

# Confronting, Investigating, and Learning from Professional Identity Tensions

Lara K.T. Smetana, Ph.D.<sup>a\*</sup> and Ali Kushki, Ed.D.<sup>b</sup>

*<sup>a</sup>School of Education, Loyola University Chicago, Chicago, IL, USA*

*<sup>b</sup>College of Education, Purdue University, West Lafayette, IN, USA*

\*corresponding author

[LSmetana@luc.edu](mailto:LSmetana@luc.edu)

This work was supported by the National Science Foundation under award number 1660794.

## Abstract

Professional identity tensions are a common part of teachers' experience and have been shown to present opportunities for professional growth when approached as a learning opportunity. This study investigated the use of a questionnaire as a tool within an at-tension pedagogical approach. Authors collected data from six teacher candidates enrolled in a 13-month post-baccalaureate teacher preparation program, including written responses to a questionnaire, participant reflection notes, and instructor journals. Analysis focused on identifying the sources of participants' most frequent tensions, their affective and behavioral responses, and their perspectives on the process of reflecting on tensions as a structured part of their preparation program. We found that early, supportive clinical experiences coupled with strategies for supporting productive responses to tensions can promote teacher

## TEACHER TENSIONS

learning. This study contributes to a better understanding of how teacher preparation and induction programs can best support beginning teachers in negotiating professional identity tensions.

Keywords: teacher identity, teacher education, teacher induction, teacher professional learning, professional tensions

### **Introduction**

Teacher identity is how teachers define who they are, who they are becoming, and who they want to be as teachers (Akkerman & Meijer, 2011; Day et al., 2007; Giralt-Romeu et al., 2021). As teachers go through this process of constructing and reconstructing one's professional identity, they often experience struggles and challenges (Beijaard et al., 2004; Pillen et al., 2013a/b; van Rijswijk et al., 2016). It involves finding, and then sustaining a balance between the personal and professional sides of the profession (Leijen et al., 2009; Lipka & Brinthaupt, 1999; Meijer et al., 2014; Rodgers & Scott, 2008) as well as developing coping strategies for dealing with challenges that arise (Kutsyuruba et al., 2019; Sydnor, 2017). Novice teachers encounter new communities, norms, practices, and expectations that may challenge their prior ways of understanding and existing in the world. And yet, it is argued that engaging in this struggle is a critical piece of one's professional learning, and so should be embraced rather than avoided (Alsup, 2006; Hargreaves & Jacka, 1995). Hence, attending to the situations in which challenges arise as well as the affective and behavioural responses to these situations are important (Meijer et al., 2014). Teacher preparation programs especially need to better understand the tensions that teacher candidates face during their preparation and early years of teaching - typically known as induction phase (Antink-Meyer & Brown, 2017), how these manifest (Van der Wal et al., 2019) and change over time (Pillen et al., 2013a; Schapp et al., 2021), and what strategies to supporting beginning teachers spark positive and propelling growth (Day & Gu, 2014; Korthagen, 2013; Leijen et

## TEACHER TENSIONS

al., 2017; Meijer et al., 2014; Sydnor, 2017).

Responding to Sydnor's (2017) call for research into how to simulate the sorts of tensions that beginning teachers will undoubtedly face in the field, this study builds on prior investigations into what is known as an *at-tension* approach (see Meijer et al., 2014). In this approach, teachers are encouraged to reflect upon their professional tensions and responses with a focus on transforming tensions into learning moments. The current study explores the use of case vignettes as a tool that supports an at-tension approach within a graduate secondary teacher education program. We were interested in how the vignettes would prompt candidates' reflection on their clinical field experiences, and what insights would come from examining candidates' experiences. The following research questions guided the analysis:

1. What types of tensions did the vignettes elicit teacher candidates' reflection upon?
2. How did teacher candidates respond to tensions they experienced in their fieldwork?

