresponding Author)

³Professor (ORCID number 0000-0002-3595-5099), University of Massachusetts Amherst, Amherst, MA,

12 USA, e-mail: cchang@engin.umass.edu

13 ⁴Lecturer (ORCID number 0000-0002-1611-2168), Gazi University, Ankara, Turkey, e-mail:

14 agokce@gazi.edu.tr

15

16 Abstract:

Binary granular soil mixtures, as common heterogeneous soils, are ubiquitous in nature and 17 18 man-made deposits. Fines content and particle size ratio are two important gradation parameters for a binary mixture, which have potential influences on mechanical behaviours. However, 19 20 experimental studies on drained shear behaviour considering the whole range of fines content and different particle size ratios are scarce in the literature. For this purpose, we performed a series of 21 22 drained triaxial compression tests on dense binary silica sand mixtures with 4 different particle size ratios to systematically investigate the effects of fines content and particle size ratio on the drained 23 24 shear behaviours. Based on these tests, the strength-dilation behaviour and critical state behaviour were examined. It was observed that both fines content and particle size ratio have significant 25 influence on the stress-strain response, the critical state void ratio, the critical state friction angle, 26 the maximum dilation angle, the peak friction angle, and the strength-dilatancy relation. The 27 28 underlying mechanism for the effects of fines content and particle size ratio was discussed from the 29 perspective of the kinematic movements at particle level.

30 Keywords: Laboratory tests; Sands; Particle-scale behaviour; Shear strength; Deformation

31 **1. Introduction**

Heterogeneous soils are ubiquitous in nature and man-made deposits. These soils are generally composed of a binary mixture of large particles and small particles, such as gravel-sand mixtures and sand-silt mixtures, which are commonly encountered in dams, fills, fault zones, and landslides. The mechanical behaviour of binary soil mixtures have been found very different from that of uniform soil (Carraro et al., 2009; Chang & Phantachang, 2016; Derkaoui et al., 2016; Jehring & Bareither, 2016; Salgado et al., 2000).

Fines content and particle size ratio are two important gradation parameters for a binary mixture, which distinguished mixtures from uniform soils. Thus, it is important to understand the effects of fines content and particle size ratio on the mechanical behaviour of a binary soil mixture.

Many efforts have been made to study the behaviour of binary soil mixtures. The effect of 41 fines content on critical void ratio have been studied using the experimental results by many 42 43 investigators (e.g., Carrera et al. 2011; Dash and Sitharam 2011; Kwa and Airey 2016; Naeini and Baziar 2004; Papadopoulou and Tika 2008; Thevanayagam et al. 2002; Yang 2004; Zlatović and 44 Ishihara 1995). All these results show significant effects of fines content on critical state void ratio, 45 which decreases as fine content increases from zero to about 30%. Then, as the fines content 46 continues to increase, the void ratio increases. This trend is very useful for the evaluation of 47 engineering properties of silty sands using the critical state soil mechanics framework. 48

The effect of fines content on dilatancy for silty sands is usually studied by drained triaxial 49 tests. However, there are limited studies in this area (Carraro et al., 2009; Salgado et al., 2000; Xiao 50 et al., 2017; Patil et al., 2018). Also, in these studies, the fines contents were less than 30%. Among 51 these studies some investigators stated that the Bolton's dilatancy equation proposed for clean sand 52 could still be used for silty sands (Xiao et al., 2017) with the same parameter b: $b = (\phi_p - \phi_{cv})/\psi_p$, 53 where ϕ_p , ϕ_{cv} , and ψ_p are the peak friction angle, critical state friction angle and maximum dilation 54 angle, respectively. b is a dilatancy parameter of 0.436 for Fujian sand with non-plastic fines. This 55 statement needs to be verified for the case of higher fines content (i.e., greater than 30%). 56

57 The effect of fines content on the critical state friction angle have been studied by both 58 drained and undrained triaxial tests. Some investigator found that the critical state friction angle 59 varies with fines content (Murthy et al., 2007; Salgado et al., 2000; Xiao et al., 2017), while others found that the critical state friction angle is independent of fines content (Bouckovalas et al., 2003;
Ni et al., 2004; Rahman et al., 2014).

Based on these investigations, fines content has been found to have significant influence on 62 the soil behaviours associated with void ratio such as maximum and minimum densities, critical 63 state line, and normal compression line, etc. For each soil behaviour, investigations indicated the 64 existence of a transitional or threshold fines content, which is considered to be the boundary between 65 66 the behaviour dominated by the coarser particles and the behaviour dominated by the finer particles in binary mixtures (Thevanayagam et al., 2002; Yang et al., 2006; Chang and Meidani, 2013; Zuo 67 and Baudet, 2015). The concept of transitional fines content has been broadly accepted in soil 68 mechanics. The transitional fine content is different for different soil behaviour, usually varies 69 between 20% and 50%, as discussed by Zuo and Baudet (2015). The existence of transitional fines 70 content, however, has not been discussed in the literature for strength-dilatancy behaviour, which 71 needs to be investigated. 72

Besides fines content, the particle size ratio is also an important factor for a binary mixture. 73 However, until now, very few studies are available in the literature addressing the effect of particle 74 size ratio on critical state behaviour and strength-dilatancy behaviour. Although there are abundant 75 drained triaxial test results on silty sands in the literature, these test results cannot be used to evaluate 76 the effect of particle size ratio because the particle size ratio cannot be isolated from other factors. 77 As far as the authors are aware, there have been only a few studies on particle size ratio using 78 79 discrete element simulations (Ueda et al., 2011; Zhou et al., 2016; Zhu et al., 2020). But, in the literature, there is no attempts which have been made in real soil mixtures or glass beads mixtures 80 to study the effect of particle size ratio on critical state behaviour and stress-dilatancy behaviour. 81

The main objective of this work is to investigate the effects of fines content and particle size 82 83 ratio on critical state behaviour and strength-dilatancy behaviour of binary granular soil mixtures. For this purpose, a series of drained triaxial compression tests at a constant confining stress (200 84 kPa) were conducted on dense binary silica sand mixtures. These binary mixtures were made up of 85 5 size classes of sand particles with various fines contents so that the factor of particle size ratio can 86 be isolated. This paper is organized as follows. The testing program and test results are firstly 87 presented. Then the test results are analyzed to observe the effects of fines content and particle size 88 ratio on the critical state and the strength-dilatancy characteristics of the mixed graded material. The 89

observed patterns are discussed and the underlying mechanism for the influences of fines contentand particle size ratio on drained shear behaviour is discussed.

92

93 2. Testing Program

94 2.1 Testing material

Pasabahce silica sand (herein referred to as silica sand) were selected to use in this 95 experimental study. The silica sand is formed as a result of disintegration of magmatic metamorphic 96 rocks being rich in quartz. The fluvial transportation brought it to actual deposit in Istanbul, Turkey. 97 By sieving the silica sand, five graded uniform silica sands were obtained and used in this 98 experimental study, i.e., #16-#18, #30-#50, #50-#80, #100-#120, and #120-#200, each of which is 99 100 the upper sieve number and the lower sieve number. The particle size and specific gravity of the 101 samples (obtained by ASTM D854-14) are listed in Table 1. A qualitative look at the shape and surface texture of the individual sand grains were determined using the method of 2-D microscopy. 102 103 Fig. 1 shows a series of micrographs of some grains from the silica sands used in this study. The sand grains are mostly sub-angular. Based on these micrographs, Roundness (R_W) for each uniform 104 sand was calculated using its definition proposed by Wadell (1935) and listed in Table 1. The 105 minimum void ratio e_{\min} (maximum index density) and the maximum void ratio e_{\max} (minimum 106 107 index density) of each uniform silica sand were determined according to Method 2A of ASTM D4253 (ASTM D4253-00, 2006) and Method B of ASTM D4254 (ASTM D4254-00, 2006), 108 respectively. The minimum and the maximum void ratios of samples are tabulated in Table 1. 109





Fig. 1. Micrographs of uniform silica sands of five different particle sizes.

Uniform sand ¹	Notes ²	$d_{50} ({\rm mm})$	Roundness	G_{s}	e.max	<i>e</i> min
e inferin build	1.0005	w30 (11111)	100 411 411 455	03	Cinax	Cillin
#16 - #18	Medium sand	1.086	0.36	2.624	0.901	0.632
#30 - #50	Medium/Fine sand	0 4 2 4	0.26	2 640	0 9 9 9	0.698
1150 1150	Wiedrum/1 me Sund	0.424	0.20	2.040	0.777	0.070
#50 - #80	Fine sand	0 232	0.17	2 646	1 1 0 2	0 786
	i ilio bullu	0.202	0.117	2.0.0	11102	0.700
#100 - #120	Fine sand	0.137	0.18	2.652	1.108	0.778
#120 - #200	Fine sand	0.096	0.23	2.654	1.099	0.717

 Table 1 Properties of the uniform silica sands of five different particle sizes.

