# Controls on $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Mineralization Using Natural and Industrial Alkaline Solids under Ambient Conditions 

Erika Callagon La Plante,* Iman Mehdipour, Ian Shortt, Kai Yang, Dante Simonetti, Mathieu Bauchy, and Gaurav N. Sant*



Cite This: ACS Sustainable Chem. Eng. 2021, 9, 10727-10739


Read Online
ACCESS | 崰 Article Recommendations


#### Abstract

The extent to which carbon dioxide $\left(\mathrm{CO}_{2}\right)$ mineralization ("carbonation") using alkaline solids can reduce atmospheric $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations is dictated by the rate of divalent alkaline metal release from such solids. These solids have distinct reactivities, that is, bulk dissolution rates, which dictate their rates of carbonation. To assess the feasibility of utilizing alkaline solids to mitigate $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions at scale, assessments of practical carbonation potentials under ambient conditions, which are often distinct from their stoichiometric carbonation potential  as described by their bulk chemical composition, are needed. Therefore, the carbonation (or " $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization") potentials of 16 naturally occurring (mafic and ultramafic) rocks and industrial alkaline solids (fly ashes and slags) were quantified. In general, the extent of carbonation for the pulverized and as-received solids which is achievable under ambient conditions [ $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}, 1 \mathrm{bar}$ ]-in the presence of excess $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ and water-that is, the carbonation potential, is correlated with the CaO and MgO content and varies inversely with the $\mathrm{SiO}_{2}$ content. Particularly, the carbonation efficiency (i.e., the ratio of the measured to the stoichiometric carbonation potential) is controlled by the atomic topology (network connectivity) of the solid reactantsuggesting that network rupture is the rate-controlling step of dissolution and, hence, carbonation. Based on our data, we offer estimates of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ removal that can be achieved under ambient exposure conditions to assess the controls and capacity of ambient $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization as a carbon dioxide removal strategy.


KEYWORDS: alkaline solids, mineral carbonation, silicate dissolution, $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mitigation, reactivity

## INTRODUCTION

The in situ and ex situ mineralization of carbon dioxide $\left(\mathrm{CO}_{2}\right)$ ("carbonation") to form sparingly soluble carbonates has been suggested as an approach to mitigate climate change. ${ }^{1,2}$ This approach consumes atmospheric or flue gas-borne $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ by immobilizing it via a classical acid-base reaction ("mineralization") within calcium and magnesium carbonates [e.g., calcite $\left(\mathrm{CaCO}_{3}\right)$, magnesite $\left(\mathrm{MgCO}_{3}\right)$, and variants thereof]. ${ }^{3-5}$ Expectedly, herein, $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (acid) is reacted with an alkaline solid (base). Because $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization (carbonation) is a dissolution-precipitation promoted reaction, it requires an aqueous environment or a humid atmosphere. ${ }^{6}$ The availability of water into which gas-phase $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ and the alkaline solid dissolve, remarkably affects carbonation reaction rates. ${ }^{7}$ The alkaline solid provides metal cations, for example, $\mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$ and $\mathrm{Mg}^{2+}$ (and occasionally $\mathrm{Fe}^{2+}$ ) that react with bicarbonate $\left(\mathrm{HCO}_{3}{ }^{-}\right)$or carbonate $\left(\mathrm{CO}_{3}{ }^{2-}\right)$ anions that speciate from the dissolved $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ to form carbonate minerals. The net reaction is thermodynamically favorable ${ }^{8}$ and produces stable products as evident from the abundance and persistence of large-scale carbonate deposits in nature.

Carbonate mineral formation by in situ mineralization in basaltic formations injected with $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$-saturated water has been suggested to occur within 2 years. ${ }^{9}$ This rate is consistent with experimental data and reactive transport modeling, which
indicate an induction time for calcite precipitation at depth on the order of 1.5 years. ${ }^{10}$ However, on the Earth's surface, the conversion of silicates to carbonates ("weathering") typically requires geological time scales. As a synthetic ("engineering") intervention, ex situ carbonation relies overwhelmingly on accelerating silicate dissolution-carbonate precipitation reactions with the following: (i) using $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$-rich streams (e.g., flue gas from power plants), (ii) imposing high pressures and temperatures wherein the dissolution of silicates, both natural (e.g., mafic and ultramafic igneous rocks) and those derived from industrial processes (e.g., coal combustion ash, metal processing slag, cement kiln dust, etc.), is enhanced, and (iii) using finely divided solids that present large surface areas. ${ }^{11-18}$ In these cases, carbonation is accomplished in a direct process in which $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ is reacted with an alkaline solid to form carbonate minerals ${ }^{19,20}$ or by a sequential process which involves alkaline solid dissolution, followed by carbonate precipitation. ${ }^{21,22}$ In

[^0]
each case, the extent of achievable carbonation is limited by the amount of extractable divalent metal cations.

Practically, the viability of ex situ $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization to serve as a carbon management solution requires the fulfillment of rapid carbonation reaction rates. To enhance carbonation rates, because natural alkaline solids are inherently (far) less reactive than their industrial-waste counterparts, carbonation often requires high processing temperatures ( $T>100^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) and $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ partial pressures ( $>40 \mathrm{~atm}$ ) and/or the use of finely divided solids that present large surface areas. ${ }^{23,24}$ The imposition of such conditions enhances Ca and Mg release, but resulting in a consequential energy cost. Often however, estimates of carbonation potentials are based on the mass abundance of the solids and their bulk chemical composition. For instance, basaltic lava flows, peridotites, and mid-ocean ridge basalts represent a $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake potential of up to $60,000,000 \mathrm{Gt} \mathrm{CO} 2,10,000-100,000,000 \mathrm{Gt} \mathrm{CO} 2$, and $100,000-250,000 \mathrm{Gt} \mathrm{CO}_{2},{ }^{25-27}$ respectively, whereas industrial alkaline wastes present a carbon uptake potential of $100-$ 1250 Mt CO 2 per year globally. ${ }^{2,8}$ However, such estimates are sensitive to assumptions of carbonation efficiency, that is, the extent of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake that is achieved relative to the stoichiometric uptake capacity. ${ }^{28-32}$ For example, carbonation efficiencies ranging from $<10$ to $>90 \%$ have been reported for alkaline wastes. ${ }^{4,6,32,33}$ Efficiencies for rocks are much lower, ${ }^{34}$ for example, on the order of $<1 \%$ at ambient conditions at short time scales although a reactive silicate such as olivine ( $\left.(\mathrm{Mg}, \mathrm{Fe})_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}\right)$ features a reaction efficiency of $\sim 50 \%$ after 1 year at room temperature. ${ }^{35}$ In mafic and ultramafic mine tailings, brucite $\left(\mathrm{Mg}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}\right)$ is the primary phase that carbonates at ambient conditions over short reaction times. ${ }^{17,36,37}$

Clearly, the carbonation potential (or efficiency) is significantly affected by the process conditions, for example, solution pH , temperature, $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ partial pressure, reaction duration, and so forth. ${ }^{38}$ However, there have been few direct comparisons of carbonation potentials of different solids spanning both natural and synthetic compositions by a consistent method, with an abundance of primary reactants $\left(\mathrm{CO}_{2}\right.$, water) and a specific emphasis on revealing solute controls on $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization. ${ }^{2}$ Also, polyphasic rocks, fly ash, and slags are heterogeneous solids consisting of multiple phases that present distinct reactivities, which may be uniquely influenced by each process variable. ${ }^{28}$ Therefore, herein, the carbonation potentials of 16 natural and industrial alkaline silicates are quantified at near-ambient temperature and pressure conditions in a consistent way. We clarify the chemical and mineralogical linkages between silicate reactivity, dissolution kinetics, and carbonation potentials through batch experiments wherein dissolution and precipitation occur simultaneously. Based on such data, we present estimates of the carbonation potential of alkaline solids to determine the extent to which $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization of alkaline feedstocks could serve as a negative emissions technology to address the ongoing carbon crisis.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

Sample Preparation and Characterization. The alkaline solids examined included calcium hydroxide or hydrated lime $\left(\mathrm{Ca}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}\right)$ : a reference solid, coal combustion fly ash, crystalline slags from iron and steel production (amorphous slags are not considered due to their desirability as a cement replacement material), ${ }^{39-41}$ and natural Caand Mg-rich rocks and minerals. Five different types of fly ash,
including Class C (CaO-rich), Class F (CaO-poor), trona $\left(\mathrm{Na}_{3}\left(\mathrm{CO}_{3}\right)\left(\mathrm{HCO}_{3}\right) \cdot 2 \mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}\right)$-rich, and reclaimed Ca-rich fly ash were supplied by Boral Resources LLC. Five crystalline slags, electric arc furnace (EAF), basic oxygen furnace (BOF), air-cooled blast furnace (ac-BF), stainless steel (SS), and ladle slag (LS), were supplied by TMS International. The natural rock and mineral samples including flood basalt, serpentinite, peridotite, anorthosite, and olivine (forsterite: $\mathrm{Mg}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ ) were sourced from Ward's Science.

The bulk chemical compositions of the samples in mass \% of the simple oxides are shown in Figure 1. The mineralogical assemblage in


Figure 1. Chemical composition of the alkaline solids shown in terms of their simple oxide constituents (in mass \%).
a subset of the solids was evaluated using X-ray diffraction (XRD). The major phases revealed by powder XRD carried out on finely divided homogenized powders are antigorite $\left(\left(\mathrm{Mg}, \mathrm{Fe}_{3}\right)_{3} \mathrm{Si}_{2} \mathrm{O}_{5}(\mathrm{OH})_{4}\right)$, magnesite $\left(\mathrm{MgCO}_{3}\right)$, bytownite $\left(\left(\mathrm{Ca}_{0.7-0.9}, \mathrm{Na}_{0.3-0.1}\right) \mathrm{Al}\left(\mathrm{Al}_{3} \mathrm{Si}^{2}\right) \mathrm{Si}_{2} \mathrm{O}_{8}\right)$, forsterite, periclase $(\mathrm{MgO})$, and magnetite $\left(\mathrm{Fe}_{3} \mathrm{O}_{4}\right)$ in the rocks, and larnite $\left(\beta-\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}\right.$ and $\left.\gamma-\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}\right)$, brownmillerite $\left(\mathrm{Ca}_{2}(\mathrm{Al}, \mathrm{Fe})_{2} \mathrm{O}_{5}\right)$, magnetite, wüstite ( FeO ), kirschsteinite $\left(\mathrm{CaFeSiO}_{4}\right)$, melilite $\left((\mathrm{Ca}, \mathrm{Na})_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{7}\right)$, cuspidine $\left(\mathrm{Ca}_{4} \mathrm{Si}_{2} \mathrm{O}_{7}(\mathrm{~F}, \mathrm{OH})_{2}\right)$, brucite $\left(\mathrm{Mg}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}\right)$, bredigite $\left(\mathrm{Ca}_{7} \mathrm{MgSi}_{4} \mathrm{O}_{16}\right)$, and calcite in the slags.