### ***Sources and impacts of professional identity tensions***

Research by Pillen et al. (2013a) identified common themes in the types of tensions that teachers experience, including a) tensions arising from the change in role from student to teacher, b) tensions resulting from conflicts between desired and actual support given to students, and c) tensions based on differing conceptions of learning to teach. See Table 2. The researchers further reported participants feeling helpless, angry, and frustrated in the face of the tensions they experienced. They concluded that participants felt so because teachers' preparation programs overlooked this aspect of professional identity development, leaving teachers on their own to figure out how to cope. Although these early studies offer insight into the common sources of tensions for early career teachers, more

## TEACHER TENSIONS

studies are needed to explore how these tensions impact beginning teachers' emotions, thinking, and functioning. And, from there, how can teacher educators use this information to better provide opportunities for teacher candidates to think through situations and envision ways to handle them?

Driven by this research gap, Van der Wal et al. (2019) developed a framework for studying the impacts of professional identity tensions. The authors operationalized impact in terms of affective appraisals (emotional effects of tensions) and behavioural responses (ways of dealings with those tensions). Affective appraisals can be low, moderate, and high depending on how strong of a language individuals use to describe tensions as well as how long tensions persist over time and across various situations. Behavioural responses comprise a) reflective behaviour (e.g., cognitively analysing or re-evaluating the experienced situation and/or one's professional identity/self), b) seeking support (e.g., finding someone to bounce ideas off), c) seeking help (e.g., asking others for acting in their place), and d) directive action (e.g., taking new or additional actions to change the tension such as setting stricter rules in the classroom). Employing this framework, Van der Wal and colleagues (2019) provided additional evidence that behavioural responses reflect teachers' affective appraisals. This suggests affective and behavioural responses need to be studied together because professional tensions are multi-dimensional. Furthermore, interactions with others such as teachers and mentors can influence teachers' responses. The present study extends this line of research by examining both what triggers teacher candidates' tensions and how these tensions manifest themselves. This study contributes to understandings of how teacher education and support programs can facilitate beginning teachers' awareness of and negotiation process around these common tensions. The goal is that addressing these

## TEACHER TENSIONS

challenges proactively might help avoid some of the feelings of helplessness that Pillen et al. (2013a/b) found so prominent in novice teachers.

### *Novice Teacher identity*

Akkerman and Meijer's (2011) dialogical approach to the conceptualization of teacher identity explains that beginning teachers are social participants and at the same time autonomous and unique persons. So, identity development is not solely an internal process or entirely determined by one's social and cultural contexts. This conceptualization allows for uncovering the tensions that novice teachers experience as well as teachers' agency in resolving these tensions and thus maintaining a continuous sense of self. The conflicts, tensions, and uncertainties that beginning teachers experience within new professional contexts are considered 'propelling sources of change' (Hong et al., 2017, p. 96) and a key part of the process of 'becoming' a teacher (Smetana & Kushki, 2021). A teacher's identity development is often described as 'identity work' (Cohen, 2010) because it is an active process of building professional self-understanding that involves subjecting one's experiences to reflection and analysis (Meijer et al., 2009).

### *Teacher learning*

Teacher professional learning is about the growth or development of teachers' expertise – including knowledge, beliefs, motivation, skills – that leads to changes in practices that improve student learning outcomes (Opfer & Pedder, 2011; Mankki & Rähkä, 2022). Recent understandings of teacher professional learning and development emphasize the word "learning" and recognize that learning is complex, dynamic, social, and related to practice (Louws et al., 2017; Opfer & Pedder, 2011; Webster & Wright, 2009). Teachers are also viewed as active agents in their own professional learning; they are not 'trained' or 'developed' by an outside other. These

## TEACHER TENSIONS

understandings reject an objectivist epistemology that underlies most traditional professional development activities. An objectivist epistemology suggests that knowledge is a transferable commodity that can be gained – or given for that matter – by taking part in various activities and that one’s identity or expertise development can be studied as a cause-effect variable (Opfer & Pedder, 2011). Rather, teachers’ professional learning is currently viewed as complex and constructed and embedded within authentic professional practice (Webster & Wright, 2009).