112

Note: 1 No.# - No.# are the upper sieve number and the lower sieve number respectively for a uniform sand. 2 the classification is according to ASTM D422-63 (2007).

115

To study the effects of fines content and particle size ratio, four series of binary mixtures 116 with four different particle size ratios were prepared by mixing #16-#18 uniform sand with one of 117 the other four uniform sands. Herein, the #16-#18 sand is referred to as "coarse" particles and the 118 other four smaller size sand are referred to as "fine" particle. For each particle size ratio, the series 119 of binary mixture were prepared with fines content $f_c = 0.1, 0.2, 0.3, 0.5, 0.7$. We define fines content 120 as the ratio of the mass of the small particle sand to the total mass of a binary mixture in this study. 121 Particle size ratio is the ratio of the large particle size to the small particle size in a binary mixture. 122 The particle size distributions of binary mixtures with four different particle size ratios are presented 123 in Fig. 2. The minimum void ratio and the maximum void ratio of four series of binary mixtures 124 were determined according to Method 2A of ASTM D4253 (2006) and Method B of ASTM D4254 125 (2006), respectively. The minimum and the maximum void ratios of these binary mixture samples 126 are tabulated in Table 2. 127





Fig. 2. The grain size distributions of binary mixtures with four different particle size ratios: (a) Ratio-2.56,
(b) Ratio- 4.67, (c) Ratio-7.93, and (d) Ratio-11.31

- 131
- 132

Table 2 List of index properties of tested binary mixtures.

Symbol	Mixture series	Size ratio ¹ $\frac{d_{50_coarse}}{d_{50_fine}}$	fc (%)	emax	e min		
			10	0.874	0.603		
	#16-#18		20	0.828	0.566		
Ratio-2.56	#20_#50	2.56	30	0.8	0.54		
	#30-#30		50 0.802				
			70	0.873	0.620		
			10	0.830	0.571		
	#16-#18	4.67	20	0.734 0	0.508		
Ratio-4.67	#50-#80	4.67	30	0.703	0.491		
			50	0.725	0.501		
			70	0.858	0.592		
			10	0.795	0.547		
	#16-#18	= 00	20	0.679	0.452		
Ratio-7.93	#100 #120	7.93	30	0.635	0.393		
	#100-#120		50	50 0.648			
			70	0.821	0.585		
			10	0.797	0.523		
	#16-#18		20	0.659	0.408		
Ratio-11.31	#120 #200	11.31	30	0.583	0.335		
	#120-#200		50	0.600	0.415		
			70	0.776	0.517		

Note: ${}^{1}d_{50_coarse}$ is the large particle mean size and d_{50_fine} is the small particle mean size.

134 2.2 Drained triaxial compression testing

135 A conventional triaxial device was used to study the drained shear behaviour of binary silica sand mixtures. All tests were performed on cylindrical specimens (50 mm in diameter and 100 mm 136 137 in height) under the confining stress of 200 kPa. A total number of 25 triaxial tests were performed. All specimens were prepared by the moist tamping method with the under-compaction technique 138 introduced by Ladd (1978). The moist soil with a moisture content of 5% was placed in the split 139 mold and then compacted to a specified density in five layers. A 3% under-compaction ratio, defined 140 141 as the difference in density between successive layers, was used in the sample preparation to improve the uniformity within specimens. The moist tamping method is able to minimize particle 142 segregation because of capillarity. Because of the advantage in creating uniform samples and 143 avoiding particle segregation, the moist tamping method using under-compaction is preferred in the 144 sample preparation for sand-silt mixtures (e.g., Huang et al., 2004; Wei and Yang, 2019; Yang et 145 al., 2006). 146

Note that the minimum and the maximum void ratios of the samples were obtained by using dry sand (according to ASTM D4253-00 (2006) and ASTM D4254-00 (2006)). The initial void ratios e_0 of all samples after preparation using the moist tamping method were plotted in Fig. 3, compared with the measured values of e_{min} and e_{max} . As shown in Fig.3, the value of e_0 for all samples is nearly the same as that of e_{min} , which indicates that all samples have same initial relative density of around 97%.



153 154

155

Fig. 3. The initial void ratios e_0 of all samples.

After the sample preparation and installation into the triaxial cell, the specimen was saturated by flushing with carbon dioxide gas and then flushing with deaired water, followed by backpressure saturation to achieve a value of Skempton's B parameter of greater than 0.96. Then the specimen was isotropically consolidated under the desired effective confining stress. After consolidation, the specimen was sheared until failure by compressing the specimen at a constant vertical displacement

161 rate of 0.2 mm/min under the confining stress. All samples were under a drained condition during

the course of shearing. Particle breakage was not observed in any test. The results of the triaxial

tests are summarized in Table 3.

Major and minor principal effective stresses are denoted by σ'_1 and σ'_3 . Axial and volumetric strains are denoted by ε_a and ε_v . Contractive strains are considered positive and dilative strains are considered negative.

167

168 169

< Table 3 Summary results of drained triaxial compression tests on the specimens of binary silica sand mixtures of various fines contents for four different particle size ratios.>

	Fines	Void ratio				Shearing					
Samplo	rines	Init	Consoli	Onsot of	Poak	Critical	Strair	n at peak	Peak	Max.	CS
s	ent	ial	dation	dilatancy	stress	State (CS)	stress		friction	dilatancy	fricti
Ū.			aution	unatanoy	011 000				angle	angle	on
	f	0.	0	0.	0		-ANI - C	v01.	ط (۵)		оп Ф
#16 #10	Jc			<i>e</i> _f				ε _ν (%)	$\Psi_p(\circ)$	$\Psi_p(\circ)$	ψ_{cv}
#10-#18	-	0.6	0.021	0.617	0.003	0.727	9.5	-2.0	38.0	11.0	32.8
#16-#18	10	0.5	0.583	0.579	0.619	0.692	10.	-2.5	36.9	9.3	31.6
#30_#50	20	0.5	0.558	0.553	0.584	0.643	10.	-1./	36.0	/./	31.5
#30-#30	30	0.5	0.531	0.527	0.561	0.611	8.2	-1.5	37.6	9.0	33.6
(Ratio-	50	0.5	0.544	0.541	0.575	0.631	8.3	-2.0	38.1	9.9	33.6
2.56)	70	0.6	0.631	0.626	0.655	0.713	9.0	-1.6	37.0	8.3	33.1
	100	0.7	0.700	0.696	0.746	0.805	9.4	-2.7	39.0	11.7	33.6
#16-#18	10	0.5	0.562	0.558	0.603	0.665	12.	-2.5	36.2	8.5	31.7
	20	0.5	0.499	0.494	0.517	0.569	9.0	-1.3	36.4	7.1	31.9
#50-#80	30	0.4	0.461	0.456	0.471	0.503	8.9	-0.7	36.6	5.2	32.8
(Ratio-	50	0.5	0.512	0.508	0.528	0.559	8.7	-0.9	36.8	6.6	33.7
4.67)	70	0.6	0.595	0.591	0.625	0.690	8.9	-2.1	39.2	9.6	34.5
	100	0.7	0.756	0.752	0.812	0.894	9.2	-3.2	40.0	12.3	35.0
#16-#18	10	0.5	0.542	0.535	0.561	0.601	11.	-1.5	35.2	8.0	31.8
#100	20	0.4	0.435	0.428	0.464	0.500	14.	-1.8	34.9	6.7	32.1
#100-	30	0.3	0.376	0.370	0.375	0.408	6.5	-0.03	35.9	4.6	31.3
#120	50	0.4	0.470	0.465	0.484	0.525	7.9	-1.2	38.4	8.2	34.8
(Ratio-	70	0.6	0.598	0.593	0.617	0.677	7.3	-1.2	38.1	10.1	33.3
7.93)	100	0.7	0.784	0.780	0.829	0.903	7.8	-2.0	39.9	12.6	35.2
#16-#18	10	0.5	0.505	0.502	0.550	0.597	11.	-3.0	38.1	11.0	33.0
#120	20	0.4	0.404	0.402	0.433	0.484	9.5	-1.7	36.9	7.1	31.9
#120-	30	0.3	0.339	0.333	0.339	0.356	7.8	-0.03	36.8	4.0	31.7
#200	50	0.4	0.422	0.420	0.435	0.459	5.6	-0.9	38.4	9.2	33.1
(Ratio-	70	0.5	0.523	0.519	0.544	0.621	5.7	-1.32	40.1	12.0	35.2
11.31)	100	0.7	0.734	0.730	0.770	0.865	7.0	-2.1	41.1	13.3	35.1

171 **3. Test Results**

172 3.1 Stress-strain and volumetric change responses

Fig. 4 shows deviatoric stress q ($q = \sigma'_1 - \sigma'_3$) and volumetric strain (ε_v) versus axial strain (ε_a) relationships for these four series of binary mixtures, respectively. As shown in Fig. 4, all specimens exhibited a softening behaviour in the plot of stress versus strain and a dilative behaviour in the plot of volumetric strain versus axial strain. Following the initial slight contraction at a small axial strain, dilation then commences. After the onset of dilation, it continues during shearing until the deviatoric stress mobilizes to the peak value. After the peak deviatoric stress, the stress decreases and appears to approach a stable value indicating that a critical state will be reached at larger strains.