In general, the air-dried slags and rock samples were ground using a ball mill for 40 min , and a particle size fraction between 38 and $53 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ (corresponding to a grinding energy of $\sim 40 \mathrm{kWh}$ per ton using the Bond Work Index equation) was obtained via sieving. In the case of fly ash and hydrated lime, they were both used as received, wherein they present a median particle diameter, $d_{50}$, of $\sim 2-5 \mu \mathrm{~m}$. The particle size distributions of all solids were measured using a LS13-320 Beckman Coulter static light scattering analyzer on powder samples suspended in isopropanol following ultrasonication. Class C (high-Ca fly ash) was noted to have a $d_{50} \sim 1.5 \mu \mathrm{~m}$, that is, smaller than the other fly ash samples, as observed elsewhere. ${ }^{42}$

Assessing Carbonation Kinetics Using ICP-OES and TGA. The solid particulates were suspended in excess ultrapure deionized (DI) water ( $>18 \mathrm{M} \Omega \cdot \mathrm{cm}$ ) that was continuously bubbled with $100 \%$ $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ at an atmospheric pressure at $60{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. A double-walled borosilicate reactor (Wilmad-LabGlass)—that was used to contain the suspensions-was connected to a water bath for thermal regulation within $\pm 0.1^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. The suspensions were stirred using either a magnetic stir bar or an impeller-type mixer while ensuring matching of the Reynolds number (Re, unitless) in solution. Both pH and temperature were monitored as a function of time. After 24 and 72 h of aqueous carbonation, the reacted solids including any secondary precipitates were separated by vacuum filtration using a Buchner funnel lined with filter paper $(3-5 \mu \mathrm{~m})$. Thereafter, the filtrate was dried in an oven at $75{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and then homogenized prior to taking a small sample for thermogravimetric analysis (TGA).

The extent of carbonation was measured using a Perkin Elmer STA6000, which quantified the temperature-dependent mass change of the residual solids (filtrate) as they were heated from 35 to $975{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. Around 30 mg of the filtrate was placed in pure aluminum oxide crucibles and heated under an ultra-high purity $\mathrm{N}_{2}$ gas purge at a flow rate of $20 \mathrm{~mL} / \mathrm{min}$ and a heating rate of $10^{\circ} \mathrm{C} / \mathrm{min}$. The total
carbonate content was quantified by considering the mass loss over the temperature range of $500-900{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, corresponding to the decomposition of calcium and magnesium carbonates and subtracting the carbonate content of the initial unreacted ("pristine") solid. For slags which have two distinct decomposition peaks, the peak at $500-650$ ${ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ is assigned to magnesium carbonates and amorphous calcium carbonate (ACC) and that at $650-900{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ to crystalline calcium carbonate. ${ }^{4-45}$ Based on previous measurements, the estimated uncertainty in the $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake is approximately $5 \%$.

Characterization of Carbonated Products. A selection of samples was further characterized using XRD (Siemens D500) and a field emission-scanning electron microscope (SEM) (Hitachi S4800). Particularly, non-carbonated and carbonated slag particulates were dried in air at $\sim 45^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ prior to analysis. The samples were placed in a lucite holder for XRD measurements using $\mathrm{Cu} \mathrm{K} \alpha$ radiation ( $\lambda=$ $1.5406 \AA$ ) for a scattering angle range of $5-70^{\circ}$ with a $0.02^{\circ}$ step size. For SEM analyses, a small amount of the powdered sample was affixed onto a piece of carbon tape and then coated with Au. An accelerating voltage of 10.0 kV and a beam current of $10 \mu \mathrm{~A}$ were used for a working distance of 7.6 mm .

Dissolution Rate. 1 g of slag was reacted with 100 mL of solution in "batch mode" to produce a solid to liquid ( $\mathrm{S} / \mathrm{L}$ ) mass ratio of $1: 100$. The reaction solutions used were prepared by adding analytical reagent-grade chemicals, as needed, to ultrapure DI water. The experiments were conducted at $25 \pm 0.2,45 \pm 0.2$, and $90 \pm 3^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ using temperature-controlled environmental chambers and under static conditions or at ambient temperature ( $\sim 23^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) under stirred conditions using a magnetic stir bar. After $0,1,3,6,24,72$, and 168 h of reaction, the reacted solution was sampled ( $\sim 3 \mathrm{~mL}$ ) for analysis of total dissolved $\mathrm{Ca}, \mathrm{Mg}, \mathrm{Si}, \mathrm{Fe}, \mathrm{Al}, \mathrm{Mn}$, and Na concentrations. The samples were filtered immediately using a syringe through $0.20 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ nylon filters prior to acidification and dilution by a factor of 10 in 5 $\mathrm{vol} \% \mathrm{HNO}_{3}(70 \%)$. Analysis of elemental concentrations was carried out using a Perkin Elmer Avio 200 inductively coupled plasma-optical emission spectrometer using calibration standards prepared from concentrated ( 1000 ppm ) standards from Inorganic Ventures. In general, replicate experiments carried out using DI water at $90^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ indicate an uncertainty (i.e., relative standard deviation) of $3 \%$ in typical Ca-concentrations.

Network Topology Analysis. To decode the relationship between atomic structure, mineral dissolution, and subsequently carbonation kinetics, the atomic connectivity of the solids was assessed using the topological constraint theory (TCT). ${ }^{46-48}$ TCT reduces atomic networks into truss architectures wherein some nodes (the atoms) are interconnected via constraints (the chemical bonds). Atomic networks comprise both radial bond-stretching (BS) and angular bond-bending (BB) constraints, which maintain the interatomic distances and angles fixed around their average values. Atomic networks are described as flexible, stressed-rigid, or isostatic if the total number of constraints per atom $\left(n_{c}\right)$ is lower than, larger than, or equal to the number of degrees of freedom per atom (i.e., 3). For each solid, the number of constraints per atom is calculated as follows. First, for crystalline phases, the number of constraints created by each element is estimated from their crystallographic structure, that is, based on the coordination number of each element. Fly ash and slags (except ac-BF) represent a significant fraction of poorly ordered solids and, here, for simplicity, are assumed to be fully glassy. For such disordered systems, we first calculate the number of bridging oxygen (BO) and non-bridging oxygen (NBO) atoms acting in their atomic networks-wherein BO and NBO atoms are connected to 1 and 2 network-forming atoms ( $\mathrm{Si}, \mathrm{Al}$, or Fe ), respectively. This is achieved as follows. Starting from pure $\mathrm{SiO}_{2}$ (where all O atoms are BO), each alkaline-earth network ( Ca or Mg ) consumes 2 BOs whereas each Al or Fe atom creates 1 BO -for reasons of local chargecompensation. ${ }^{49}$ As a conservative assumption, it is assumed that no free oxygen (connected to only network-modifying elements) or tricluster oxygen (connected to three network formers) exists in these solids. The number of NBOs is then calculated as the number of O atoms that are not BO. The number of constraints created by each element is then calculated based on their average coordination
number. In detail, each $\mathrm{Si}, \mathrm{Al}$, and Fe atom creates four BS constraints (with their four oxygen neighbors) and five BB constraints (which is the minimum number of independent angular constraints that are needed to fix the tetrahedral environment of the network-forming elements). ${ }^{48}$ Based on previous studies, alkaline-earth atoms ( Ca and Mg ) form two BS constraints with their nearest NBO neighbors. ${ }^{50,51}$ However, due to the ionic, non-directional nature of the bond they form, alkaline-earth atoms do not create any BB constraints. For simplicity, all BS constraints are fully attributed to the cations-since each BS constraint is necessarily shared by a cation and an oxygen atom. Finally, each BO atom creates one BB constraint to fix the angle it forms with its two network-forming neighbors. The analytical calculation of the number of constraints per atom ( $n_{c}$ ) in $(\mathrm{CaO})_{a}\left(\mathrm{Al}_{2} \mathrm{O}_{3}\right)_{b}\left(\mathrm{SiO}_{2}\right)_{c}(\mathrm{MgO})_{d}\left(\mathrm{Fe}_{2} \mathrm{O}_{3}\right)_{e}$ systems (where letter subscripts indicate the mole fraction of the respective oxide) can be summarized as follows. In the constraints enumeration, we distinguish disordered (slags and fly ash) from crystalline (rocks) systems. In disordered systems, $n_{c}$ depends on whether or not there exist NBO atoms in the network. If there exist NBOs in the system (if $-a+b-d$ $+e \leq 0), n_{c}$ can be expressed as

$$
n_{\mathrm{c}}=\frac{a+23 b+11 c+d+23 e}{2 a+5 b+3 c+2 d+5 e}
$$

Otherwise, if all oxygen atoms act as BO atoms, $n_{\mathrm{c}}$ is given by

$$
n_{\mathrm{c}}=\frac{3 a+21 b+11 c+3 d+21 e}{2 a+5 b+3 c+2 d+5 e}
$$

On the other hand, for crystalline systems featuring NBO atoms (i.e., if $-a+b-d+e \leq 0$ ), $n_{c}$ can be expressed as follows:

$$
n_{\mathrm{c}}=\frac{5 a+23 b+11 c+5 d+23 e}{2 a+5 b+3 c+2 d+5 e}
$$

Otherwise, for crystalline systems that do not present NBO atoms, $n_{c}$ is given by

$$
n_{\mathrm{c}}=\frac{7 a+21 b+11 c+7 d+21 e}{2 a+5 b+3 c+2 d+5 e}
$$

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

How Should Carbonation Potential Be Assessed? $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization using silicate solids is a multi-step process involving the following: (i) the dissolution of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ in water and its speciation to $\mathrm{HCO}_{3}{ }^{-}$and $\mathrm{CO}_{3}{ }^{2-}$ ions, (ii) the dissolution of the silicate solute that yields dissolved $\mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$ and $\mathrm{Mg}^{2+}$ in solution, and (iii) the nucleation and growth of insoluble metal carbonates (e.g., $\mathrm{CaCO}_{3}, \mathrm{MgCO}_{3}$, and their hydroxy-variants) as the solution exceeds a critical supersaturation with respect to these phases. The thermodynamic driving force for precipitation is given by the saturation ratio, $\Omega=\mathrm{IAP} / K_{\text {sp }}$, where IAP is the ion activity product and $K_{\text {sp }}$ is the solubility product. For calcite, these are the products of the activities of $\mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$ and $\mathrm{CO}_{3}{ }^{2-}$ in solution and at equilibrium for a given thermodynamic temperature. The saturation index (SI) is the logarithm $\left(\log _{10}\right)$ of $\Omega$.

The Gibbs free energy difference is a function of the saturation ratio according to $\Delta G=R T \ln \Omega$, where $R$ is the gas constant and $T$ is the (isothermal) reaction temperature. Thus, the thermodynamic driving force for precipitation increases with an increasing extent of silicate dissolution, which releases metal cations (i.e., $\mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$ and $\mathrm{Mg}^{2+}$ ) into the solution while increasing the solution pH and the carbonate ion activity. As such, in systems involving relatively unreactive Ca - and Mg silicates (e.g., the dissolution rate of olivine shows values of around $10^{-10} \mathrm{~mol} / \mathrm{m}^{2} / \mathrm{s}$ at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ), ${ }^{52}$ at near-neutral pH , the dissolution of the solid is most often the reaction-limiting step ${ }^{19,27,38}$ since both the dissolution of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ and carbonate

(a)

(b)

Figure 2. Illustrative geochemical simulations of the dissolution of dicalcium silicate (larnite: $\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ ) -an exemplar silicate-showing: (a) concentrations of dissolved $\mathrm{Ca}, \mathrm{Si}$, and C and solid calcite $\left(\mathrm{CaCO}_{3}\right)$ and (b) saturation indices with respect to calcite and $\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ and pH as a function of dissolved $\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ in an ideal system wherein $\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ dissolves in $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$-saturated water. The red curves in ( $\mathrm{a}, \mathrm{b}$ ) indicate the evolution of [ Si ] and SI with respect to $\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ assuming (solid red) supersaturation or (dashed red) equilibrium with respect to amorphous silica. Expectedly, an analogous system composed of forsterite $\left(\mathrm{Mg}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}\right)$ instead of $\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ results in the thermodynamic stability of magnesite $\left(\mathrm{MgCO}_{3}\right)$ instead of calcite. Here, dissolution-carbonation reactions occurred at ambient ("atmospheric") pressure, and $T=60^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ in excess water in equilibrium with pure $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$, that is, $\mathrm{pH} \sim 4$.
mineral precipitation are relatively far more rapid. ${ }^{53}$ Specifically, aqueous equilibrium with respect to $\mathrm{CO}_{2(\mathrm{~g})}$ and $\mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$ is reached in $5.0 \times 10^{-11}$ and $10^{3} \mathrm{~s}$, respectively.