Teacher learning is also understood to take place throughout one’s career, yet the needs and thus the learning goals also evolve over the course of one’s career (Durksen et al., 2017; Louws et al., 2017). Researchers have described a continuum of professional life phases that teachers move through as they acquire more experience (Day et al., 2007, Fessler & Rice, 2010) and become more established in their expertise. The literature describes novice teachers, like those participating in this study, as going through a phase of developing their identity and efficacy as a teacher (Day et al., 2007), during which they can especially benefit from learning opportunities related to tensions experienced in practice (Louws et al., 2017).

### *At-tension pedagogy*

Understanding that tensions can be opportunities for learning is foundational to an *at-tension pedagogy* toward professional identity development in novice teachers. This approach, described by Pillen et al. (2013a/b), Meijer et al. (2014), and Leijen et al. (2017), is educative in nature and pivots on transforming tensions into learning moments. It often entails novice teachers reflecting on their own teaching situations and experiences in relation to case studies both individually and through conversations with peers and mentors. The idea is for beginning teachers to surface the kinds of professional tensions they have already experienced or may experience in the

## TEACHER TENSIONS

future, explore the sources of these tensions, and consider different ways of responding or coping. Resolving tensions can result in replacing feelings of ambiguity or uncertainty with a restored sense of control and continuity (Davis et al., 2017; Meijer et al., 2011; Van Rijswijk et al., 2016; Smetana & Kushki, 2021). An at-tension pedagogy allows for what Argyris and Schön (1974) refer to as *double-loop learning*, where the beginning teacher enquires into one's experience such that there is an introspective (re)consideration of underlying assumptions or conditions that will help to prevent future challenges. This is distinct from single-loop learning, where the teacher does not scrutinize underlying assumptions and beliefs.

The literature base provides evidence in support of enacting an at-tension approach. Sydnor (2017) advocates for helping teacher candidates develop and frequently revisit clear, tentative teaching visions since “teachers with clear visions are more likely to feel agency amid a myriad of potential obstacles” (p. 232). Then, they should have opportunities to encounter conflicts to these visions, even if in a simulated way. Alsup (2006) points to the benefits of creating opportunities for cognitive dissonance, where teacher candidates can begin to think through multiple possibilities for obstacles that they may face in enacting their vision. Relatedly, the present study explores one teacher preparation course's incorporation of opportunities for structured reflection on common tensions. Specifically, a questionnaire is used to enact an at-tension pedagogy by prompting candidates' reflection on their clinical field experiences.

## **Materials and Methods**

### ***Context and participants***

## TEACHER TENSIONS

This study is situated within a 13-month graduate level secondary teacher preparation program at a small university in a large urban centre in the United States. Most instructional time in this field-based program takes place in local secondary schools where teacher candidates and faculty work in partnership with teachers and other educational professionals who are positioned as co-teacher educators. Participants spent three mornings a week in partner secondary classrooms for one semester as part of a methods courses prior to beginning a six-month student teaching placement. This extensive field work allowed for both early exposure to, and extended opportunities to reflect upon, professional identity tensions. Participants of the study were selected as a subset of the larger secondary education program and were enrolled in the same section of the methods course and clinical practicum. The authors purposefully selected this subset because their course focused on professional identity tensions. The course instructor was interested in exploring an at-tension pedagogical approach within the course, and thus was open to collaborating on administering a questionnaire designed for this purpose. The three female and three male, white teacher candidate participants had a similar trajectory into teaching in that all entered the masters in secondary education program immediately after completing undergraduate degrees their respective content areas.

Table 1. Participants.