Fig. 4 shows that fines content affects peak shear strength and volumetric response. There is a general trend of the effect of f_c on peak shear strength: at low f_c , the peak strength is reduced with an increase of f_c until a particular f_c termed transitional fines content f_{th} is reached; After that a further increase in f_c results in an increase of the peak strength. Herein, the transitional fines content f_{th} is defined as the point at which the trend reverses.

Considering volumetric response, it was observed that the curve of ε_v vs. ε_a moves upwards with increase of f_c until reaching a transitional fine content f_{th} , after that the curve tends to move downwards with further increasing f_c . For example, for Ratio-4.67 mixtures, the curve moves upwards from the curve of $f_c = 0$ to the top one ($f_c = 30\%$) with increase of f_c . Then, with further increasing f_c , the curve moves downwards from the top one to the lowest one ($f_c = 100\%$). This observation implies that increasing f_c could suppress dilation when $f_c < f_{th}$, on the other hand, increasing f_c could promote dilation when $f_c > f_{th}$.

Fig. 4 shows particle size ratio has significant influence on the characteristics of the stressstrain curve for high f_c samples (i.e. $f_c \ge 50\%$). However, particle size ratio has little influence for low f_c samples ($f_c < 30\%$).

It was observed that for high f_c samples, increasing particle size ratio intensifies the post peak softening of the stress-strain curves (i.e., brittle characteristic). It can be found that for the samples of Ratio-11.31 at high f_c , the strain softening is so intense that it exhibits a collapse behaviour of the stress-strain curves. Correspondingly, visible shear bands were observed in these tests. For low f_c samples, however, increasing particle size ratio has little influence on the degree of post peak softening of the stress-strain curve.

- The reason could be that, for low f_c , large particle network dominates the behaviour. The large particles are of same size in the mixtures of four different particle size ratios. On the other
- hand, for high f_c , small particle matrix dominates the behaviour. And the sizes of small particles are
- 204 dramatically different in the mixtures of four size ratios.





Fig. 4. Experimental results of the drained triaxial compression tests on binary mixtures of various fines
 contents and particle size ratios.

- 208 3.2 Stress-dilatancy plot
- The stress- dilatancy evolution of mixtures is presented in Fig. 5 for each particle size ratio. For clarity, the data for $f_c \le f_{th}$ and $f_c \ge f_{th}$ are separately shown in Fig. 5.
- All stress-dilatancy plots show that there is an initial nonlinear part of the curve before the stress ratio η ($\eta = q/p'$) has reached around $\eta = 0.8$. Then, a consistent increase of dilatancy *D* ($D = -d\varepsilon_v/d\varepsilon_q$) with an increase in the stress ratio $\eta = q/p'$, prior to the maximum dilatancy. Here, *p'* is mean effective stress ($p' = (\sigma'_1 + 2\sigma'_3)/3$) and ε_q is deviator strain ($\varepsilon_q = \varepsilon_a - \varepsilon_v/3$).
- Once *D* reaches a peak (D_{max}), the curves go backwards, yielding a "hook" in the curve as it approaches to the critical state. This behaviour is in agreement with that of Erksak sand (Been and Jefferies, 2004). Li and Dafalias (2000) proposed a model to capture this behaviour.
- As shown in Fig. 5, D_{max} and the corresponding peak stress ratio η_{max} on the stressdilatancy plot vary with different f_c . For $f_c \leq f_{th}$, addition of fine particle reduces the values of D_{max} and the corresponding η_{max} . For $f_c \geq f_{th}$, further increasing f_c rises the values of D_{max} and the corresponding η_{max} . This behaviour agrees with the effect of fines content on peak shear strength and volumetric response mentioned previously. The measured values of D_{max} and the corresponding η_{max} will be used to calculate the maximum dilation angle ψ_p and the peak friction angle ϕ_p , respectively, which will be discussed in the later section.



Fig. 5. The stress-dilatancy plots for binary mixtures of various fines contents and particle size ratios.

228 4. Analyses of Test Results

Based on the test results, the critical state void ratio, the critical state friction angle, the maximum dilation angle, and the peak friction angle can be obtained. In this section, we will discuss the effects of fines content and particle size ratio on the critical state void ratio, the critical state friction angle, the maximum dilation angle, the peak friction angle, and the strength–dilatancy relation.

4.1 Determination of critical state

Critical state (CS) is defined as the state at which the soil continues to deform in shear at 235 constant stress (effective mean stress and shear stress) and constant void ratio (Roscoe et al., 1958). 236 In this study, the triaxial tests were performed up to the maximum axial strain in the apparatus (25%). 237 At this strain, however, the samples have not yet reached the critical state. As suggested by Murthy 238 et al. (2007) and Carrera et al. (2011), it is necessary to extrapolate the stress-strain data to reach 239 the critical state. An extrapolation method, used by Indraratna et al. (2014) and Xiao et al. (2016), 240 was applied to determine the critical state for our tests. Typical examples for extrapolating the data 241 to critical state are given in Appendix A. The extrapolation is more reliable if localisation has not 242 243 yet occurred at 25% strain. However, the extrapolation is not reliable if the occurrence of localisation is before 25% axial strain and accompanied with large nonhomogeneous deformation. In our tests, 244 localisation was observed in some samples (9 out of 25), especially the samples with large particle 245 size ratios at very high or very low fines contents. In the other 16 samples (mostly in the transitional 246 247 region of fines content) localisation was not observed.

For these samples with localisation, the abovementioned method is no longer applicable due to the nonhomogeneous deformation. For these cases with localisation, we have adopted another method suggested by investigators (Harehdasht et al., 2017; Nova, 1982). This method requires multiple test results from the same sample under different confining stresses, instead of a single test, to determine the critical state. Examples using the multiple tests method are given in Appendix A.

4.2 Critical state void ratio

4.2.1 Background

The effects of fines content and particle size ratio on random close packing density 256 (corresponding to minimum void ratio) have been studies by McGeary (1961) for steel shots and by 257 Kwan et al. (2013) for glass beads as shown in Fig. 6. Fig. 6 shows that the minimum void ratio of 258 a binary packing depends on fines content f_c and particle size ratio. It was found that the void ratio 259 of binary mixtures decreases with increasing particle size ratio, for any given fines content. Similar 260 results have been found in soil mixtures (Yilmaz, 2009). The relationship between void ratio and f_c 261 has two features: (1) it is a V-shape curve. The lowest void ratio corresponds to a transitional or 262 263 threshold fines content. (2) the curve has two regions separated by the transitional fines content. The region is coarse-particle dominate region for lower f_c , and fine-particle dominant region for higher 264 265 fc.



266

Fig. 6. The minimum void ratios of binary granular mixtures with various particle size ratios: (a) steel shots
and (b) glass beads.

269

The question raised now is whether the special features for minimum void ratio versus f_c are also applicable to critical state void ratio. There have been a lot of experimental data shown that the relationship between e_{cs} and f_c has V-shape characteristic (e.g., Carrera et al., 2011; Dash and Sitharam, 2011; Kwa and Airey, 2016; Naeini and Baziar, 2004; Papadopoulou and Tika, 2008; Thevanayagam et al., 2002; Yang 2004; Zlatović and Ishihara, 1995). For example, Fig. 7 shows the critical void ratios for five different types of sand-silt mixtures. The V-shape characteristics exhibit in the relationship between critical void ratio and fines content.



Fig. 7. The critical state void ratios of five different types of sand-silt mixtures with various fines contents.

The plots of critical void ratios under the mean effective stress p'_{cs} of 40 kPa in Fig. 7 were 280 281 from five types of binary mixtures with different particle size ratios (ranges from 7.6 - 26) (Carrera et al., 2011; Naeini and Baziar, 2004; Papadopoulou and Tika, 2008; Thevanayagam et al., 2002; 282 283 Yang, 2004). The particle size ratio is 26 for Stava tailings mixtures (Carrera et al., 2011), 25 for Foundry sand-silt mixture (Thevanayagam et al., 2002), 15 for Assyros sand-silt mixtures 284 (Papadopoulou and Tika, 2008), 14 for Hokksund sand-silt (Yang, 2004), and 7.6 for Ardebil sand-285 silt (Naeini and Baziar, 2004). Fig. 7 shows that there is no trend of the particle size ratio effect on 286 the critical state void ratios of these mixtures, because each mixture has a different material type. 287

Thus, in order to study the effect of particle size ratio, we construct the binary mixtures using the components of the same material type so that the effect of particle size ratio can be studied with less influence of other unknown factors. For this purpose, a series of drained compression triaxial tests on binary silica sand mixture of the same material type are conducted.