With these considerations in mind, carbonation potentials were assessed in aqueous suspensions of the alkaline solid that were continuously bubbled with a gas stream of $\sim 100 \% \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ at ambient pressure. For reference, point sources of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ including natural gas- and coal-fired power plants, iron and steel mills, cement plants, and chemical plants feature concentrations ranging from 3 to $>90 \mathrm{vol} \% .{ }^{54}$ The approach that we chose to apply seeks to induce carbonate precipitation by ongoing (simultaneous) dissolution-precipitation reactions wherein dissolution is promoted via the acidification induced by $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ dissolution in water ( $\mathrm{pH} \sim 4.0$ at $60{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ). ${ }^{23}$ For example, the slightly acidic conditions greatly promote the release of Mg from silicates, which dissolve appreciably only at low $\mathrm{pH} .{ }^{55,56}$ Furthermore, the influences of relative humidity are eliminated, ${ }^{7}$ allowing for evaluation of the effects of the intrinsic reactivity of the solid on carbonation kinetics. A slightly super-ambient temperature of $60^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ promotes the rate and extent of carbonation and seeks to model the exhaust (stack) temperature of many flue gas streams ${ }^{57}$ and of formation waters during carbonation by geological $\mathrm{CO}_{2} .{ }^{9,58}$

As an example of this method of assessing the carbonation potential, Figure 2 shows the dissolution and carbonation of $\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ using equilibrium calculations. Because carbonation is rapid relative to dissolution, equilibrium calculations provide insights into the effects of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentration and liquid-phase Ca-concentrations on carbonate yield. The idealized conversion of $\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ (and analogously $\mathrm{Mg}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ ), common phases in slags and rocks, to $\mathrm{CaCO}_{3}$ (and $\mathrm{MgCO}_{3}$ ) is shown in Figure 2. Under these conditions, the evolution of [Ca], pH, and calcite yield were calculated using PHREEQC ${ }^{59}$ with the minteq.v4 database. In general, a solution that is in equilibrium with $100 \% \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ at 1 atm will feature a total inorganic carbon concentration (i.e., $\left[\mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{CO}_{3}{ }^{*}\right]+\left[\mathrm{HCO}_{3}{ }^{-}\right]+\left[\mathrm{CO}_{3}{ }^{2-}\right]$ ) that is dependent on pH , i.e., at a higher pH , the solution can host higher concentrations of carbon because its speciation to $\mathrm{HCO}_{3}{ }^{-}$and $\mathrm{CO}_{3}{ }^{2-}$ lowers the concentration of $\mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{CO}_{3}{ }^{*}$, allowing for additional dissolution of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$. Herein, a decrease in the Si concentration (see dashed red curves in Figure 2a,b) results from the precipitation of amorphous silica. It is notable
that upon the initiation of calcite precipitation and the persistence of solid calcite, the solution pH remains constant at 6, consistent with separate experimental measurements (not shown). This pH reflects the equilibrium between the dissolved $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ and solid calcite at the relevant reaction conditions. pH measurements are useful for evaluating both thermodynamic and kinetic influences; specifically, the consistency between the measured and calculated pH implies that carbonate precipitation is rapid, and equilibrium represents the stabilization and persistence of solid calcite. However, pH measurements are limited in their ability to inform carbonation processes because they are simultaneously influenced by calcite precipitation, alkaline solid dissolution, and the partial pressure of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$.

Effects of Chemical and Mineralogical Composition on Carbonation Efficiency. The stoichiometric ("maximum") carbonation potential of a solid can be simply calculated from its simple oxide composition (e.g., as assessed by X-ray fluorescence spectroscopy) ${ }^{60}$

$$
\begin{align*}
\mathrm{CO}_{2}(\text { mass } \%)= & \left(0.785\left(X_{\mathrm{CaO}}-0.700 X_{\mathrm{SO}_{3}}\right)+1.091 X_{\mathrm{MgO}}\right. \\
& \left.+0.71 X_{\mathrm{Na}_{2} \mathrm{O}}+0.468 X_{\mathrm{K}_{2} \mathrm{O}}\right)-\mathrm{CO}_{2, \text { initial }}
\end{align*}
$$

where $X_{i}$ is the mass \% of oxide $i$ and $\mathrm{CO}_{2, \text { initial }}$ is the mass \% of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ in the solid reactant prior to carbonation. In general, the carbonation potential is dictated by a solid's CaO and MgO contents. The maximum carbonation extent of the solids considered herein ranges from 5.8 to $55 \% \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (mass basis). To compare the actual versus stoichiometric carbonation potential, that is, the carbonation efficiency, the extent of carbonation was evaluated after 24 and 72 h using the procedure described above while accounting for the initial carbonate content of the solids. A $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake of less than 0.5 mass $\%$ was noted to lie within the experimental uncertainty and hence taken as zero. The measured carbonation efficiencies after 24 and 72 h are given in Table 1 and the measured carbonation uptakes are given in Figure 3a. It is noticed that slags carbonated to the greatest extent, albeit with a considerably reduced rate after 24 h , showing strongly diminishing reactivity to $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ over time (Figure 3a). On the

Table 1. Carbonation Efficiencies (the Ratio between the Actual and Maximum $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Uptake Multiplied by $100 \%$ ) for Diverse Natural and Industrial Alkaline Solids in $100 \% \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ at Atmospheric Pressure at $60{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ after 24 and 72 h of Processing

|  |  |  |  | maximum <br> $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake <br> type |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | alkaline solid | $24 \mathrm{~h}(\%)$ | $72 \mathrm{~h}(\%)$ | (\%) |
| geologically derived <br> rocks and minerals | anorthosite | 0.0 | 0.0 | 13.9 |
|  | gabbro | 0.0 | 0.0 | 16.1 |
|  | olivine | 3.9 | 2.2 | 54.9 |
|  | peridotite | 0.0 | 2.0 | 36.7 |
|  | serpentinite | 0.0 | 3.1 | 36.4 |
|  | basalt | 1.7 | 1.9 | 36.9 |
| coal combustion fly | reclaimed | 0.0 | 20.9 | 24.5 |
|  | Class C (a) |  |  |  |
|  | reclaimed | 12.7 | 19.5 | 27.4 |
|  | Class C (b) |  |  |  |
|  | Class F | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.8 |
|  | trona-rich | 0.0 | 5.8 | 20.6 |
|  | Class C | 17.4 | 32.7 | 28.6 |
| ash | 46.5 | 46.8 | 39.1 |  |
| iron and steel slags | ladle | 49.9 | 50.6 | 44.0 |
|  | SS | 4.4 | 9.0 | 34.3 |
|  | ac-BF | 34.2 | 34.6 | 32.1 |
|  | BOF | 32.9 | 34.7 | 30.9 |
|  | EAF | 95.8 | 100 | 59.0 |

other hand, fly ash exhibited near-constant carbonation rates over the duration of the experiments. Natural silicates carbonated to a minimal extent, with only basalt, serpentinite, olivine, and peridotite showing measurable carbonation. On account of the near-ambient $(p, T)$ conditions used herein, the carbonation efficiency observed for rocks are much lower than in previous reports, which reached up to $>90 \%$ at 150 bar $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ pressure, at elevated temperature, and following pretreatment (e.g., see ref 38).

Interestingly, as shown in Figure 3b, the actual and stoichiometric carbonation potentials are linearly proportionate (and, in fact, parallel) to each other, although the former lies inferior to the latter. Only portlandite $\left(\mathrm{Ca}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}\right)$ achieves its stoichiometric $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake after 72 h of
carbonation. ${ }^{61}$ Using previously measured experimental carbonation efficiencies of 77,75 , and $82 \%$ for cement kiln dust, SS slag, and fly ash, ${ }^{16,19,20}$ the practical carbonation capacity for these three solids has been determined to be 7.6 Mt $\mathrm{CO}_{2} /$ year. ${ }^{28}$ These carbonation efficiencies are considerably higher than those obtained in this study for fly ash and slag (see Table 1), as expected from the use of pressurized $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (19 bar ${ }^{19}$ or $10-40 \mathrm{bar}^{20}$ ) and the higher reaction temperatures employed in other studies.

Although it may be suggested that at long reaction times, the actual and stoichiometric $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake may coincide, the period of time required for this to occur is difficult to estimate. This is because numerous alkaline solids, synthetic and otherwise, for example, Class F fly ash, ac-BF slag, and the natural rocks and minerals, present a high degree of crystallinity, large grain size (e.g., polarized light microscopy revealed that the air-cooled BF slag is composed of well-crystallized melilite grains that are a few millimeters across), and, often, a rather low chemical reactivity. As such, it remains unclear if the stoichiometric carbonation potential is indeed accessible at all over sufficiently short periods of time (i.e., hours rather than years). It should be noted that a significant fraction of the precipitated solids from slags are composed of magnesium carbonates and amorphous calcium carbonate (ACC); for example, up to $37 \%$ of the total carbonates for the SS slag (Figure 4a) may have originated from brucite $\left(\mathrm{Mg}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}\right.$ : SS) and bredigite $\left(\mathrm{Ca}_{7} \mathrm{Mg}\left(\mathrm{SiO}_{4}\right)_{4}: \mathrm{SS}, \mathrm{LS}\right)$, which represent the primary Mg containing phases in the slags. This observation is also consistent with the stabilizing effect of Mg on ACC, which has been demonstrated previously in alkali-activated slags. ${ }^{62}$ The presence of both calcium and magnesium carbonates may be significant for producing cemented carbonates, wherein ACC, magnesium-, and calcium carbonate and their hydrated forms (e.g., nesquehonite, $\mathrm{MgCO}_{3} \cdot 3 \mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ ) can produce a binding action but also volume change by molar volume expansion, which acts to "fill in" and densify the pore spaces. For reference, the molar volumes of calcite, ACC, magnesite, and nesquehonite are $36.9,54.1,28.1$, and $75.4 \mathrm{~cm}^{3} / \mathrm{mol}^{63} \mathrm{An}$ SEM micrograph and an XRD diffractogram of carbonated SS slag stored for 1 year are shown in Figure 4b,c. These data reveal the dominance of calcite in the sample, implying the


Figure 3. (a) $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake of alkaline solids after 24 and 72 h of reaction. Slags exhibited the fastest initial carbonation and featured the highest carbonation extents, although the rates of carbonation plateaued at later times (i.e., between 24 and 72 h ). (b) Relationship between actual and maximum (stoichiometric) $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake after 72 h . The linear fit indicates proportionality, with a constant offset inferior to the line of equality. Herein, dissolution-carbonation reactions occurred at ambient ("atmospheric") pressure and $T=25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ in excess water in equilibrium with pure $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$, that is, corresponding to $\mathrm{pH} \sim 4$.