<b>Pseudonym</b>	<b>Gender</b>	<b>Race</b>
TC1	Male	White
TC2	Female	White
TC3	Female	White
TC4	Male	White



## TEACHER TENSIONS

TC5	Female	While
TC6	Male	White

### *Data sources*

While others have used open-ended reflection prompts inviting participants to share any sources of professional tensions that they recall experiencing (e.g., Van der Wal et al., 2019), we felt that the teacher candidates would benefit from some example scenarios to develop their understanding of what was meant by professional tensions. Thus, we created a modified version of the questionnaire developed by Pillen et al. (2013a) that probed participants' experiences with 13 different scenarios that depicted common professional tensions novice teachers faced. Our modified questionnaire included the original vignettes that participants are asked whether they relate to and recognise their own situation in. Additionally, our modified version allowed for open-ended responses to follow-up questions about how participants coped with a given situation. This modification was deemed important for this study because we were interested in more than what scenarios individuals related to. We also wanted to understand why participants related to the vignettes, including if the tensions they experienced were indeed the same sort of tensions that the vignettes were mapped to, and the affective and behavioural responses.

Data were primarily collected during the semester prior to student teaching, as part of a methods course and clinical practicum course. Participants were provided with some background to the meaning of professional tensions, and then asked which of the scenarios, if any, described a situation that they themselves could relate to. For any situation that participants felt they could relate to,

## TEACHER TENSIONS

they explained their experience, described how they responded and any resolution they found. Participants were also invited to submit other examples of professional tensions they experienced that might not have been covered by the example scenarios. Finally, they were asked to reflect on the experience of completing the questionnaire. Observation notes taken by the instructor of the practicum class provided contextual data about the practicum placements as well as the spaces, relationships, and interactions relevant to the tensions participants identified and responses mentioned.

### *Data analysis*

Research question one investigated the types of tensions candidates experienced. Since each vignette in Pillen et al.'s (2013a) original questionnaire was developed to illustrate a particular professional tension, we were interested in the types of tensions the questionnaire prompts would elicit the most responses. We were also interested in *why* participants identified with a given prompt – that is, the situations they had experienced, and that a given prompt reminded them of. The modifications on our questionnaire allowed for this by including a space for an open-ended response. We utilized Pillen et al.'s (2013) framework to code for the sources of professional tensions, as shown in Table 2.

Per the second question - how teacher candidates responded to experienced tensions - we followed Van der Wal and colleagues' (2019) framework to also code for the ways tensions affected participants. The final coding scheme for manifestations of professional identity tensions is outlined in Table 3.

Table 2. Coding scheme for sources of professional identity tensions.

---

**Sources of Professional Identity Tensions** (adapted from Pillen et al., 2013a)

---

## TEACHER TENSIONS

Theme	Tension	Description
Changing role from student to teacher	Responsibility	Realizing extent of job responsibilities can be overwhelming
	Confidence	Doubts in one's confidence as a teacher, including doubt about content and pedagogical content knowledge
	Authority Role	Wanting to be fun, friendly versus feeling expected to be tough, strict Feeling like a peer or a student but expected or wanting to take on responsibility as a teacher
Conflicts between desired and actual support for students	Care	Concern with the well-being of one's students and having trouble maintaining an emotional distance
Conflicting conceptions about teaching	Perceptions	One's feelings, values, beliefs about teaching differ from those of the school or the mentor
	Relations	Challenges negotiating professional relationships with colleagues

Table 3. Coding scheme for manifestations of professional identity tensions.

<b>Manifestations of Professional Identity Tensions</b> (adapted from Van Der Wal et al., 2019)	
Code	Description
<i>Affective Appraisal:</i> (Low – Moderate - High)	Emotional effects of a tension; ranges from low, moderate, high impact on one's work and private life. <i>Low</i> – limited to a short time, no effect on daily functioning or well-being at work <i>Moderate</i> – affect lasts longer than the initial situation; limited to well-being at work, no profound effect on personal life