292

293 4.2.2 The results of e_{cs}

The results of critical state void ratios e_{cs} in this study were plotted in Fig. 8a. The void ratios of samples at the end of testing e_{end} were also plotted in this figure for comparison. The values of e_{cs} and e_{end} for each test are very close. It is observed that the critical state void ratio is dependent on fines content and particle size ratio. Considering the effect of fines content, the relationship between e_{cs} and fines content is a V-shape character. On the left side, increasing f_c results in decreasing e_{cs} of the binary mixture. On the right side, increasing f_c results in increasing e_{cs} of the binary mixture. This V-shape pattern of fines content influence was also observed in many experiment investigations on silt-sand mixtures (e.g., Carrera et al. 2011; Dash and Sitharam 2011; Kwa and Airey 2016; Naeini and Baziar 2004; Papadopoulou and Tika 2008; Thevanayagam et al. 2002; Yang 2004; Zlatović and Ishihara 1995).

Considering the effect of particle size ratio, as shown Fig. 8a, the curve of e_{cs} vs. f_c moves 304 downwards with increasing particle size ratio. The minimum and maximum void ratios of these 305 mixtures used in this study (listed in Table 2) are plotted in Fig.8b and 8c. Comparing the three void 306 ratios in Fig. 8a, 8b, and 8c, it is observed that the influences of fines content and particle size ratio 307 on e_{cs} are similar to these on e_{max} and e_{min} , even though, the three density states: e_{cs} , e_{max} and 308 e_{min} are achieved by three different mechanical processes. The similarity between the changes of 309 e_{cs} and of e_{min} due to fines content has also been found by other investigators (Chang and Yin, 310 2011; Chang and Meidani, 2013; Yin et al., 2014). 311



Fig. 8. The effects of fines content and particle size ratio on (a) critical state void ratio, (b) minimum void
ratio, and (c) maximum void ratio.

312

315

We further investigate the packing potential indices of the three density states. For a system of mixtures (i.e., mixtures with the same two components of various combinations), the upper and the lower bounds can be defined by particle packing theory (Chang and Deng, 2020; De Larrard, 1999; Furnas, 1931; Westman and Hugill, 1930). The void ratios of the binary mixtures with various f_c are between the upper and the lower bounds as the curve ADB shown in Fig. 9a. The packing potential index Ω is defined as the ratio of area ADB to area ACB, which is a material descriptor for a system of mixtures (Chang and Deng, 2020). This index is a measure of volume reduction potential due to mixing of two components of a binary mixture system under a packing procedure, which is a simple scalar and can be directly obtained from experimental data. The value of packing potential index Ω is between 0 and 1. The higher value of Ω indicates a higher potential of volume reduction of the mixtures.

The packing potential indices of the three density states (e_{cs} , e_{max} and e_{min}) for the four 327 particle size ratios are plotted in Fig. 9b. It is interesting to observe that, for each size ratio, the 328 values of these packing potential indices (Ω_{cs} , Ω_{max} , and Ω_{min}) are nearly identical for the three 329 density states (e_{cs} , e_{max} , and e_{min}). The value of Ω seems to be affected mainly by the composition 330 of a mixture but affected marginally by the mechanical procedures that leads to the three density 331 states. It implies that fines content plays the same role in the reduction of void ratio of a binary 332 333 mixture for these three density states. This particular feature is useful for predicting the critical void ratios as a function of particle size ratio and fines content. 334





Fig. 9. (a) The definition of packing potential index and (b) packing potential indices for the void ratios of a
system of mixtures at three density states.

- 338
- 339 4.3 Critical state friction angle

340 The influence of fines content on critical state friction angle ϕ_{cv} were presented in Fig. 10. 341 There are three regions: 342 (a) For low fines content, ϕ_{cv} of binary mixtures keep close to that of the large particle sand and are almost independent on fines content. This could be because the resistance at critical state 343 for these fines contents is dominated by the contacts between large particles while small particles 344 located in the voids are inactive. 345

347

346 (b) For high fines content, ϕ_{cv} of binary mixtures keep close to that of the fine sand and are also almost independent on fines content. This could be because the resistance at critical state for these fines contents is dominated by the contacts between small particles while large particles 348 embedding in the matrix formed by small particles. 349

(c) The third region is a transition region. ϕ_{cv} of binary mixtures is a transition value from 350 ϕ_{cv} of the large particle sand to ϕ_{cv} of the fine sand. In the transition region, with increasing fines 351 352 content, the resistance of a binary mixture at critical state is initially dominated from large particle-353 to-large particle contacts, transition to large particle-to-small particle contacts, and finally to small particle-to-small particle contacts. 354

It is noted that in Fig. 8, the transitional fines content is defined as a point (reverse of 355 behaviour). Now, in Fig. 10, there is no abrupt change of behaviour for critical state friction angle; 356 instead, the behaviour change is gradual. Thus, we define a transition region between the lower 357 transitional fines content and the upper transitional fine content. 358

As shown in Fig. 10, the lower and upper transitional fines contents and the width of 359 360 transition region vary with different particle size ratio. Particle size ratio might be a key factor controlling transition region, as suggested by Ueda et al. (2011). 361

362 As shown in Fig. 10, the transition occurs at lower fines contents with smaller particle size ratios. The reason might be that at smaller particle size ratios the fine particles are too large to fit in 363 the voids between large particles, consequently the network of large particles is altered by the filled 364 fine particles. Thus, the resistance of the binary mixture begin to be dominated by the contacts 365 366 between large particle-to-small particle at lower fines contents, as suggested by Shire et al. (2014). Therefore, the transition occurs at lower fines contents. At larger particle size ratios, on the contrary, 367 the fines fit well in the voids between large particles, consequently the network of large particles is 368 not altered until the voids are fully filled up. Therefore, the transition occurs at higher fines content 369 for the large particle size ratios compared to that for the small particle size ratios. 370



Fig. 10. The influence of fines content on critical state friction angles of binary mixtures with four different
 particle size ratios.

374

This transitional behaviour of critical state friction angle varying with fines content is consistent with the influence of fines content on residual friction angle in experimental investigations (Polito and Sibley, 2020; Vallejo, 2001) and in the discrete element (DEM) simulation by Ueda et al., (2011) for simple and direct shear tests.

However, it was observed from other DEM simulations that the critical state friction angle is roughly independent of fines content and particle size ratio (Zhu et al., 2020) and independent of the particle size distribution (Azéma et al., 2017; Yan and Dong, 2011). The experimental investigation on glass beads also showed the grading independence by Harehdasht et al. (2017).

The independence of fine content on ϕ_{cv} could be caused by the fact that the two particle components in a system of mixtures have the same critical state friction angle. In DEM simulation,

the particles normally have identical shape, stiffness, and inter-particle coefficient of friction. These 385 identical properties for the two components cause the ϕ_{cv} to be independent of fines content. But, in 386 387 the DEM simulation by Ueda et al., (2011), the inter-particle coefficients of friction are assigned to be different for the two components, which cause the friction angle to be dependent of fines content. 388 In our tests, the two particle components in a system of mixtures have different critical state friction 389 angles due to the difference in particle angularity. The finer component is a bit more angular than 390 the coarser component and therefore the ϕ_{cv} is higher for pure fines than pure coarse particles. Hence, 391 the value of ϕ_{cv} is dependent on fines content in our test results. 392

393

4.4 Maximum dilation angle and peak friction angle

The dilation angle (ψ) was calculated using the following relationship proposed by Vermeer and de Borst (1984):

$$\sin\psi = \frac{-(d\varepsilon_{\nu}/d\varepsilon_{a})}{2 - (d\varepsilon_{\nu}/d\varepsilon_{a})} \tag{1}$$

The results of maximum dilation angle ψ_p were presented in Fig. 11a. It was observed that 398 fines content has significant influence on ψ_p , especially for the larger particle size ratios, i.e., Ratio-399 4.67, Ratio-7.93, and Ratio-11.31. For these three particle size ratios, the relationship between ψ_p 400 and fines content has an obvious change around $f_c = 30\%$: ψ_p decreases with an increase in fines 401 content for $f_c < 30\%$, while ψ_p increases with an increase in fines content for $f_c > 30\%$. The smallest 402 ψ_p occurred at the fines content of 30%. For the Ratio-2.56 results, the relationship between ψ_p and 403 fines content is different from those of other three ratios. ψ_p decreases with an increase in fines 404 content for $f_c < 20\%$. The smallest ψ_p occurred at the fines content of 20%. For $f_c > 20\%$, ψ_p increases 405 with an increase in fines content in general except for $f_c = 70\%$. 406

407 No obvious trend was observed for the particle size ratio effect on ψ_p for $f_c < 30\%$. However, 408 some trends were observed for $f_c \ge 30\%$. At $f_c = 30\%$, ψ_p decreases with an increase in particle size 409 ratio. The trend evolves and becomes opposite when f_c is above 50%, in which, ψ_p increases with 410 an increase in particle size ratio.