Figure 4. (a) Distribution of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake among crystalline and amorphous calcium- and magnesium-carbonates for the different types of slags: EAF, BOF, ac-BF, SS, and LS. (b) Micrograph of the carbonated SS slag showing prismatic crystals characteristic of calcium carbonate produced from solutions containing impurities. ${ }^{65,66}$ (c) XRD patterns for the non-carbonated (blue) and carbonated (red) SS slag. The phases are marked as follows: 0 -melilite $\left((\mathrm{Ca}, \mathrm{Na})_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{7}\right)$, 1—monticellite $\left(\mathrm{CaMgSiO}_{4}\right), 2$-perovskite $\left(\mathrm{CaTiO}_{3}\right), 3$-enstatite $\left(\mathrm{MgSiO}_{3}\right), 4$-strontiowhitlockite $\left(\mathrm{Sr}_{9} \mathrm{Mg}\left(\mathrm{PO}_{4}\right)_{6}\left(\mathrm{PO}_{3} \mathrm{OH}\right)\right.$ ), 5-carboborite $\left(\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{Mg}\left(\mathrm{CO}_{3}\right)_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{2}(\mathrm{OH})_{8} \cdot 4\left(\mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}\right)\right.$ ), 6-ilmenite ( $\mathrm{FeTiO}_{3}$ ), 7—bernalite ( $\left.\mathrm{Fe}(\mathrm{OH})_{3}\right)$, 8-brucite $\left(\mathrm{Mg}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}\right)$, and 9 -mayenite $\left(\mathrm{Ca}_{12} \mathrm{Al}_{14} \mathrm{O}_{33}\right)$. The carbonated slag is composed of calcite ( C ) with minor peaks that suggest the presence of hydrated calcium silicates including plombierite $\left(\mathrm{Ca}_{5} \mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{Si}_{6} \mathrm{O}_{18} \cdot 6 \mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}\right)$ and xonotlite $\left(\mathrm{Ca}_{6} \mathrm{Si}_{6} \mathrm{O}_{17}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}\right)$.

(a)

(b)

Figure 5. (a) Ternary contour plot representing the 72 h carbonation potentials of alkaline solids including slags, fly ash, mafic and ultramafic rocks and minerals, and portlandite $\left(\mathrm{Ca}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}\right)$. The oxide compositions are expressed in mass $\%$. (b) Relationship between $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake and surface retreat (i.e., mineral dissolution) rate under equivalent conditions ( $\mathrm{pH} 6,60{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, far-from-saturation) measured using VSI. The division of the surface retreat rate by the homogeneous or heterogeneous (i.e., of a composite material) molar volume $\left(V_{\mathrm{m}}, \mathrm{cm}^{3} / \mathrm{mol}\right)$ yields the surface-areaaveraged mineral dissolution rate.
expected conversion of ACC to calcite under ambient conditions. ${ }^{64}$

The effect of solid composition on $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake is shown in Figure 5a. A strong correlation between $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake and total CaO and MgO content is evidenced, in agreement with eq 1. In addition, a significant influence of the $\mathrm{SiO}_{2}$ content that is indicative of the solid's reactivity (e.g., see refs 50 and 67-73) was also observed. The link between the solid's reactivity (i.e., mineral dissolution rate) and $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake is explicitly elaborated in Figure 5b, which shows the surface retreat (dissolution) rate at pH 6 and $60^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ as measured using vertical scanning interferometry (VSI). ${ }^{66,74,75}$ Interestingly, the $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake (rate and extent) is strongly correlated with the mineral dissolution rate, suggesting that predominantly, the rupture of the silicate framework is a prerequisite to releasing alkaline cations into solution. In silicates, the fraction of networkmodifying elements controls the connectivity between the Si and Al-centered polytopes-since network modifiers tend to result in the formation of terminating NBO atoms that are connected to only one Si or Al atom. ${ }^{49}$ As such, silicate/ aluminate tetrahedra (i.e., which form the rigid skeleton of aluminosilicate phases) may be isolated, as in nesosilicates, having a $\mathrm{Si} / \mathrm{O}$ molar ratio of 1:4, form pairs as in sorosilicates ( $\mathrm{Si} / \mathrm{O}=2: 7$ ), are connected in chains as in inosilicates $(\mathrm{Si} / \mathrm{O}=$
$1: 3$ or $4: 11)$, arranged in sheets as in phyllosilicates $(\mathrm{Si} / \mathrm{O}=$ 2:5), or form a framework, as in tectosilicates ( $\mathrm{Si} / \mathrm{O}=1: 2$ ). Because the breakage of $\mathrm{Si}-\mathrm{O}$ and $\mathrm{Al}-\mathrm{O}$ bonds is often ratelimiting in dissolution, lower dissolution rates are observed for solids with a greater numbers of these bonds. ${ }^{76}$ This is also reflected in mean electrostatic O site potential, $V=\sum q_{i} / r_{i j}$, where $q_{i}$ and $r_{i}$ are the charge of and the distance between each atom $i$, which increases with the increased sharing of oxygen atoms by Si -species. ${ }^{77,78}$

Network Topology Governs the Carbonation Efficiency. To further explore the relationship between the atomic structure of the solids and their carbonation efficiency, their number of constraints per atom ( $n_{c}$ ) was calculated (see the Materials and Methods section). This exploration is motivated by the fact that, in crystalline and glassy silicates, $n_{c}$ has been shown to be an efficient reduced-dimensionality metric that is strongly correlated to their dissolution kinetics. ${ }^{50,67-72,79,80}$ The number of constraints per atom associated with each solid is given in Table 2. Crystalline solids are found to be systematically stressed-rigid (overconstrained, $n_{c}>3$ ), whereas disordered phases are mostly flexible (underconstrained, $n_{c}<3$ )—which reiterates why disordered phases are often more reactive than their crystalline counterparts. ${ }^{81}$ In line with previous findings, Class F fly ash exhibits

Table 2. Number of BS, BB, and Total Number of Constraints per Atom ( $n_{c}$ ) Associated with Each Solid

| type | alkaline solid | BS | BB | $n_{\mathrm{c}}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| geologically derived rocks <br> and minerals | anorthosite | 1.623 | 2.204 | 3.828 |
|  | gabbro | 1.649 | 2.144 | 3.793 |
|  | olivine | 2.245 | 0.846 | 3.091 |
|  | peridotite | 2.138 | 1.078 | 3.216 |
|  | serpentinite | 2.154 | 1.030 | 3.184 |
|  | basalt | 2.154 | 1.032 | 3.186 |
| coal combustion fly ash | reclaimed | 1.309 | 1.703 | 3.012 |
|  | Class C (a) |  |  |  |
|  | reclaimed | 1.292 | 1.567 | 2.859 |
|  | Class C (b) |  |  |  |
|  | Class F | 1.411 | 2.344 | 3.754 |
|  | trona-rich | 1.314 | 1.730 | 3.044 |
|  | Class C | 1.292 | 1.556 | 2.848 |
|  | LS | 1.188 | 0.864 | 2.051 |
|  | SS | 1.161 | 0.760 | 1.921 |
|  | ac-BF | 1.225 | 1.174 | 2.399 |
|  | BOF | 1.263 | 1.211 | 2.475 |
|  | EAF | 1.290 | 1.356 | 2.647 |
|  |  |  |  |  |

higher $n_{\mathrm{c}}$ values than Class C fly ash-which is in agreement with the fact that Class F fly ash tends to exhibit a lower reactivity than Class C fly ash. ${ }^{67,82}$

An inverse linear correlation between carbonation efficiency and number of constraints per atom is observed (Figure 6), suggesting, by extrapolation, that a fully depolymerized fictitious solid (with $n_{c}=0$ ) would feature a full ( $\sim 100 \%$ ) carbonation efficiency-since such a solid would not feature any kinetic resistance to carbonation due to the absence of any interatomic connectivity. In turn, the addition of each new unit constraint tends to reduce the carbonation efficiency. Eventually, the carbonation efficiency plateaus toward 0 in highly stressed-rigid solids ( $n_{c}>3.2$ ). Within this overall trend, the ac-BF slag sample is noted to be an outlier, which suggests that its number of constraints per atom therein may be underestimated. This could be explained by the high degree of crystallinity of this slag-unlike what is assumed herein when calculating $n_{c}$. Overall, the inverse correlation between carbonation efficiency and number of constraints per atom suggests that, for the solids considered herein, the carbonation kinetics are governed by the topology of the atomic network. This suggests that the depolymerization of the solids (i.e., the
rupture of their skeleton silicate network; dissolution) is the rate-controlling step of carbonation.

Herein, we offer carbonation potential assessments normalized to the geometric specific surface area (SSA) because we fractionated particles via mechanical sieving-a geometric size (i.e., a "circumscribed aperture")-based separation. The geometric surface area (i.e., assessed based on the smallest sieve opening or based on light scattering measurements) is a reasonable basis of assessment because (i) it does not consider internal surface area (i.e., within voids) and (b) although numerically different from an adsorption-based "BET" surface area, both surface area assessments are a reasonable means to "calibrate" carbonation rates since they both only consider the exposed area that is accessible on a particle's surface and disregard the surface area that presents itself within internal void spaces. It should be noted that 11 out of the 16 samples, which include the rocks and slags, have nominally similar particle sizes, that is, the $38-53 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ size fraction. In contrast, the fly ash and $\mathrm{Ca}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}$ were used as received, resulting in particle sizes that are much smaller than the other samples. As such, although an overall greater extent of carbonation might be expected for the fly ash because of its higher geometric SSA, an offset in the trendlines was not observed. Instead, the data points for all solids lie on the same trendline. This suggests that the fly ash is intrinsically less reactive than the other solids for an equivalent surface area. We offer a possible explanation for this observation, that is, that ball-milling of the slags and rocks increased its reactivity by increasing the reactive surface area, for example, by the formation of defects and fine fractures. Importantly, even when the trends for the solids of the same surface areas are separately considered, that is, fly ash only, slags and rocks only, our observations remain the same: (1) that there is a linear relationship between the measured and the maximum $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake (Figure 3b), (2) that $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake is influenced not only by the total CaO and MgO content but also by the $\mathrm{SiO}_{2}$ content (Figure 5a), and (3) that the $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake correlates with the number of constraints, $n_{c}$, a proxy for the solid's reactivity that is independent of surface area and only dependent on the solid's atomic topology (Figure 6).
$\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization is a complex process that involves several steps (dissolution, change in speciation, reactivity between dissolved species, nucleation, crystal growth, etc.). Nevertheless, Figure 5b clearly establishes that when $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ is abundant, the rate of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake is controlled primarily by the dissolution of the silicate. Silicate dissolution can be limited by


Figure 6. Carbonation efficiency after (a) 24 and (b) 72 h of reaction as a function of the number of constraints per atom ( $n_{c}$ ). Herein, dissolution-carbonation reactions occurred at ambient ("atmospheric") pressure and $T=60^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ in excess water in equilibrium with pure $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$, i.e., corresponding to $\mathrm{pH} \sim 4$.