## TEACHER TENSIONS

---

	<i>High</i> – effects well-being at work and also spills into personal life
<i>Behavioural Response:</i> Reflection	Way of dealing with a tension: cognitively analyses or re-evaluates oneself and/or the situation
<i>Behavioural Response:</i> Support Seeking	Way of dealing with a tension: shares the experience and seeks emotional support from peers
<i>Behavioural Response:</i> Help Seeking	Way of dealing with a tension: asking others for practical advice in addressing the situation
<i>Behavioural Response:</i> Directive Action	Way of dealing with a tension: taking specific action to address the tension; being proactive to prevent future situations related to the tension

---

To further investigate how others responded to the activity, we also engaged in open coding of all questionnaire responses and observation notes (Charmaz, 2008) in search of reactions to the formal process of completing the questionnaire as well as to more informal reflection processes such as talking through professional tensions during class discussions.

Throughout the analysis process, the researchers separately reviewed one participant's data set and then convened to discuss. Initial analyses of the common data set were shared and compared for reliability checks. After consensus was reached, the remaining data were codified independently by the researchers, who continued to meet regularly to discuss analysis memos, coding decisions, reflections, and questions. The few points of disagreement were discussed and resolved. Adherence to authentic quotes drawn from the data contributed to the study's internal validity.

## TEACHER TENSIONS

### **Findings**

#### ***Common types of tensions***

In response to the first research question, this section reports on the types of tensions the questionnaire prompts elicited reflection upon, with a focus on those tensions that emerged as being the most often identified with by participants in this study. At least one participant identified with eight of the thirteen vignettes prompts. Four vignette prompts elicited the most responses amongst the participants in this study, as shown in Table 4. Five out of six participants related to a prompt that described a tension arising from wanting to be a fun, friendly, caring teacher yet also feeling expected to be tough and strict (Authority). Doubting one's competence and ability as a teacher was another common source of tension that emerged for five out of six participants (Confidence). Tensions arising from concerns about the well-being of students and having trouble in maintaining an emotional distance (Care) also resonated with five out of six participants. Four participants identified with tensions arising from feeling overwhelmed by realizing the full extent and attempting to balance one's job responsibilities (Responsibility).

Although each prompt in Pillen et al.'s (2013a) original questionnaire was mapped to a particular type of tension commonly experienced, the modified version of the questionnaire used in this study allowed for more nuanced insights to emerge from the analysis of participants' reflections upon the specific situations or experiences that the vignettes reminded them of. These findings are shared in the subsequent section.

Table 4. Professional tensions and the extent to which participants related to each questionnaire prompts

## TEACHER TENSIONS

<b>Tension</b>	<b>Vignette Prompt</b>	<b>Number of Responses</b>
Authority	Nicole needs to be strict with her students to keep order in the classroom. That is difficult because she wants students to like her and wants to foster a good atmosphere in the classroom. Nicole wants her students to feel that she is there for them but that does not go along with being strict.	5/6
Confidence	Mike's subject is physics. He thinks that his students expect him to have more knowledge about physics than he has. He does not know what to do about that.	5/6
Care	Howard is very concerned about his students' well-being. He has hard time accepting that he is not capable of helping his students in the way he [feels he] should be to fulfil their needs.	5/6
Responsibility	Arnold just started to work as a teacher, and he is wondering whether he can be a good teacher. He experiences problems because he does not have enough time to accomplish all his tasks well.	4/6

### *Impacts and responses*

The second research question explored how participants were affectively influenced by various types of tensions (affective appraisal) as well as how they dealt with a given tension (behavioural response). Analysis indicated that candidates experienced low to moderate affective impacts overall; they did not report any high affective appraisals.

At this early practicum stage, the teacher candidates felt a bit overwhelmed as they “realized how time-consuming planning a lesson truly is. I am sure with more practice this will become easier and easier, but I am still having a hard time understanding how I will successfully plan and teach multiple classes every day” (TC3). Take TC5's Confidence tension, described below:

## TEACHER TENSIONS

The first lesson I taught at Practicum School did not go well. I was very nervous, and I had not prepared well enough, and the students could clearly sense my nervousness and were fairly rowdy and distracted that entire lesson. I managed to make my way through teaching that first lesson, but I never wanted to feel that out of control of my students again... The next lesson I taught I made sure to plan my lesson much more thoroughly and found that after the initial [failed] lesson I was more comfortable teaching a classroom [of secondary students].