411

The mechanism of the abovementioned behaviour will be discussed in the later section.

412 The results of peak friction angle ϕ_p were presented in Fig. 11b. For all particle size ratios, at 413 low fines content, ϕ_p decreases slightly with increasing fines content. With further increasing fines 414 content, ϕ_p is in transition to approach the ϕ_p of the small particle size sand. But the trend for the 415 effect of particle size ratio on the value of ϕ_p was not found.



416

417 **Fig. 11.** The influence of fines content on: (a) the maximum dilation angle ψ_p , (b) the peak friction angle 418 ϕ_p , and (c) the dilatancy parameter *b* in Bolton's stress-dilatancy relation, for binary mixtures with four 419 different particle size ratios.

Bolton (1986) has proposed an empirical formulation to describe the stress-dilatancy relationgiven by:

423

420

$$\phi_p = \phi_{cv} + b\psi_p \tag{2}$$

where parameter b is dilatancy parameter which implies the contribution of dilatancy to the peak 424 strength. The values of b were calculated using the above equation and presented in Fig. 11c. There 425 is little variation in the values of b at low or high fines content, which is consistent with the statement 426 made by Xiao et al. (2017) that the effect of f_c on the value of b is negligible. However, Xiao et al. 427 (2017) observed only on their data of Fujian sand mixtures for $f_c \leq 20\%$. Fig. 11c clearly shows that 428 in the transitional fines content region (around 30%), values of b are much greater than that in low 429 430 and high fines content regions, and increase with increasing particle size ratio. The large values of b show that the contribution of dilatancy to the peak strength is different between the transitional $f_{\rm c}$ 431 region and the other two f_c regions. The different contribution of dilatancy to the peak strength 432 indicated that the mechnisms of dilatancy must be different between the transitional f_c region and 433 434 the other two f_c regions, which will be discussed in the following section.

435 4.5 Transitional fines content

436 The transitional fine content is different for different soil behaviour. The transitional fines 437 contents of Silica sand are listed in Table 4 for e_{\min} , e_{\max} , e_{cs} , ϕ_{cv} , ψ_p , and parameter *b*. For e_{\min} , e_{\max} , e_{cs} , and ψ_p , the curves of the evolutions with fines content are generally Vshape, and the lowest points were selected as transitional fines contents. However, for some curves, the V-shape characteristic is blunt. In this case, a transitional fines content region is estimated, in which the lowest point is located.

For ϕ_{cv} , the curves do not have the V-shape characteristic (see Fig.10). The shape of curves is two steps connected by a ramp. The curve changes gradually from a coarse-particle dominant behaviour to a fine-particle dominant behaviour. Thus, we define a transition region between the lower transitional fines content and the upper transitional fine content as listed in Table 4.

For parameter *b*, Fig. 11c clearly shows that in the transitional fines content region (around 30%), values of *b* are much greater than that in low and high fines content regions, and increase with increasing particle size ratio. In this transitional region, the behaviour is very different from those in other regions. The transitional regions were estimated and listed in Table 4.

Table 4 shows that the transitional fines content is dependent on the type of soil behaviour.There is no unique transitional fines content can be defined for a binary mixture.

452 **Table 4** The transitional fines contents f_{th} for different soil behaviours with different particle size 453 ratios.

Soil beahviour	f_{th}	f_{th}	f_{th}	f_{th}	
	Ratio-2.56	Ratio-4.67	Ratio-7.93	Ratio-11.31	
e_{\min}	30%-50%	20%-50%	30%	30%	
emax	30%-50%	30%-50%	30%	30%	
ecs	20%-50%	30%	30%	30%	
ϕ_{cv}	20%-30%	20%-50%	30%-50%	30%-70%	
ψ_p	20%	30%	30%	30%	
b	10%-30%	20%-50%	20%-50%	20%-50%	

454

455 5. Discussion on the mechanism for the influences of fines content and particle size 456 ratio on drained shear behaviour

457 A dense uniform sand sample shearing to critical state successively experiences hardening 458 process and softening process, in which a shear band is usually occurred. The mechanism ending up with the formation of shear bands is the buildup of particle columns during the hardening processand its collapse during the softening process (Iwashita and Oda, 2000).

According to Iwashita and Oda (2000), in the hardening process up to failure, particles are 461 rearranged in chains to form particle columns aligned in the direction of the major principal stress 462 463 axis, and the applied load is mainly transmitted through them in the form of force chains. As shown in Fig 12a, during the loading process, the pre-existing contacts are lost in the minor principal stress 464 direction, but new contacts are formed in the major principal stress direction. Consequently, an 465 elongated void is generated between two neighboring columns. This is the mechanism causing 466 dilatancy before failure. Due to the forming of particle columns and the elongated void parallel to 467 the major principal stress direction, the packing structure becomes highly anisotropic. Such 468 anisotropic structure becomes gradually unstable because of the loss of surrounding contact points. 469 Finally, the particle columns are collapsed via buckling, as shown in Fig. 12b. The number of 470 buckled columns increases during the loading process, which eventually leads to a peak stress failure. 471 After peak stress, a new packing structure is re-constructed during the softening process. The main 472 process now is the continuing buckling of particle columns gradually concentrated in a narrow shear 473 band, which causes the growth of large voids between buckling columns and particle rotation. 474 Finally, the structure reaches a dynamically stable condition at the critical state. During critical state, 475 buildup and collapse of particle columns keep equilibrium within persistent shear bands. The 476 dilatancy is balanced with the contraction so that the overall volumetric strain remains unchanged, 477 478 resulting in a constant void ratio.



479

480 Fig. 12. A schematic diagram illustrating the mechanism for dilatancy: (a) buildup of particle columns and
481 (b) buckling particle columns.

483

The mechanism for influences of fines content and particle size ratio could be explained from the perspective of particle column buckling, as illustrated in Fig. 13.

484

For large particle dominant binary mixtures (i.e. at low f_c), as illustrated in Fig 13a, the 485 particle columns are mainly formed by large particles during the hardening process. Small particles 486 are filled between two neighboring columns. Small particles laterally support the particle column to 487 suppress buckling. Consequently, the generation of the elongated void between two neighboring 488 columns is limited. As the elongated void leads to dilatancy before failure, therefore, the dilatancy 489 in the binary mixture is smaller than that in the uniform large particle sand. Increasing fines content 490 further suppress dilatancy, consequently results in a decrease of the maximum dilation angle as 491 shown in Fig. 10a. Although the lateral support provided by the small particles makes the columns 492 more difficult to buckle, at large strain, the columns are still buckled and concentrated within a shear 493 band, which exhibits a localised failure. 494

For the binary mixtures with a transitional fines content (i.e. f_c is around 30%), as illustrated 495 in Fig 13b, there could be fewer contacts between large-particles owing to being surrounded by 496 small-particles. On the other hand, small particles are not yet enough to form a matrix. As a result, 497 both large and small particle columns cannot be built up during the hardening process. At this f_c , the 498 dilatancy may mainly be caused by particle rearrangement and overriding each other during shearing 499 process. Hence, a smaller level of dilatancy is expected comparing to that induced by column 500 501 buckling. Since the dilatancy is caused by the overriding of particles, the level of dilatancy is proportional to the size of particles. Therefore, the smallest dilatancy was observed in Ratio-11.31 502 test with $f_c = 30\%$, compared with the other three ratios with this f_c (see Fig. 11a). Because there are 503 no buckling particle columns, shear band formation is not as visible during the softening process. 504 505 As a result, we observed that a diffuse-type failure is exhibited instead of a localised failure shown in Fig. 13b. 506

For small particle dominant binary mixtures (i.e. at high f_c), a matrix is formed by small particles and large particles are floated into it, as illustrated in Fig 13c. During the hardening process, the particle columns are formed by small particles. Large elongated voids causing dilatancy gradually grow between two buckling small particle columns. The number of small particle columns increases with increasing f_c . Therefore, the dilatancy also increases with increasing f_c . Similar to

- 512 large particle dominant binary mixtures, small particle dominant binary mixtures exhibit a localised
- 513 failure because buckling particle columns are eventually concentrated within a shear band.



514

Fig. 13. The mechanisms for dilatancy and failure of binary sand mixtures in: (a) low fines content region,
(b) transitional fines content region, and (c) high fines content region.