Figure 7. Apparent dissolution rate constant, $k$, as a function of (a) mass of Ca per unit mass of slag and (b), (c) molar Ca/Si ratio of the slag, in (b) DI water (i.e., under alkaline conditions) and (c) under acidic conditions (using acetic acid). The green line in (b) shows the best-fit line for the data obtained at $90^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, whereas the dashed gray line in (c) is drawn to guide the eye to show the relationship between $k$ and molar $\mathrm{Ca} / \mathrm{Si}$ while excluding the data points corresponding to SS and LS . The fraction of Ca reacted, $X_{\mathrm{C},}$, follows a power law dependence as a function of time, given by $X_{\mathrm{Ca}}=m_{\mathrm{Ca}, t} / m_{\mathrm{Ca}, t_{0}}=k t^{\alpha}$, where $k$ is the apparent rate constant and $\alpha$ is the apparent reaction order whereas $m_{\mathrm{C}, t}$ and $m_{\mathrm{Ca}, t_{0}}$ ( mg ) are the total masses of Ca released in solution at time $t(\mathrm{~h})$ and initially present in the solid, respectively.
the formation of a passivation layer or the precipitation of secondary metastable phases; these mechanisms are primarily at play upon extended dissolution time (i.e., Stage II) ${ }^{83}$ when the solution approaches a Si-saturated state. ${ }^{84-86}$ Far from saturation, the dissolution rate of silicate minerals is expected to be controlled by network hydrolysis or ion-exchangewhich, in turn, are both controlled by the connectivity/ topology of the silicate network. ${ }^{69}$ The systematic relationship between carbonation efficiency and network topology indicates that under our experimental conditions, network hydrolysis/ ion-exchange, and not surface passivation, controls the overall $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization rates. For further context, recently, Oey et al. highlighted circumstances such that far-from-saturation, $n_{c}$ is indeed a robust indicator of dissolution rates, but on the other hand, close-to-saturation, $n_{c}$ may be an insufficient basis for assessing dissolution, and in turn, carbonation behavior. ${ }^{67,80}$

Role of Silicate Dissolution Kinetics. Generally speaking, alkaline species are often hosted within silicate/aluminosilicate frameworks. Therefore, to better understand the effects of atomic structure on dissolution rates, the dissolution behavior of a subset of the solids was examined to elucidate the linkages between dissolution and carbonation rates, and solid composition and structure. First, slags are composed of Ca-, Mg -, and Fe -silicates and oxides. While there are data on the bulk dissolution rates of slags, data on the dissolution rates of individual slag-forming minerals are sparse. Nonetheless, their relative reactivities can be inferred from observations of analogous rock-forming minerals. For example, the Cacontaining phases in slags can be separated into three types: $\mathrm{Ca}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}, \mathrm{Ca}-(\mathrm{Fe})$-silicates, and $\mathrm{Ca}-\mathrm{Fe}-\mathrm{O}^{19}$ such that the calcium and iron oxides are generally more reactive that their silicate counterparts. The crystalline phases in slags are primarily nesosilicates, where during dissolution the structure is decomposed (i.e., dissolved) by the breaking of $\mathrm{Ca}-\mathrm{O}$ or $\mathrm{Mg}-\mathrm{O}$ bonds. These bonds have energies lower than $\mathrm{Si}-\mathrm{O}$ bonds, ${ }^{87}$ resulting in faster dissolution. Forsterite $\left(\mathrm{Mg}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}\right)$, a mineral often found in ultramafic rocks such as peridotite, dissolves via a similar mechanism. However, the water exchange rate around solvated Mg is lower than Ca , leading to slower dissolution compared to its calcium-rich counterpart, larnite $\left(\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}\right) .{ }^{88}$ For chain silicates, in acidic conditions, ion exchange of $\mathrm{H}^{+}$to $\mathrm{Mg}^{2+}$ occurs, resulting in the partial
liberation of Si and the breaking of $\mathrm{Si}-\mathrm{O}$ bonds. ${ }^{89}$ This implies that the release of Mg in silicates leads to accelerated dissolution. A similar mechanism has been proposed in talc $\left(\mathrm{Mg}_{3} \mathrm{Si}_{4} \mathrm{O}_{10}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}\right)$, a sheet silicate, which may undergo extensive ion exchange, leading to its exfoliation and increased surface area, ${ }^{90}$ further enhancing dissolution. Analogous to the carbonation results presented above, this may also explain why the rate constants for Ca-release correlate with the $\mathrm{Ca} / \mathrm{Si}$ ratio but show a more complex relationship with bulk Ca content (Figure 7a,b). The dissolution rate of silicates, including slags, generally increases with decreasing $\mathrm{pH},{ }^{91-93}$ but the relative increases are phase-dependent. For instance, Mg-containing silicates dissolve appreciably only at low pH . As a result, SS and LS, both of which are rich in $\mathrm{Ca}-\mathrm{Mg}$-, and $\mathrm{Ca}-\mathrm{F}$-silicates and contain the highest bulk Ca , dissolved more favorably than BOF slag in acidic conditions (Figure 7c). Under alkaline conditions, BOF slag, which is composed primarily of Caaluminates and Ca -silicates, exhibited the highest rates of Ca release. This is because the dissolution of $\mathrm{Ca}-\mathrm{Al}$-silicate, $\mathrm{Ca}-$ F-silicate, and $\mathrm{Ca}-\mathrm{Mg}$-silicate is more significantly enhanced in acidic conditions relative to $\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}{ }^{91,94}$ In addition, the dissolution rates of the isochemical phases $\beta-\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ and $\gamma$ $\mathrm{Ca}_{2} \mathrm{SiO}_{4}$ have been shown to not depend strongly on pH over the range of $4-10,{ }^{93}$ whereas the dissolution rate of calcite, abundant in SS and LS but not in BOF slags, increases significantly with decreasing $\mathrm{pH} .{ }^{94}$ Hence, under acidic conditions, the phase composition of the slag, in addition to the molar $\mathrm{Ca} / \mathrm{Si}$, becomes a significant determinant of Ca extractability (Figure 7c). These results suggest that for solids having similar Ca contents, the fraction of Ca that is present in reactive (less polymerized, e.g., CaO ) phases controls the relative differences in the rates of Ca solubilization. This is consistent with the observation made earlier that carbonation is inversely controlled by the Si content of the solid. These results imply, unsurprisingly, that solids with higher reactive Ca and Mg contents are more reactive and feature a higher $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ uptake capacity.

Estimating $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Removal Based on Measured Carbonation Potentials. In order to limit global temperature rise to $1.5^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and the effects of climate change, about $10-20$ gigatons ( Gt ) of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ need to be removed from the atmosphere, annually, over the next 100 years. ${ }^{2}$ This translates to the production of at least 20 Gt of carbonate solids per year by
$\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization. Ultramafic rocks present an abundance on the order of $50 \mathrm{~km}^{3}$ in the eastern United States. ${ }^{95}$ Although ultramafic rocks are rich in Mg , for example, 36-48 mass \% MgO , they dissolve rapidly only under highly acidic conditions, for example, $>5 \mathrm{~N} \mathrm{HCl}$ (energy intensity of: 0.88 MWh of energy per t of HCl produced)..${ }^{95,96}$ For the modest solvents considered herein, natural alkaline solids feature no measurable carbonation potential for practical time scales on the order of hours to days. While mechanical (e.g., ultra-fine grinding; energy intensity of 0.05 MWh of energy per t of solute to produce a median particle size $\left(d_{50}\right)$ on the order of $50 \mu \mathrm{~m}$; also see ref 97), thermal (e.g., exposure to temperatures $>600$ ${ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ : energy intensity of 0.2 MWh of energy per t of solute), and/or pressure impositions (e.g., 15 MPa , energy intensity of 0.22 MWh of energy per $\mathrm{t} \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ ) processing and/or aggressive solvents ${ }^{98-102}$ do indeed enhance carbonation reaction ratesthese can result in considerable expense (i.e., equipment and process complexity, energy, and carbon intensity) which may impede widespread adoption. However, processing costs may be offset by the production of valuable industrial solids (e.g., colloidal silica, magnesite) and recoverable thermal energy. ${ }^{103}$ Moreover, recent advances in regenerable sorbents for $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization as well as the decreasing costs of renewable energy may render these processes feasible. ${ }^{104-107}$ Renewable generation capacity, globally, is fast expanding. Recent forecasts show that renewable energy will account for $60 \%$ of cumulative capacity additions from 2020 to 2050 and that generation is increasing faster than electricity demand such that renewable energy will account for $42 \%$ of total electricity generation in the United States. ${ }^{105}$ However, the rate of expansion and the installed base of renewable energy generation at this time remain less than needed to achieve necessary levels of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ removal. ${ }^{108}$

Our results are applicable for passive $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization strategies. In such applications, an unlimited source of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (i.e., atmosphere) is present and the rate and extent of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization is limited simply by the reactivity of the solid reactants (and the availability of sufficient moisture). ${ }^{109-111}$ The objective of using pure $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ in our experiments is not to highlight a specific application but rather to ensure sufficient dissolved carbon such that mineral dissolution is rate-limiting. Thus, our conditions are selected to accelerate passive carbonation by supplying sufficient amounts of reactants while maintaining ambient temperature and pressure to not alter the mechanisms of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization reactions. In any event, mineralization effected via forced/enhanced (i.e., as opposed to passive) alkaline solid weathering would need to focus strictly on the utilization of renewable energy as existing fossil fuel sources result in far too high a carbon footprint to offer a negative emissions strategy (N.B.: 1 MWh of coal-based electricity and natural-gas-based electricity generation are associated with $\sim 0.95$ and $\sim 0.45 \mathrm{t}$, respectively, of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions). ${ }^{2}$ Lastly, while rocks do present volumetric abundance, unless a particular effort is made to utilize mine tailings and existing industrial byproducts, the mining of these resources results in its own environmental footprint. Nonetheless, strategies involving ambient/passive carbonation of surface rocks in coastal environments that induce natural grinding processes may result in net negative $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions. ${ }^{112,113}$ Although unquestionably industrial alkaline wastes are substantially more reactive than their natural counterparts, they are far less abundant. For example, global annual productions of fly ash and slag are on the order of 440
and 530 Mt annually, respectively. ${ }^{114}$ The net carbonation potential (i.e., after accounting for the process and/or reagent $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ footprint) of this diversity of materials, that is, both geological-derived and industrial wastes, can be more accurately estimated by considering their reactivity. Our experimental carbonation conversions (Table 1, Figures 3b and 5a) suggest a carbonation potential on the order of $\sim 600$ $\mathrm{Mt} \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ /year, which, given the applicable levels of uncertainty, is similar to the estimates of Renforth et al. ${ }^{8}(700-1200 \mathrm{Mt}$ $\mathrm{CO}_{2} /$ year), contributing about $5 \%$ to required $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ removal rates. Accelerating this rate by decreasing the grain size entails significant grinding energy that is a function of the mineral's hardness and the required dissolution rate. ${ }^{97}$ Based on experimental data on olivine dissolution in a soil column, a minimum energy requirement for dissolution of 0.42 MWh per ton of rock is estimated. ${ }^{115}$ Given the dissolution-limited nature of carbonation reactions, a specific opportunity may lie in utilizing pre-solubilized Ca and Mg , for example, from produced water, saline groundwater, and desalination brines for $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization. Based on current production rates, these waters can provide nearly 1 Gt of Mg and Ca in total per year. ${ }^{116-120}$ Moreover, seawater is a massive reservoir of divalent cations, with global inventories amounting to 520,000 Gt Ca and $1,272,000 \mathrm{Gt} \mathrm{Mg}.{ }^{121}$ So long as the ocean's chemistry is not detrimentally affected, there may be additional opportunities in using ocean-derived Ca and Mg for $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ mineralization. ${ }^{122}$

## SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

In this study, we systematically analyzed and compared the carbonation potentials of a collection of natural and industrial alkaline solids having wide-ranging chemical compositions and phase constituents. Special focus is placed on revealing the influences of the intrinsic reactivity of the solids by examining carbonation under aqueous conditions and in systems saturated with $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$. The approach presented herein can be applied to assess the carbonation capacity (potential and efficiency) of heterogeneous solids that feature a complex distribution of distinct mineral species. In agreement with prior findings, our results show that natural alkaline solids are much less reactive than their industrial counterparts. Furthermore, we show that carbonation potentials and the rate of calcium release depend not only on the total Ca (and Mg ) contents but also on the Si content, which is indicative of the silicate network's atomic topology and thus the reactivity of the solid. The dependence of carbonation on mineral dissolution indicates that enhancing dissolution, for example, using additives, or thermal, mechanical, electrical, or acoustic methods, at the lowest possible energy expenditure is a critical need to achieve sufficiently fast dissolution (i.e., generally greater than $10^{-9} \mathrm{~mol} / \mathrm{m}^{2} / \mathrm{s}$ ) and therefore carbonation rates. Taken together, this work presents an approach to ascertain the propensity for carbonation/carbon sequestration capacity using the bulk chemical composition of the solid at nearambient conditions. Quantitative data of this nature are foundational to accurately estimate/constrain the ability of alkaline solid-based enhanced weathering to serve as a timeand scale-relevant carbon management strategy.