In this low affective instance, TC5 is realizing some of her nervousness and shortcomings as a teacher candidate unfamiliar with the curriculum and the level of planning required for teaching a lesson that she will need to work on to build confidence and be effective as an educator. TC5 experienced a degree of uncomfortable chaos that was productive in that it was strong enough to draw her attention to something she needed to work on but not debilitating since it was contained to one lesson that she was guest teaching in her mentor's classroom that day. TC5 was able to admit her weaknesses and see her failure in this instance as an important learning opportunity.

Similarly, TC6 found that the experience of encountering a confidence tension to be an important turning point in his learning: In my classroom experience there have been a few times where I forgot a really basic, simple content understanding and had to admit that I didn't know it off the top of my head to the students. It was embarrassing the first time and I felt silly standing up in front of a class as the 'expert' and not knowing something I should. I felt like an imposter. The second time it happened however, I realized that I'm going to forget things all the time and my own knowledge base is extremely incomplete and not fresh when it comes to high school [secondary] sciences. Being vulnerable in that way helped me to connect with my students

## TEACHER TENSIONS

when it happened the second time. I feel like it made me more human to them and by doing that it felt more like we were working together to come to an understanding of the content rather than me simply telling them.

Like TC5, TC6 felt a degree of productive uncomfortableness during his early teaching experiences, this time with a realization about his degree of content expertise within the context of a particular lesson and the ability to recall information he felt he should have known. These two passages reiterate the benefits of the low-stakes practicum experience which in many ways served as a trial of sorts with much opportunity for reflection. It afforded candidates the time and space to experience and work through tensions early in their career. The challenges are experienced like an organic feature of their preparation and one that will prime them for the future.

The behavioural responses spanned all four categories. In most instances, there were multiple behavioural responses recorded to a given vignette, as illustrated in the following example coded as an authority tension. Here, tension arises from TC1 desiring to find a balance between being both tough and friendly, and becoming envious of the mentor teacher who had already managed to do so. Both of these were common themes in this study's data overall. TC1 shared:

I have been observing Mr. X's intro [level] classroom and I had not introduced myself to the students until the second or third week of observations. Since I look older than Mr. X, with whom these students have a wonderful rapport, I got the impression that I was perceived as an older, stricter educator that was there to provide lessons that they had to listen to. To cope with this tension, I talked to Mr. X as well as my peers. My peers expressed similar concerns, but they seemed to have better relationships overall with their students. Mr. X advised me to get to know the student individually, which I found hard to do as



## TEACHER TENSIONS

my only time there was as an observer. My current fix for this tension has been to work on my memory of each student and provide as beneficial and individual help as I can when I am not implementing a lesson.

In this example of a low affective appraisal tension, TC1 finds himself struggling to build genuine relationships with students, who have a more natural relationship with the mentor teacher. He is troubled both with his own struggle but also with the comparison to the more experienced teacher. He brings this issue of student relationships up with his peers (support seeking behavioural response) and later also seeks out directly actionable suggestions from his mentor teacher (help seeking behavioural response). He finds the mentor's advice challenging to implement at first because he felt he had limited opportunities to get to know students when he was only in the classroom for a short time. However, he eventually takes another direct action by implementing a modification of his mentor's advice to get to know students individually, committing to study up on each of the students by using the interest forms they provided the teachers at the start of the year. This action incorporated the insight gained from his peers who he felt had succeeded in building stronger student relationships. This highlights the reality of compounded tensions – the tension itself and then a subsequent tension that emerges when working to overcome the original tension which may take multiple attempts and varied approaches. Tensions may not be fully resolved on the first try.