- As shown in Fig. 11a, the uniform sand with smaller particle size has a higher maximum dilation angle, which was consistent with the observations on glass beads and Peribonka sand reported by Harehdasht et al. (2017). Harehdasht et al. (2017) has attributed the increase of dilation angle to the particle size effect. In the silica sand used in this study, the particle roundness generally increases with particle size, thus the effect is caused by both factors of particle size and particle roundness.
- 524 At very high f_c , the packing structure for the binary sand mixture is nearly the same as that 525 of uniform fine-sand. Therefore, in this case, higher maximum dilation angle was observed for a 526 mixture with larger particle size ratio (i.e. smaller size particle is more angular in shape) (see Fig. 527 11a).

As discussed above, the mechanism for dilatancy in the transitional fines content region is different from that in the regions of low and high fines content. Dilatancy in the transitional fines content region is governed by particle rearrangement and overriding each other, while dilatancy in the regions of low and high fines content is governed by the buckling columns. Therefore, as shown in Fig. 11c, the values of *b*, implying the contribution of dilatancy to the peak strength, are clearly different between the transitional f_c region and the other f_c regions.

534

535 Conclusions

In this paper, the effects of fines content and particle size ratio on the drained shear behaviours were studied through a series of drained triaxial compression tests on dense binary silica sand mixtures with 4 different particle size ratios. The critical state and the strength-dilatancy behaviour were analyzed. The mechanism for the effects of fines content and particle size ratio on drained shear behaviour was illustrated. Based on this study the major conclusions can be drawn as follows.

542 543 (1) It was observed that when $f_c < f_{th}$, increasing f_c suppresses dilation, on the other hand, when $f_c > f_{th}$, increasing f_c promote dilation.

- 544 (2) It was observed that, for high f_c samples, increasing particle size ratio intensifies the post 545 peak softening of the stress-strain curves (i.e., brittle characteristic). For low f_c samples, 546 however, increasing particle size ratio has little influence on the degree of post peak 547 softening of the stress-strain curve.
- (3) Both fines content and particle size ratio have significant influence on critical state void
 ratio. It is interesting to note that the pattern of critical state void ratio is similar to that
 on minimum and maximum void ratios influenced by particle size ratio. The similar
 pattern might imply that fines content plays the same role in the reduction of void ratio
 of a binary mixture for these three density states.
- 553 (4) The value of ϕ_{cv} of a mixture is influenced by its fines content, which can be divided in 554 3 regions: (a) at low fines content region, the ϕ_{cv} values of binary mixtures are close to 555 the ϕ_{cv} of large particles; (b) at high fines content region, the ϕ_{cv} values of binary mixtures 556 are close to the ϕ_{cv} of fine particles; (c) in the transition region, the ϕ_{cv} values of binary 557 mixtures are transition from the ϕ_{cv} of the large particle sand to the ϕ_{cv} of the fine sand.

- 558 (5) A general trend for the effect of fines content on ψ_p is observed. ψ_p decreases with an 559 increase in fines content for $f_c < 30\%$. But, ψ_p increases with an increase in fines content 560 for $f_c > 30\%$. The smallest ψ_p occurred at the fines content of 30%. No obvious trend 561 was observed for the particle size ratio effect on ψ_p for $f_c < 30\%$. However, at $f_c = 30\%$, 562 there is a clear trend that ψ_p decreases with an increase in particle size ratio. The trend 563 evolves and becomes opposite when f_c is above 50%, in which, ψ_p increases with an 564 increase in particle size ratio.
- 565 (6) It was found that the parameter b in Bolton' stress-dilatancy relation has a little variation 566 in low and high fines content regions. In the transitional fines content region, however, 567 the parameter b is much greater than that in the other two regions and increase with 568 increasing particle size ratio.
- (7) The mechanism was proposed to illustrate the influences of fines content and particle 569 size ratio on the drained shear behaviour from the perspective of particle column 570 buckling. Dilatancy in the transitional region of fines content is governed by the 571 rearrangement of particle, which override each other. Whereas, dilatancy in the regions 572 573 of low or high fines content is governed by the buckling of particle columns. The influences of fines content and particle size ratio on dilatancy and value of b in the 574 575 Bolton's stress-dilatancy equation were explained by the proposed mechanism. The mechanism explained in this paper is only a conjecture, which cannot be verified by 576 577 triaxial tests alone. It needs to be further verified by other analysis such as DEM simulation. 578
- 579

580 Acknowledgement

581 This work was supported by the National Science Foundation of the United States under a research

582 grant (CMMI-1917238). The support is greatly acknowledged.

584 Appendix A: Examples to determine the critical state

585 A.1 For samples without visualized localisation at large strain

586 For a sample without visualized deformation localisation, we assume that localisation is 587 minute and the deformation is relatively uniform for the range of stress-strain curve between the 588 peak stress and the end of test, which can be used to assess the critical state.

The critical state was determined by an extrapolating method described herein. The sample with Ratio-4.67 at 30% f_c was taken as an example shown in Fig. A.1. The critical state friction angle was firstly estimated with a stress-dilatancy analysis as shown in Fig. A.1a. In this analysis, the Nova's stress-dilatancy relationship (Nova, 1982) was used to fit the stress-dilatancy data of post-peak stress,

594

$$\eta = M + (1 - N)D \tag{A.1}$$

where *M* is the stress ratio at critical state and *N* is a volumetric coupling coefficient. After the values of *M* and *N* were obtained from fitting the data, the critical state friction angle ϕ_{cv} was then obtained using the relationship $sin\phi_{cv} = 3M/(6+M)$ and listed in Table 3.



Fig. A.1. An example of extrapolating the data to determine the critical state for a sample without
 visualized localisation: (a) stress-dilatancy analysis, (b) extrapolated stress-strain curve, and (c)
 extrapolated volumetric strain curve.

For convenience, a cosine function was used to extrapolate the post-peak stress-strain curve.

604
$$\eta = \frac{\eta^{peak} + M}{2} + \frac{\eta^{peak} - M}{2} \cos\left(\frac{\varepsilon_q - \varepsilon_q^{peak}}{\varepsilon_q^{cs} - \varepsilon_q^{peak}} \cdot \pi\right); \ \varepsilon_q \in [\varepsilon_q^{peak}, \varepsilon_q^{cs}]$$
(A.2)

where the superscripts 'peak' and 'cs' denote for peak state and critical state, respectively. Fig. A.1b and Fig A.2a show that this cosine function is satisfactory to express the post-peak stress-strain curves. The deviator strain ε_q^{cs} , where the critical state occurs, was estimated by a regression analysis performed on the stress-strain data from the peak stress to the end of the test. The regression analysis minimizes the sum of squared errors *SS*,

610
$$SS(\varepsilon_q^{cs}) = \sum_i [\eta^i - \eta(\varepsilon_q^i, \varepsilon_q^{cs})]^2$$
(A.3)

611 where η^i and ε_q^i are the measured *i*th point on the stress-strain curve. Substituting Eq. (A.2) into Eq. 612 (A.1) and then integrating with respect to ε_q , the expression of volumetric strain ε_v as a function of 613 ε_q between peak state and critical state was obtained as follows

614
$$\varepsilon_{v} = \frac{M - \eta^{peak}}{2(1-N)} \cdot \left[\left(\varepsilon_{q} - \varepsilon_{q}^{peak} \right) + \frac{\varepsilon_{q}^{cs} - \varepsilon_{q}^{peak}}{\pi} \sin \left(\frac{\varepsilon_{q} - \varepsilon_{q}^{peak}}{\varepsilon_{q}^{cs} - \varepsilon_{q}^{peak}} \cdot \pi \right) \right] + \varepsilon_{v}^{peak}$$
(A.4)

As shown in Fig. A.1c and Fig A.2b, Eq. (A.4) matches the measured results well and can be used to extrapolate the curve of volumetric change response. Using this extrapolation method, the critical state void ratios for the samples without visualized deformation localisation were determined and listed in Table 3.

619

602



Fig. A.2. Examples of extrapolating the data to determine the critical state for four samples of binary
 mixtures without visualized localisation: (a) extrapolated stress-strain curve and (b) extrapolated volumetric
 strain curve.

620

A.2 For samples with visualized localisation at large strain

The sample deformation after the occurrence of localisation is not representative of a 626 uniformly deformed material thus cannot be used for extrapolation. Thus, for a sample with 627 visualized localisation, the critical state needs to be determined by using multiple test results 628 (Harehdasht et al., 2017; Nova, 1982). In this study, we use test results from three different confining 629 stresses (i.e., 100 kPa, 200 kPa, and 400 kPa). Assuming that the occurred localisation is minute at 630 peak stress state, the critical state stress ratio M was obtained by fitting the peak points of three 631 632 stress-dilatancy curves using Eq. (A.1) as shown in Fig. A.3a. After the stress-dilatancy relationship for each sample was obtained, the critical state friction angle ϕ_{cv} was then obtained using the 633 relationship $sin\phi_{cv} = 3M/(6+M)$ and listed in Table 3. 634

The initiation of localisation begins at peak stress state. The localisation becomes prominent after a point of maximum curvature, at which the stress strain curve deviates from the smooth curve. After this point, a greater softening commences. The minute localisation propagates into a visualized shear band with abrupt stress reduction (see Fig. A.3b). We assume that localisation is ineffective and the deformation is relatively uniform for the range of stress-strain curve between the peak stress and the point of maximum curvature. This portion of measured curve can be used to assess the critical state.