## AUTHOR INFORMATION

## Corresponding Authors

Erika Callagon La Plante - Department of Materials Science and Engineering, University of Texas at Arlington, Arlington,

Texas 76019, United States; Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California 90095, United Stated; Institute for Carbon Management, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California 90095, United States; © orcid.org/0000-0002-5273-9523; Email: erika.laplante@ uta.edu
Gaurav N. Sant - Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California 90095, United Stated; Institute for Carbon Management, Department of Materials Science and Engineering, and California Nanosystems Institute, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California 90095, United States; © orcid.org/0000-0002-1124-5498; Email: gsant@ucla.edu

## Authors

Iman Mehdipour - Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California 90095, United Stated; © orcid.org/ 0000-0002-6841-3907
Ian Shortt - Department of Materials Science and Engineering, University of Texas at Arlington, Arlington, Texas 76019, United States
Kai Yang - Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California 90095, United Stated
Dante Simonetti - Institute for Carbon Management and Department of Chemical and Biomolecular Engineering, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California 90095, United States; © orcid.org/0000-0002-5708-460X
Mathieu Bauchy - Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California 90095, United Stated; Institute for Carbon Management, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California 90095, United States; © orcid.org/ 0000-0003-4600-0631
Complete contact information is available at:
https://pubs.acs.org/10.1021/acssuschemeng.1c00838

## Notes

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors acknowledge financial support for this research from the Department of Energy, Office of Fossil Energy via the National Energy Technology Laboratory (NETL; DEFE0029825), the National Science Foundation (DMREF: 1922167), the U.S. Department of Transportation through the Federal Highway Administration (693JJ31950021), and the University of Texas at Arlington. This research was conducted in the Laboratory for the Chemistry of Construction Materials ( $\mathrm{LC}^{2}$ ) at the University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA) and the Characterization Center for Materials and Biology at the University of Texas, Arlington (UTA). As such, the authors gratefully acknowledge the support that has made these laboratories and their operations possible. The contents of this paper reflect the views and opinions of the authors, who are responsible for the accuracy of the data sets presented herein and do not reflect the views and/or policies of the funders, nor do the contents constitute a specification, standard or regulation.