Overall, reflection and support seeking behavioural responses were the most common. This is perhaps not surprising given the design of the practicum course. The course and the instructor emphasized regular reflection through journaling and through discussions with peers. The instructor explained that candidates would go to their partner classrooms and then meet immediately after together as a group.

## TEACHER TENSIONS

We would just start off with a quick check in – “How are you doing”? I never started with the heavy stuff. I gave them time to release what they were carrying in, some were venting, some were very positive. And then we’d get into the topic of the day.

At the end of class, they had class time to complete or at least start on the weekly reflections. I think they appreciated that time to collect their thoughts. Just being able to articulate their thoughts prior to leaving the classroom.

Here, the mix of structured and unstructured reflection allowed for developing the sorts of relationships that could lend help and support when tensions arose as well as individual processing of challenging situations.

Analysis of participants’ reflections revealed that most had not previously stopped to consider their experiences in a structured and deliberate manner. As TC6 shared, “This activity had me think deeper than any other activity we’ve done in the program. I explored parts of my experiences that I hadn’t delved deep into in the past and really spent time thinking about how I feel about my experiences so far.” Here, TC6 indicates that the questionnaire and reflection activities were unfamiliar yet welcomed because they prompted teacher candidates to consider their past experiences not solely in terms of the events that took place but also in terms of how those events made them feel and the affective response(s) evoked. Similarly, TC5 offered, “This exercise was really helpful and getting me to reflect around my fears of teaching as a whole and come to terms with how I handle them.” Here, TC5 articulates how participants used the activity to lean into their fears and think through intimidating situations as opposed to ignoring or avoiding them.

Data from participant journals and instructor observation notes also suggested the group enjoyed a strong, supportive relationship, which may have further encouraged participants to want to bring their tensions to the group to discuss. ‘This group had become friends, you could tell, [they were] tight-knit,’ the instructor noted. Help-seeking responses referenced the instructor at times,

## TEACHER TENSIONS

and mentor teachers at other times. Overall, it is positive that the data indicated candidates felt they had sufficient resources to turn to for help and advice.

Although there were limited opportunities for candidates to act on many of the tensions because of their role as teacher candidates in a practicum course as opposed to having the role of lead classroom teacher, direct action emerged as one of the behavioural responses to most tensions. This finding again points to the positive relationships that candidates enjoyed with their peers, instructor and mentor that paved the way for candidates to share and troubleshoot challenges collectively, resulting in more confidence and inspiration to cope.

### **Discussion**

This study explored novice teachers' professional identity tensions and their affective and behavioural responses to those tensions using a questionnaire tool as part of an at-tension approach (see Meijer et al., 2014) that focused on transforming tensions into productive professional learning opportunities. The modified version of Pillen et al.'s (2013a) questionnaire effectively prompted critical reflection about situations that novice teachers have often found difficult. We added open-ended response questions to the original questionnaire and integrated it into the practicum class's regular reflection routine. This encouraged teacher candidates to think more thoroughly about a) their practicum experiences working in secondary classrooms, b) how they felt and responded in challenging situations, c) the underlying sources of those situations, and d) what they discovered about themselves and their evolving teaching practice.

### ***Types of tensions experienced by teacher candidates***

## TEACHER TENSIONS

Out of the 13 vignettes in the questionnaire, the four prompts that elicited reflection from nearly all participants concerned tensions around classroom authority, teacher confidence, care for students, and responsibility. While these outcomes would likely differ for other groups of teacher candidates, knowing that these were the four most experienced types of tensions for this group means that practicum coursework can be adapted to take these into greater consideration and experiences can be designed to help teacher candidates anticipate and navigate the tensions that are most relevant to them. In the case of this cohort, for instance, learning activities on the topic of students' and teachers' social-emotional wellness were added to subsequent coursework because of the findings. Lessons focused on classroom management also included conversations around finding a balance of classroom authority. From a more general standpoint, the vignette prompts featured in the questionnaire can also be shared with those who mentor novice teachers such that they too can better anticipate the sorts of tensions that novice teachers commonly encounter. With this in mind, we briefly discuss the four most common tensions that emerged in this study below.