As discussed previously, the post-peak stress-strain curve without visualized localisation can 642 be expressed by a cosine function (Eq. A.2). Hence, this cosine function was also used to extrapolate 643 the stress-strain curve between the peak stress and the point of maximum curvature for the samples 644 with visualized deformation localisation. Using Eq. (A.2) with the determined M from three test 645 results, the critical state deviator strain ε_a^{cs} was estimated by a regression analysis performed on the 646 stress-strain data from the peak stress to the point of maximum curvature. The examples of the 647 extrapolating stress-strain curves are shown in Fig. A.3b. The expression of volumetric strain ε_{ν} as 648 a function of ε_a between peak state and critical state was obtained based on the established stress-649 dilatancy relationship and the estimated ε_a^{cs} . The examples of the extrapolating volumetric strain 650 curves are shown in Fig. A.3c. Using this extrapolation method, the critical state void ratios for the 651 samples with visualized localisation were determined and listed in Table 3. 652





Fig. A.3. Examples of extrapolating the data to critical state for the samples with deformation localisation:
(a) stress-dilatancy analysis, (b) extrapolated stress-strain curve, and (c) extrapolated volumetric strain
curve.

658 **References**

- ASTM D4253-00, 2006. Standard test methods for maximum index density and unit weight of soils using a
 vibratory table, in: Annual Book of ASTM Standards. ASTM International, West Conshohocken, PA,
 pp. 1–15. https://doi.org/10.1520/D4253-00R06.
- ASTM D4254-00, 2006. Standard Test Methods for Minimum Index Density and Unit Weight of Soils and
 Calculation of Relative Density, in: Annual Book of ASTM Standards. ASTM International, West
 Conshohocken, PA, pp. 1–9. https://doi.org/10.1520/D4254-00R06E01.1.3
- Azéma, E., Linero, S., Estrada, N., Lizcano, A., 2017. Shear strength and microstructure of polydisperse
 packings: The effect of size span and shape of particle size distribution. Phys. Rev. E 96, No. 2,
 022902. https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.96.022902
- Been, K., Jefferies, M., 2004. Stress-dilatancy in very loose sand. Can. Geotech. J. 41, 972–989.
 https://doi.org/10.1139/t04-038
- Bolton, M.D., 1986. The strength and dilatancy of sands. Géotechnique 36, No. 1, 65–78.
 https://doi.org/10.1680/geot.1986.36.1.65
- Bouckovalas, G.D., Andrianopoulos, K.I., Papadimitriou, A.G., 2003. A critical state interpretation for the
 cyclic liquefaction resistance of silty sands. Soil Dyn. Earthq. Eng. 23, No. 2, 115–125.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0267-7261(02)00156-2
- 675 Carraro, J.A.H., Prezzi, M., Salgado, R., 2009. Shear strength and stiffness of sands containing plastic or 676 nonplastic fines. J. Geotech. Geoenvironmental Eng. 135, no. 9, 1167–1178.
 677 https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)1090-0241(2009)135
- 678 Carrera, A., Coop, M., Lancellotta, R., 2011. Influence of grading on the mechanical behaviour of Stava
 679 tailings. Géotechnique 61, No. 11, 935–946. https://doi.org/10.1680/geot.9.P.009
- Chang, C.S., Deng, Y., 2020. Packing potential index for binary mixtures of granular soil. Powder Technol.
 372, 148–160. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.powtec.2020.06.005
- Chang, C.S., Meidani, M., 2013. Dominant grains network and behavior of sand-silt mixtures: stress-strain
 modeling. Int. J. Numer. Anal. Methods Geomech. 37, 2563–2589. https://doi.org/10.1002/nag.2152
- Chang, C.S., Yin, Z.Y., 2011. Micromechanical modeling for behavior of silty sand with influence of fine
 content. Int. J. Solids Struct. 48, No. 19, 2655–2667. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijsolstr.2011.05.014
- Chang, W., Phantachang, T., 2016. Effects of gravel content on shear resistance of gravelly soils. Eng.
 Geol. 207, May, 78–90. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enggeo.2016.04.015
- Dash, H.K., Sitharam, T.G., 2011. Undrained monotonic response of sand-silt mixtures: effect of
 nonplastic fines. Geomech. Geoengin. 6, No. 1, 47–58. https://doi.org/10.1080/17486021003706796
- 690 De Larrard, F., 1999. Concrete Mixture Proportioning: A scientific approach. E & FN SPON, London, UK.
- 691 Derkaoui, M., Missoum, H., Bendani, K., Belhouari, F., 2016. Shear Behavior of Sand–Silt Mixtures: A
 692 Laboratory Investigation of Coastal Silty Sand Soils of Mostaganem. Mar. Georesources Geotechnol.
 693 34, No. 7, 668–680. https://doi.org/10.1080/1064119X.2015.1070388
- Furnas, C.C., 1931. Grading aggregates I: Mathematical relations for beds of broken solids of maximum
 density. Ind. Eng. Chem. 23, No. 9, 1052–1058. https://doi.org/10.1021/ie50261a017
- Harehdasht, S.A., Karray, M., Hussien, M.N., Chekired, M., 2017. Influence of Particle Size and Gradation

- on the Stress-Dilatancy Behavior of Granular Materials during Drained Triaxial Compression. Int. J.
 Geomech. 17, No. 9, 04017077. https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)GM.1943-5622.0000951.
- Huang, Y.-T., Huang, A.-B., Kuo, Y.-C., Tsai, M.-D., 2004. A laboratory study on the undrained strength
 of a silty sand from Central Western Taiwan. Soil Dyn. Earthq. Eng. 24, No. 9, 733–743.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soildyn.2004.06.013
- Indraratna, B., Nimbalkar, S., Coop, M., Sloan, S.W., 2014. A constitutive model for coal-fouled ballast
 capturing the effects of particle degradation. Comput. Geotech. 61, 96–107.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compgeo.2014.05.003
- Iwashita, K., Oda, M., 2000. Micro-deformation mechanism of shear banding process based on modified
 distinct element method. Powder Technol. 109, 192–205.
- Jehring, M.M., Bareither, C.A., 2016. Tailings composition effects on shear strength behavior of co-mixed
 mine waste rock and tailings. Acta Geotech. 11, No. 5, 1147–1166. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11440 015-0429-1
- Kwa, K.A., Airey, D.W., 2016. Critical state interpretation of effects of fines in silty sands. Géotechnique
 Lett. 6, No. 1, 100–105. https://doi.org/10.1680/jgele.15.00176
- Kwan, A.K.H., Chan, K.W., Wong, V., 2013. A 3-parameter particle packing model incorporating the
 wedging effect. Powder Technol. 237, 172–179. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.powtec.2013.01.043
- Ladd, R.S., 1978. Preparing test specimens using undercompaction. Geotech. Test. J. 1, No. 1, 16–23.
- Li, X.S., Dafalias, Y.F., 2000. Dilatancy for cohesionless soils. Geotechnique 50, No. 4, 449–460.
 https://doi.org/10.1680/geot.2000.50.4.449
- 717 McGeary, R.K., 1961. Mechanical Packing of Spherical Particles. J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 44, No. 10, 513–522.
 718 https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1151-2916.1961.tb13716.x
- Murthy, T.G., Loukidis, D., Carraro, J.A.H., Prezzi, M., Salgado, R., 2007. Undrained monotonic response
 of clean and silty sands. Géotechnique 57, No. 7, 273–288.
 https://doi.org/10.1680/geot.2007.57.3.273
- Naeini, S.A., Baziar, M.H., 2004. Effect of fines content on steady-state strength of mixed and layered
 samples of a sand. Soil Dyn. Earthq. Eng. 24, No. 3, 181–187.
- Ni, Q., Tan, T.S., Dasari, G.R., Hight, D.W., 2004. Contribution of fines to the compressive strength of
 mixed soils. Geotechnique 54, No. 9, 561–569.
- Nova, R., 1982. A constitutive model under monotonic and cyclic loading, in: Pande, G., Zienkiewicz, O.C.
 (Eds.), Soil Mechanics Transient and Cyclic Loads. John Wiley & Sons Ltd., New York, USA, pp. 343–373.
- Papadopoulou, A., Tika, T., 2008. The effect of fines on critical state and liquefaction resistance
 characteristics of non-plastic silty sands. Soils Found. 48, No. 5, 713–725.
 https://doi.org/10.3208/sandf.47.887
- Patil, U.D., Hoyos, L.R., Puppala, A.J., Bheemasetti, T.V., 2018. Modeling Stress Dilatancy Behavior of
 Compacted Silty Sand Under Suction-Controlled Axisymmetric Shearing. Geotech. Geol. Eng. 36,
 No. 6, 3961–3977. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10706-018-0647-z
- Polito, C.P., Sibley, E.L.D., 2020. Threshold fines content and behavior of sands with nonplastic silts. Can.
 Geotech. J. 57, No. 3, 462–465. https://doi.org/10.1139/cgj-2018-0698