## REFERENCES

(1) Masson-Delmotte, V.; Zhai, P.; Pörtner, H.-O.; Roberts, D.; Skea, J.; Shukla, P. R.; Pirani, A.; Moufouma-Okia, W.; Péan, C.; Pidcock, R.; Connors, S.; Matthews, J. B. R.; Chen, Y.; Zhou, X.; Gomis, M. I.; Lonnoy, E.; Maycock, T.; Tignor, M.; Waterfield, T. IPCC, 2018: Global Warming of $1.5^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. An IPCC Special Report on the Impacts of Global Warming of $1.5{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ above Pre-Industrial Levels and Related Global Greenhouse Gas Emission Pathways, in the Context of Strengthening the Global Response to the Threat of Climate Change, Sustainable Development, and Efforts to Eradicate Poverty, 2018; In Press.
(2) National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. Negative Emissions Technologies and Reliable Sequestration: A Research Agenda; The National Academies Press, 2019.
(3) Huijgen, W. J. J.; Comans, R. N. J. Carbon Dioxide Sequestration by Mineral Carbonation. Literature Review; ECN-C--03-016; Energy research Centre of the Netherlands ECN, 2003.
(4) Bobicki, E. R.; Liu, Q.; Xu, Z.; Zeng, H. Carbon Capture and Storage Using Alkaline Industrial Wastes. Prog. Energy Combust. Sci. 2012, 38, 302-320.
(5) Romanov, V.; Soong, Y.; Carney, C.; Rush, G. E.; Nielsen, B.; O'Connor, W. Mineralization of Carbon Dioxide: A Literature Review. ChemBioEng Rev. 2015, 2, 231-256.
(6) Pan, S.-Y.; Chang, E. E.; Chiang, P.-C. $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Capture by Accelerated Carbonation of Alkaline Wastes. A Review on Its Principles and Applications 2012, 12, 770.
(7) Mehdipour, I.; Falzone, G.; La Plante, E. C.; Simonetti, D.; Neithalath, N.; Sant, G. How Microstructure and Pore Moisture Affect Strength Gain in Portlandite-Enriched Composites That Mineralize $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$. ACS Sustainable Chem. Eng. 2019, 7, 13053-13061.
(8) Renforth, P.; Washbourne, C.-L.; Taylder, J.; Manning, D. A. C. Silicate Production and Availability for Mineral Carbonation. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2011, 45, 2035-2041.
(9) Matter, J. M.; Stute, M.; Snaebjornsdottir, S. O.; Oelkers, E. H.; Gislason, S. R.; Aradottir, E. S.; Sigfusson, B.; Gunnarsson, I.; Sigurdardottir, H.; Gunnlaugsson, E.; Axelsson, G.; Alfredsson, H. A.; Wolff-Boenisch, D.; Mesfin, K.; Taya, D. F. d. l. R.; Hall, J.; Dideriksen, K.; Broecker, W. S. Rapid Carbon Mineralization for Permanent Disposal of Anthropogenic Carbon Dioxide Emissions. Science 2016, 352, 1312-1314.
(10) McGrail, B. P.; Schaef, H. T.; Ho, A. M.; Chien, Y.-J.; Dooley, J. J.; Davidson, C. L. Potential for Carbon Dioxide Sequestration in Flood Basalts. J. Geophys. Res.: Solid Earth 2006, 111, B12201.
(11) Jo, H. Y.; Kim, J. H.; Lee, Y. J.; Lee, M.; Choh, S.-J. Evaluation of Factors Affecting Mineral Carbonation of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Using Coal Fly Ash in Aqueous Solutions under Ambient Conditions. Chem. Eng. J. 2012, 183, 77-87.
(12) Bonenfant, D.; Kharoune, L.; Sauvé, S.; Hausler, R.; Niquette, P.; Mimeault, M.; Kharoune, M. $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Sequestration by Aqueous Red Mud Carbonation at Ambient Pressure and Temperature. Ind. Eng. Chem. Res. 2008, 47, 7617-7622.
(13) Pan, S.-Y.; Chen, Y.-H.; Chen, C.-D.; Shen, A.-L.; Lin, M.; Chiang, P.-C. High-Gravity Carbonation Process for Enhancing $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Fixation and Utilization Exemplified by the Steelmaking Industry. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2015, 49, 12380-12387.
(14) Pan, S.-Y.; Shah, K. J.; Chen, Y.-H.; Wang, M.-H.; Chiang, P.-C. Deployment of Accelerated Carbonation Using Alkaline Solid Wastes for Carbon Mineralization and Utilization Toward a Circular Economy. ACS Sustainable Chem. Eng. 2017, 5, 6429-6437.
(15) Pérez-López, R.; Montes-Hernandez, G.; Nieto, J. M.; Renard, F.; Charlet, L. Carbonation of Alkaline Paper Mill Waste to Reduce $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Greenhouse Gas Emissions into the Atmosphere. Appl. Geochem. 2008, 23, 2292-2300.
(16) Huntzinger, D. N.; Gierke, J. S.; Kawatra, S. K.; Eisele, T. C.; Sutter, L. L. Carbon Dioxide Sequestration in Cement Kiln Dust through Mineral Carbonation. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2009, 43, 19861992.
(17) Entezari Zarandi, A.; Larachi, F.; Beaudoin, G.; Plante, B.; Sciortino, M. Ambient Mineral Carbonation of Different Lithologies
of Mafic to Ultramafic Mining Wastes/Tailings-A Comparative Study. Int. J. Greenhouse Gas Control 2017, 63, 392-400.
(18) Santos, R. M.; Van Bouwel, J.; Vandevelde, E.; Mertens, G.; Elsen, J.; Van Gerven, T. Accelerated Mineral Carbonation of Stainless Steel Slags for $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Storage and Waste Valorization: Effect of Process Parameters on Geochemical Properties. Int. J. Greenhouse Gas Control 2013, 17, 32-45.
(19) Huijgen, W. J. J.; Comans, R. N. J. Mineral $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Sequestration by Steel Slag Carbonation. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2005, 39, 96769682.
(20) Montes-Hernandez, G.; Pérez-López, R.; Renard, F.; Nieto, J. M.; Charlet, L. Mineral Sequestration of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ by Aqueous Carbonation of Coal Combustion Fly-Ash. J. Hazard. Mater. 2009, 161, 1347-1354.
(21) Chang, E.-E.; Chiu, A.-C.; Pan, S.-Y.; Chen, Y.-H.; Tan, C.-S.; Chiang, P.-C. Carbonation of Basic Oxygen Furnace Slag with Metalworking Wastewater in a Slurry Reactor. Int. J. Greenhouse Gas Control 2013, 12, 382-389.
(22) Hosseini, T.; Selomulya, C.; Haque, N.; Zhang, L. Indirect Carbonation of Victorian Brown Coal Fly Ash for $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Sequestration: Multiple-Cycle Leaching-Carbonation and Magnesium Leaching Kinetic Modeling. Energy Fuels 2014, 28, 6481-6493.
(23) Gerdemann, S. J.; O’Connor, W. K.; Dahlin, D. C.; Penner, L. R.; Rush, H. Ex Situ Aqueous Mineral Carbonation. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2007, 41, 2587-2593.
(24) Penner, L.; O’Connor, W.; Dahlin, D.; Gerdemann, S.; Rush, G. Mineral Carbonation: Energy Costs of Pretreatment Options and Insights Gained from Flow Loop Reaction Studies (DOE/ARC--2004-042), 2004.
(25) Kelemen, P.; Benson, S. M.; Pilorgé, H.; Psarras, P.; Wilcox, J. An Overview of the Status and Challenges of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Storage in Minerals and Geological Formations. Front. Clim. 2019, 1. DOI: DOI: 10.3389/fclim.2019.00009.
(26) Snæbjörnsdóttir, S. Ó.; Wiese, F.; Fridriksson, T.; Ármansson, H.; Einarsson, G. M.; Gislason, S. R. $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Storage Potential of Basaltic Rocks in Iceland and the Oceanic Ridges. Energy Procedia 2014, 63, 4585-4600.
(27) Snæbjörnsdóttir, S. Ó.; Sigfússon, B.; Marieni, C.; Goldberg, D.; Gislason, S. R.; Oelkers, E. H. Carbon Dioxide Storage through Mineral Carbonation. Nat. Rev. Earth Environ. 2020, 1, 90-102.
(28) Kirchofer, A.; Brandt, A.; Krevor, S.; Prigiobbe, V.; Becker, A.; Wilcox, J. Assessing the Potential of Mineral Carbonation with Industrial Alkalinity Sources in the U.S. Energy Procedia 2013, 37, 5858-5869.
(29) Kirchofer, A.; Becker, A.; Brandt, A.; Wilcox, J. $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Mitigation Potential of Mineral Carbonation with Industrial Alkalinity Sources in the United States. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2013, 47, 7548-7554.
(30) Li, J.; Hitch, M.; Power, I.; Pan, Y. Integrated Mineral Carbonation of Ultramafic Mine Deposits-A Review. Minerals 2018, 8, 147.
(31) Zingaretti, D.; Costa, G.; Baciocchi, R. Assessment of Accelerated Carbonation Processes for $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Storage Using Alkaline Industrial Residues. Ind. Eng. Chem. Res. 2014, 53, 9311-9324.
(32) Renforth, P. The Negative Emission Potential of Alkaline Materials. Nat. Commun. 2019, 10, 1401.
(33) Chang, E.-E.; Pan, S.-Y.; Yang, L.; Chen, Y.-H.; Kim, H.; Chiang, P.-C. Accelerated Carbonation Using Municipal Solid Waste Incinerator Bottom Ash and Cold-Rolling Wastewater: Performance Evaluation and Reaction Kinetics. Waste Manage. 2015, 43, 283-292.
(34) Zhang, S.; DePaolo, D. J. Rates of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Mineralization in Geological Carbon Storage. Acc. Chem. Res. 2017, 50, 2075-2084.
(35) Geerlings, H.; Zevenhoven, R. $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Mineralization-Bridge between Storage and Utilization of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$. Annu. Rev. Chem. Biomol. Eng. 2013, 4, 103-117.
(36) Entezari Zarandi, A.; Larachi, F.; Beaudoin, G.; Plante, B.; Sciortino, M. Nesquehonite as a Carbon Sink in Ambient Mineral Carbonation of Ultramafic Mining Wastes. Chem. Eng. J. 2017, 314, 160-168.
(37) Harrison, A. L.; Power, I. M.; Dipple, G. M. Accelerated Carbonation of Brucite in Mine Tailings for Carbon Sequestration. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2013, 47, 126-134.
(38) Sanna, A.; Uibu, M.; Caramanna, G.; Kuusik, R.; Maroto-Valer, M. M. A Review of Mineral Carbonation Technologies to Sequester $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$. Chem. Soc. Rev. 2014, 43, 8049-8080.
(39) Escalante, J. I.; Gómez, L. Y.; Johal, K. K.; Mendoza, G.; Mancha, H.; Méndez, J. Reactivity of Blast-Furnace Slag in Portland Cement Blends Hydrated under Different Conditions. Cem. Concr. Res. 2001, 31, 1403-1409.
(40) Ramezanianpour, A. A. Cement Replacement Materials; Springer Geochemistry/Mineralogy; Springer, 2014; Vol. 10, pp 978-983.
(41) Shi, C.; Meyer, C.; Behnood, A. Utilization of Copper Slag in Cement and Concrete. Resour., Conserv. Recycl. 2008, 52, 1115-1120.
(42) Mehta, P. K. Testing and Correlation of Fly Ash Properties with Respect to Pozzolanic Behavior Final Report; EPRI-CS-3314; Department of Civil Engineering, California University: Berkeley (USA), 1984.
(43) Mo, L.; Panesar, D. K. Effects of Accelerated Carbonation on the Microstructure of Portland Cement Pastes Containing Reactive MgO. Cem. Concr. Res. 2012, 42, 769-777.
(44) Dung, N. T.; Unluer, C. Development of MgO Concrete with Enhanced Hydration and Carbonation Mechanisms. Cem. Concr. Res. 2018, 103, 160-169.
(45) Przepiórski, J.; Karolczyk, J.; Takeda, K.; Tsumura, T.; Toyoda, M.; Morawski, A. W. Porous Carbon Obtained by Carbonization of PET Mixed with Basic Magnesium Carbonate: Pore Structure and Pore Creation Mechanism. Ind. Eng. Chem. Res. 2009, 48, 7110-7116.
(46) Phillips, J. C. Topology of Covalent Non-Crystalline Solids .1. Short-Range Order in Chalcogenide Alloys. J. Non-Cryst. Solids 1979, 34, 153-181.
(47) Mauro, J. C. Topological Constraint Theory of Glass. Am. Ceram. Soc. Bull. 2011, 90, 31-37.
(48) Bauchy, M. Topological Constraint Theory and Rigidity of Glasses. 2019 https://www.taylorfrancis.com/ (accessed Feb 11, 2020).
(49) Varshneya, A. K. Fundamentals of Inorganic Glasses; Academic Press Inc., 1993.
(50) Gin, S.; Wang, M.; Bisbrouck, N.; Taron, M.; Lu, X.; Deng, L.; Angeli, F.; Charpentier, T.; Delaye, J.-M.; Du, J.; Bauchy, M. Can a Simple Topological-Constraints-Based Model Predict the Initial Dissolution Rate of Borosilicate and Aluminosilicate Glasses? npj Mater. Degrad. 2020, 4, 1-10.
(51) Laurent, O.; Mantisi, B.; Micoulaut, M. Structure and Topology of Soda-Lime Silicate Glasses: Implications for Window Glass. J. Phys. Chem. B 2014, 118, 12750-12762.
(52) Oelkers, E. H.; Declercq, J.; Saldi, G. D.; Gislason, S. R.; Schott, J. Olivine Dissolution Rates: A Critical Review. Chem. Geol. 2018, 500, 1-19.
(53) Mitchell, M. J.; Jensen, O. E.; Cliffe, K. A.; Maroto-Valer, M. M. A Model of Carbon Dioxide Dissolution and Mineral Carbonation Kinetics. Proc. R. Soc. A 2010, 466, 1265-1290.
(54) 2.2 Characteristics of Large North American $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Point Sources, Global CCS Institute https://hub.globalccsinstitute.com/ publications/building-cost-curves-co2-storage-north-america/22-characteristics-large-north-american (accessed Apr 10, 2019).
(55) Golubev, S. V.; Bauer, A.; Pokrovsky, O. S. Effect of pH and Organic Ligands on the Kinetics of Smectite Dissolution at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 2006, 70, 4436-4451.
(56) Oelkers, E. H.; Schott, J. An Experimental Study of Enstatite Dissolution Rates as a Function of pH , Temperature, and Aqueous Mg and Si Concentration, and the Mechanism of Pyroxene/ Pyroxenoid Dissolution. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 2001, 65, 12191231.
(57) Reddy, K. J.; John, S.; Weber, H.; Argyle, M. D.; Bhattacharyya, P.; Taylor, D. T.; Christensen, M.; Foulke, T.; Fahlsing, P. Simultaneous Capture and Mineralization of Coal Combustion Flue Gas Carbon Dioxide ( $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ ). Energy Procedia 2011, 4, 1574-1583.
(58) Snæbjörnsdóttir, S. Ó.; Oelkers, E. H.; Mesfin, K.; Aradóttir, E. S.; Dideriksen, K.; Gunnarsson, I.; Gunnlaugsson, E.; Matter, J. M.; Stute, M.; Gislason, S. R. The Chemistry and Saturation States of Subsurface Fluids during the in situ Mineralisation of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ and $\mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{~S}$ at the CarbFix Site in SW-Iceland. Int. J. Greenhouse Gas Control 2017, 58, 87-102.
(59) Parkhurst, D. L.; Appelo, C. A. J. Description of Input and Examples for PHREEQC Version 3-A Computer Program for Speciation, Batch-Reaction, One-Dimensional Transport, and Inverse Geochemical Calculations; U.S. Geological Survey Techniques and Methods, 2013.
(60) Steinour, H. H. Some Effects of Carbon Dioxide on Mortars and Concrete-Discussion. J. Am. Concr. Inst. 1959, 30, 905-907.
(61) Falzone, G.; Mehdipour, I.; Neithalath, N.; Bauchy, M.; Simonetti, D.; Sant, G. New Insights into the Mechanisms of Carbon Dioxide Mineralization by Portlandite. AIChE J. 2021, 67, No. e17160.
(62) Morandeau, A. E.; White, C. E. Role of Magnesium-Stabilized Amorphous Calcium Carbonate in Mitigating the Extent of Carbonation in Alkali-Activated Slag. Chem. Mater. 2015, 27, 6625-6634.
(63) Fernandez-Martinez, A.; Kalkan, B.; Clark, S. M.; Waychunas, G. A. Pressure-Induced Polyamorphism and Formation of "Aragonitic" Amorphous Calcium Carbonate. Angew. Chem. 2013, 125, 8512-8515.
(64) Rodriguez-Navarro, C.; Kudłacz, K.; Cizer, Ö.; Ruiz-Agudo, E. Formation of Amorphous Calcium Carbonate and Its Transformation into Mesostructured Calcite. CrystEngComm 2014, 17, 58-72.
(65) Cheng, H.; Zhang, X.; Song, H. Morphological Investigation of Calcium Carbonate during Ammonification-Carbonization Process of Low Concentration Calcium Solution. J. Nanomater. 2014, 2014 03696, https://www.hindawi.com/journals/jnm/2014/503696/. DOI: DOI: 10.1155/2014/503696.
(66) Wei, Z.; Wang, B.; Falzone, G.; La Plante, E. C.; Okoronkwo, M. U.; She, Z.; Oey, T.; Balonis, M.; Neithalath, N.; Pilon, L.; Sant, G. Clinkering-Free Cementation by Fly Ash Carbonation. J. $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Util. 2018, 23, 117-127.
(67) Oey, T.; Kumar, A.; Pignatelli, I.; Yu, Y.; Neithalath, N.; Bullard, J. W.; Bauchy, M.; Sant, G. Topological Controls on the Dissolution Kinetics of Glassy Aluminosilicates. J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 2017, 100, 5521-5527.
(68) Oey, T.; Hsiao, Y.-H.; Callagon, E.; Wang, B.; Pignatelli, I.; Bauchy, M.; Sant, G. N. Rate Controls on Silicate Dissolution in Cementitious Environments. RILEM Tech. Lett. 2017, 2, 67-73.
(69) Pignatelli, I.; Kumar, A.; Bauchy, M.; Sant, G. Topological Control on Silicates' Dissolution Kinetics. Langmuir 2016, 32, 44344439.
(70) Liu, H.; Zhang, T.; Anoop Krishnan, N. M.; Smedskjaer, M. M.; Ryan, J. V.; Gin, S.; Bauchy, M. Predicting the Dissolution Kinetics of Silicate Glasses by Topology-Informed Machine Learning. npj Mater. Degrad. 2019, 3, 1-12.
(71) Mascaraque, N.; Bauchy, M.; Smedskjaer, M. M. Correlating the Network Topology of Oxide Glasses with Their Chemical Durability. J. Phys. Chem. B 2017, 121, 1139-1147.
(72) Mascaraque, N.; Bauchy, M.; Fierro, J. L. G.; Rzoska, S. J.; Bockowski, M.; Smedskjaer, M. M. Dissolution Kinetics of Hot Compressed Oxide Glasses. J. Phys. Chem. B 2017, 121, 9063-9072. (73) Hsiao, Y.-H.; La Plante, E. C.; Krishnan, N. M. A.; Le Pape, Y.; Neithalath, N.; Bauchy, M.; Sant, G. Effects of Irradiation on Albite's Chemical Durability. J. Phys. Chem. A 2017, 121, 7835-7845.
(74) Hsiao, Y.-H.; La Plante, E. C.; Krishnan, N. M. A.; Dobbs, H. A.; Le Pape, Y.; Neithalath, N.; Bauchy, M.; Israelachvili, J.; Sant, G. Role of Electrochemical Surface Potential and Irradiation on GarnetType Almandine's Dissolution Kinetics. J. Phys. Chem. C 2018, 122, 17268-17277.
(75) Hsiao, Y.-H.; Wang, B.; La Plante, E. C.; Pignatelli, I.; Krishnan, N. M. A.; Le Pape, Y.; Neithalath, N.; Bauchy, M.; Sant, G. The Effect of Irradiation on the Atomic Structure and Chemical Durability of Calcite and Dolomite. npj Mater. Degrad. 2019, 3, 1-9.
(76) Stumm, W.; Morgan, J. J. Aquatic Chemistry: Chemical Equilibria and Rates in Natural Waters; John Wiley \& Sons, 2012; Vol. 126.
(77) Smyth, J. R. Electrostatic Characterization of Oxygen Sites in Minerals. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 1989, 53, 1101-1110.
(78) Brady, P. V.; Walther, J. V. Controls on Silicate Dissolution Rates in Neutral and Basic PH Solutions at $25{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 1989, 53, 2823-2830.
(79) Oey, T.; Frederiksen, K. F.; Mascaraque, N.; Youngman, R.; Balonis, M.; Smedskjaer, M. M.; Bauchy, M.; Sant, G. The Role of the Network-Modifier's Field-Strength in the Chemical Durability of Aluminoborate Glasses. J. Non-Cryst. Solids 2019, 505, 279-285.
(80) Oey, T.; La Plante, E. C.; Falzone, G.; Yang, K.; Wada, A.; Bauchy, M.; Bullard, J. W.; Sant, G. Topological Controls on Aluminosilicate Glass Dissolution: Complexities Induced in Hyperalkaline Aqueous Environments. J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 2020, 103, 61986207.
(81) Hamilton, J. P.; Pantano, C. G.; Brantley, S. L. Dissolution of Albite Glass and Crystal. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 2000, 64, 26032615.
(82) Oey, T.; Timmons, J.; Stutzman, P.; Bullard, J. W.; Balonis, M.; Bauchy, M.; Sant, G. An Improved Basis for Characterizing the Suitability of Fly Ash as a Cement Replacement Agent. J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 2017, 100, 4785-4800.
(83) Vienna, J. D.; Ryan, J. V.; Gin, S.; Inagaki, Y. Current Understanding and Remaining Challenges in Modeling Long-Term Degradation of Borosilicate Nuclear Waste Glasses. Int. J. Appl. Glass Sci. 2013, 4, 283-294.
(84) Cailleteau, C.; Angeli, F.; Devreux, F.; Gin, S.; Jestin, J.; Jollivet, P.; Spalla, O. Insight into Silicate-Glass Corrosion Mechanisms. Nat. Mater. 2008, 7, 978-983.
(85) Gin, S. Open Scientific Questions about Nuclear Glass Corrosion. Procedia Mater. Sci. 2014, 7, 163-171.
(86) Gin, S.; Jollivet, P.; Fournier, M.; Berthon, C.; Wang, Z.; Mitroshkov, A.; Zhu, Z.; Ryan, J. V. The Fate of Silicon during Glass Corrosion under Alkaline Conditions: A Mechanistic and Kinetic Study with the International Simple Glass. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 2015, 151, 68-85.
(87) Bond Energies. Encyclopedia of Inorganic Chemistry; John Wiley \& Sons, Ltd., 2006.
(88) Brantley, S. L. Kinetics of Mineral Dissolution. In Kinetics of Water-Rock Interaction; Brantley, S. L., Kubicki, J. D., White, A. F., Eds.; Springer: New York, NY, 2008; pp 151-210.
(89) Schott, J.; Berner, R. A.; Sjöberg, E. L. Mechanism of Pyroxene and Amphibole Weathering-I. Experimental Studies of Iron-Free Minerals. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 1981, 45, 2123-2135.
(90) Saldi, G. D.; Köhler, S. J.; Marty, N.; Oelkers, E. H. Dissolution Rates of Talc as a Function of Solution Composition, pH and Temperature. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 2007, 71, 3446-3457.
(91) Engström, F.; Adolfsson, D.; Samuelsson, C.; Sandström, Å.; Björkman, B. A Study of the Solubility of Pure Slag Minerals. Miner. Eng. 2013, 41, 46-52.
(92) Hall, C.; Large, D. J.; Adderley, B.; West, H. M. Calcium Leaching from Waste Steelmaking Slag: Significance of Leachate Chemistry and Effects on Slag Grain Mineralogy. Miner. Eng. 2014, 65, 156-162.
(93) Strandkvist, I.; Björkman, B.; Engström, F. Synthesis and Dissolution of Slag Minerals - a Study of $\beta$-Dicalcium Silicate, Pseudowollastonite and Monticellite. Can. Metall. Q. 2015, 54, 446454.
(94) Inoue, R.; Suito, H. Fluorine-Containing Mineral Phases in Ironmaking and Steelmaking Slags and Their Solubilities in Aqueous Solution. ISIJ Int. 2002, 42, 785-793.
(95) Goff, F.; Guthrie, G.; Bruce, L.; Fite, M.; Chipera, S.; Dale, C.; Kluk, E.; Ziock, H. Evaluation of Ultramafic Deposits in the Eastern United States and Puerto Rico as Sources of Magnesium for Carbon Dioxide Sequestration; LA-13694-MS; 2000.
(96) Worrell, E.; Phylipsen, D.; Einstein, D.; Martin, N. Energy Use and Energy Intensity of the U.S. Chemical Industry; LBNL-44314;

Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory (LBNL): Berkeley, CA, United States, 2000.
(97) Kelemen, P. B.; McQueen, N.; Wilcox, J.; Renforth, P.; Dipple, G.; Vankeuren, A. P. Engineered Carbon Mineralization in Ultramafic Rocks for $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Removal from Air: Review and New Insights. Chem. Geol. 2020, 550, 119628.
(98) Kelemen, P. B.; Matter, J.; Streit, E. E.; Rudge, J. F.; Curry, W. B.; Blusztajn, J. Rates and Mechanisms of Mineral Carbonation in Peridotite: Natural Processes and Recipes for Enhanced, in situ $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Capture and Storage. Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 2011, 39, 545-576. (99) Li, W.; Li, W.; Li, B.; Bai, Z. Electrolysis and Heat Pretreatment Methods to Promote $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Sequestration by Mineral Carbonation. Chem. Eng. Res. Des. 2009, 87, 210-215.
(100) MacDowell, N.; Florin, N.; Buchard, A.; Hallett, J.; Galindo, A.; Jackson, G.; Adjiman, C. S.; Williams, C. K.; Shah, N.; Fennell, P. An Overview of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Capture Technologies. Energy Environ. Sci. 2010, 3, 1645-1669.
(101) Eloneva, S.; Teir, S.; Revitzer, H.; Salminen, J.; Said, A.; Fogelholm, C.-J.; Zevenhoven, R. Reduction of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Emissions from Steel Plants by Using Steelmaking Slags for Production of Marketable Calcium Carbonate. Steel Res. Int. 2009, 80, 415-421.
(102) Rim, G.; Wang, D.; Rayson, M.; Brent, G.; Park, A.-H. A. Investigation on Abrasion versus Fragmentation of the Si -Rich Passivation Layer for Enhanced Carbon Mineralization via $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Partial Pressure Swing. Ind. Eng. Chem. Res. 2020, 59, 6517-6531.
(103) Santos, R. M.; Knops, P. C. M.; Rijnsburger, K. L.; Chiang, Y. W. $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Energy Reactor - Integrated Mineral Carbonation: Perspectives on Lab-Scale Investigation and Products Valorization. Front. Energy Res. 2016, 4, 5.
(104) Liu, M.; Hohenshil, A.; Gadikota, G. Integrated $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Capture and Removal via Carbon Mineralization with Inherent Regeneration of Aqueous Solvents. Energy Fuels 2021, 35, 8051-8068.
(105) U.S. Energy Information Administration. Annual Energy Outlook 2021 Narrative with Projections to 2050: Washington, DC, 2021.
(106) Deutz, S.; Bardow, A. Life-Cycle Assessment of an Industrial Direct Air Capture Process Based on Temperature-Vacuum Swing Adsorption. Nat. Energy 2021, 6, 203-213.
(107) Ji, L.; Yu, H.; Yu, B.; Jiang, K.; Grigore, M.; Wang, X.; Zhao, S.; Li, K. Integrated Absorption-Mineralisation for Energy-Efficient $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Sequestration: Reaction Mechanism and Feasibility of Using Fly Ash as a Feedstock. Chem. Eng. J. 2018, 352, 151-162.
(108) Realmonte, G.; Drouet, L.; Gambhir, A.; Glynn, J.; Hawkes, A.; Köberle, A. C.; Tavoni, M. An Inter-Model Assessment of the Role of Direct Air Capture in Deep Mitigation Pathways. Nat. Commun. 2019, 10, 3277.
(109) McQueen, N.; Kelemen, P.; Dipple, G.; Renforth, P.; Wilcox, J. Ambient Weathering of Magnesium Oxide for $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Removal from Air. Nat. Commun. 2020, 11, 3299.
(110) Nowamooz, A.; Dupuis, J. C.; Beaudoin, G.; Molson, J.; Lemieux, J.-M.; Horswill, M.; Fortier, R.; Larachi, F.; Maldague, X.; Constantin, M.; Duchesne, J.; Therrien, R. Atmospheric Carbon Mineralization in an Industrial-Scale Chrysotile Mining Waste Pile. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2018, 52, 8050-8057.
(111) Khalidy, R.; Santos, R. M. The Fate of Atmospheric Carbon Sequestrated through Weathering in Mine Tailings. Miner. Eng. 2021, 163, 106767.
(112) Myers, C.; Nakagaki, T. Direct Mineralization of Atmospheric $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Using Natural Rocks in Japan. Environ. Res. Lett. 2020, 15, 124018.
(113) Meysman, F. J. R.; Montserrat, F. Negative $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Emissions via Enhanced Silicate Weathering in Coastal Environments. Biol. Lett. 2017, 13, 20160905.
(114) Pan, S.-Y.; Chen, Y.-H.; Fan, L.-S.; Kim, H.; Gao, X.; Ling, T.C.; Chiang, P.-C.; Pei, S.-L.; Gu, G. $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Mineralization and Utilization by Alkaline Solid Wastes for Potential Carbon Reduction. Nat. Sustain. 2020, 3, 399-405.
(115) Renforth, P.; Pogge von Strandmann, P. A. E.; Henderson, G. M. The Dissolution of Olivine Added to Soil: Implications for Enhanced Weathering. Appl. Geochem. 2015, 61, 109-118.
(116) Dieter, C. A.; Maupin, M. A.; Caldwell, R. R.; Harris, M. A.; Ivahnenko, T. I.; Lovelace, J. K.; Barber, N. L.; Linsey, K. S. Estimated Use of Water in the United States in 2015; Circular; USGS Numbered Series 1441; U.S. Geological Survey: Reston, VA, 2018; p 76.
(117) Qi, S. L.; Harris, A. C. Geochemical Database for the Brackish Groundwater Assessment of the United States; U.S. Geological Survey Data Release, 2017.
(118) Jones, E.; Qadir, M.; van Vliet, M. T. H.; Smakhtin, V.; Kang, S.-m. The State of Desalination and Brine Production: A Global Outlook. Sci. Total Environ. 2019, 657, 1343-1356.
(119) Produced Waters - Homepage, USGS: Energy Resources Program. https://energy.usgs.gov/EnvironmentalAspects/ EnvironmentalAspectsofEnergyProductionandUse/ProducedWaters. aspx\#3822110-overview (accessed Apr 4, 2018).
(120) Blondes, M.; Gans, K.; Engle, M.; Kharaka, Y.; Reidy, M.; Saraswathula, V.; Thordsen, J.; Rowan, E.; Morrissey, E. U.S. Geological Survey National Produced Waters Geochemical Database v2.3, 2018.
(121) McDuff, R. E.; Morel, F. M. M. The Geochemical Control of Seawater (Sillen Revisited). Environ. Sci. Technol. 1980, 14, 11821186.
(122) La Plante, E. C.; Simonetti, D. A.; Wang, J.; Al-Turki, A.; Chen, X.; Jassby, D.; Sant, G. N. Saline Water-Based Mineralization Pathway for Gigatonne-Scale $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Management. ACS Sustainable Chem. Eng. 2021, 9, 1073-1089.


[^0]:    Received: February 5, 2021
    Revised: July 20, 2021
    Published: August 4, 2021