- Rahman, M.M., Lo, S.-C.R., Dafalias, Y.F., 2014. Modelling the static liquefaction of sand with low plasticity fines. Ge'otechnique 64, No. 11, 881–894. https://doi.org/10.1680/geot.14.P.079
- Roscoe, K.H., Schofield, A.N., Wroth, C.P., 1958. On the yielding of soils. Geotechnique 1, 22–53.
- Salgado, R., Bandini, P., Karim, A., 2000. Shear Strength and Stiffness of Silty Sand. J. Geotech.
 Geoenvironmental Eng. 126, No. 5, 451–462. https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)10900241(2000)126:5(451)
- Shire, T., O'Sullivan, C., Hanley, K.J., Fannin, R.J., 2014. Fabric and effective stress distribution in internally unstable soils. Journalof Geotech. Geoenvironmental Eng. 140, No. 2, 04014072.
 https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)GT.1943-5606.0001184
- Thevanayagam, S., Shenthan, T., Mohan, S., Liang, J., 2002. Undrained fragility of clean sands, silty sands,
 and sandy silts. J. Geotech. Geoenvironmental Eng. 128, No. 10, 849–859.
 https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)1090-0241(2002)128:10(849)
- Ueda, T., Matsushima, T., Yamada, Y., 2011. Effect of particle size ratio and volume fraction on shear
 strength of binary granular mixture. Granul. Matter 13, No. 3, 731–742.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10035-011-0292-1
- Vallejo, L.E., 2001. Interpretation of the limits in shear strength in binary granular mixtures. Can. Geotech.
 J. 38, No. 5, 1097–1104. https://doi.org/10.1139/t01-029
- Vermeer, P.A., de Borst, R., 1984. Non-associated plasticity for soils, concrete and rock. HERON 29, No.
 3, 1–64.
- 756 Wadell, H., 1935. Volume, Shape, and Roundness of Quartz Particles. J. Geol. 43, No. 3, 250–280.
- Wei, X., Yang, J., 2019. Characterizing the effects of fines on the liquefaction resistance of silty sands.
 Soils Found. 59, No. 6, 1800–1812. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sandf.2019.08.010
- Westman, A.E.R., Hugill, H.R., 1930. The packing of particles. J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 13, No. 10, 767–779.
 https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1151-2916.1930.tb16222.x
- Xiao, Y., Desai, C., 2016. General Stress Dilatancy Relation for Granular Soils. J. Geotech.
 Geoenvironmental Eng. 142, No. 4, 2816001. https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)GT.1943-5606.0001473
- Xiao, Y., Liu, H., Ding, X., Chen, Y., Jiang, J., Wengang Zhang, 2016. Influence of Particle Breakage on Critical State Line of Rockfill Material. Int. J. Geomech. 16, No. 1, 04015031.
 https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)GM.1943-5622.0000538
- Xiao, Y., Xiang, J., Liu, H., Ma, Q., 2017. Strength-dilatancy relation of sand containing non-plastic fines.
 Géotechnique Lett. 7, No. 2, 204–210. https://doi.org/10.1680/jgele.16.00144
- Yan, W., Dong, J., 2011. Effect of particle grading on the response of an idealized granular assemblage.
 Int. J. Geomech. ASCE 11, No. 4, 276–285. https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)GM.1943-5622.0000085.
- Yang, S., Lacasse, S., Sandven, R., 2006. Determination of the transitional fines content of mixtures of
 sand and non-plastic fines. Geotech. Test. J. 29, No. 2, 1–6. https://doi.org/10.1520/GTJ14010
- Yang, S.L., 2004. Characterization of the properties of sand-silt mixtures. Norwegian University of Science
 and Technology, Trondheim, Norway.

Yilmaz, Y., 2009. A study on the limit void ratio characteristics of medium to fine mixed graded sands. Eng. Geol. 104, No. 3-4, 290–294. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enggeo.2008.11.009

- Yin, Z.Y., Zhao, J., Hicher, P.Y., 2014. A micromechanics-based model for sand-silt mixtures. Int. J.
 Solids Struct. 51, No. 6, 1350–1363. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijsolstr.2013.12.027
- Zhou, W., Xu, K., Ma, G., Yang, L., Chang, X., 2016. Effects of particle size ratio on the macro- and
 microscopic behaviors of binary mixtures at the maximum packing efficiency state. Granul. Matter
 18, 1–13. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10035-016-0678-1
- Zhu, Y., Nie, Z., Gong, J., Zou, J., Zhao, L., Li, L., 2020. An analysis of the effects of the size ratio and fines content on the shear behaviors of binary mixtures using DEM. Comput. Geotech. 118, No. 4, 103353. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compgeo.2019.103353
- Zlatovic, S., Ishihara, K., 1995. On the influence of nonplastic fines on residual strength, in: Ishihara, K.
 (Ed.), Earthquake Geotechnical Engineering. Balkema, Rotterdam, pp. 239–244.
- Zuo, L., Baudet, B.A., 2015. Determination of the transitional fines content of sand-non plastic fines
 mixtures. Soils Found. 55, No. 1, 213–219. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sandf.2014.12.017

789 Caption of Figures

- **Fig. 1.** Micrographs of uniform silica sands of five different particle sizes.
- **Fig. 2.** The grain size distributions of binary mixtures with four different particle size ratios: (a)
- 792 Ratio-2.56, (b) Ratio- 4.67, (c) Ratio-7.93, and (d) Ratio-11.31
- **Fig. 3.** The initial void ratios e_0 of all samples.
- **Fig. 4.** Experimental results of the drained triaxial compression tests on binary mixtures of various
- fines contents and particle size ratios.
- **Fig. 5.** The stress-dilatancy plots for binary mixtures of various fines contents and particle size ratios.
- **Fig. 6.** The minimum void ratios of binary granular mixtures with various particle size ratios: (a)
- steel shots and (b) glass beads.
- Fig. 7. The critical state void ratios of five different types of sand-silt mixtures with various finescontents.
- Fig. 8. The effects of fines content and particle size ratio on (a) critical state void ratio, (b) minimum
 void ratio, and (c) maximum void ratio.
- Fig. 9. (a) The definition of packing potential index and (b) packing potential indices for the voidratios of a system of mixtures at three density states.
- Fig. 10. The influence of fines content on critical state friction angles of binary mixtures with fourdifferent particle size ratios.
- **Fig. 11.** The influence of fines content on: (a) the maximum dilation angle ψ_p , (b) the peak friction
- angle ϕ_p , and (c) the dilatancy parameter *b* in Bolton's stress-dilatancy relation, for binary mixtures
- 809 with four different particle size ratios.
- Fig. 12. A schematic diagram illustrating the mechanism for dilatancy: (a) buildup of particlecolumns and (b) buckling particle columns.
- Fig. 13. The mechanisms for dilatancy and failure of binary sand mixtures in: (a) low fines content
- region, (b) transitional fines content region, and (c) high fines content region.
- Fig. A.1. An example of extrapolating the data to determine the critical state for a sample without
- 815 visualized localisation: (a) stress-dilatancy analysis, (b) extrapolated stress-strain curve, and (c)
- 816 extrapolated volumetric strain curve.

- **Fig. A.2.** Examples of extrapolating the data to determine the critical state for four samples of binary
- mixtures without visualized localisation: (a) extrapolated stress-strain curve and (b) extrapolated
 volumetric strain curve.
- **Fig. A.3.** Examples of extrapolating the data to critical state for the samples with deformation
- 821 localisation: (a) stress-dilatancy analysis, (b) extrapolated stress-strain curve, and (c) extrapolated
- 822 volumetric strain curve.

823 Caption of Tables

- **Table 1** Properties of the uniform silica sands of five different particle sizes.
- **Table 2** List of index properties of tested binary mixtures.
- **Table 3** Summary results of drained triaxial compression tests on the specimens of binary silica
- sand mixtures of various fines contents for four different particle size ratios.
- **Table 4** The transitional fines contents f_{th} for different soil behaviours with different particle size
- 829 ratios.