### *Authority*

Authority related tensions were commonly experienced amongst the participants of this study and are also amongst the most common tensions appearing in the literature (Pillen et al., 2013a/b). Classroom management is often cited as 'a characteristic stumbling block for beginning teachers' (Wolff et al., 2015, p.70) who typically lack preparation and support in this area (Dugas, 2016; Podolsky et al., 2016). Classroom management encompasses a broad range of actions that a teacher takes to create and maintain an effective learning environment so that learning can be maximized (Wolff et al., 2015). Traditional, behaviouralist approaches have equated classroom

## TEACHER TENSIONS

management with discipline, prioritizing compliance, classroom order, and academic issues over building relationships with students and proactively establishing supportive and restorative classroom norms (Smith et al., 2015). It is common for beginning teachers to feel nervous about how to assert their authority in the classroom in a way that earns student respect but does not jeopardize forming positive relationships with students (Shapira-Lishchinsky, 2011; Volkmann & Anderson, 1998). Findings from this study suggest that professional learning focused on classroom management might include conversations around finding a balance of classroom authority.

### *Confidence*

In this study, we also saw how candidates felt frustrated when comparing themselves to their mentor teachers, both in relation to how they approached classroom management as well as how they approached the content . This self-comparison is not fair, of course, given that the mentor teachers were more experienced teachers with more extensive practical knowledge and a deeper set of prior classroom experiences with the student population, classroom, and school to draw upon (Wolff et al., 2015). Self-criticism is recognized a common obstacle to healthy professional identity development (Nickel & Crosby, 2021). However, recent research by Gray and Seiki (2020) suggests that beginning teachers can benefit from knowing that the tensions they face are common amongst others in similar positions, which can help them hold a more developmentally appropriate picture of what they can expect of themselves as novice teachers.

### *Care*

Individuals who see their teaching as a mission often feel tremendous care and concern for their students (Schatz-Oppenheimer & Dvir, 2014). Teachers, and especially novice teachers, may find motivation and satisfaction from the humanistic sides of teaching, and

## TEACHER TENSIONS

experience joy from making connections with students (Taxer et al., 2018). They may also experience frustration, exhaustion, anxiety, and disappointment from the relational side of the work (Isenbarger & Zembylas, 2006). In the current study, most participants experienced a care-related tension arising from wanting to offer emotional, supportive, and loving care to their students. Considering impacts of these tensions, candidate responses to the vignette questionnaire suggested that they were also beginning to realize that even if they cannot satisfy an expressed need due to lack of resources or authority of knowledge, they can still maintain a caring relation with students (Noddings, 2012). These findings suggest that helping candidates to reflect on the ethical and emotional nature of teachers' work (Hargreaves, 1998; O'Connor, 2008) early on in their preparation may help ensure that they avoid burnout in the future.

### *Responsibility*

Practice-based teacher education offer candidates a glimpse into the day-to-day responsibilities of teachers (Grossman et al., 2009). Clinical fieldwork and the associated realization of the full scope of job responsibilities was somewhat eye-opening for some participants in this study. Nickel and Crosby (2021) similarly report on self-criticism amongst beginning teachers and propose that connecting with others for advice and collaboration may help novice teachers to resist this tendency. Teachers who typically strive for perfection may need to reassess the expectations they held for themselves to make sure they are realistic. Jones (2016) defines perfectionism as 'the tendency to pursue idealized standards' (p. 438) and recommends teacher educators remind candidates that 'long-term, expert teachers regularly confront problems that are difficult for them to solve' (p. 438).

### *Compounded tensions*

## TEACHER TENSIONS

This study's modified questionnaire with open-ended responses uncovered nuanced understandings about the types of tensions teacher candidates experienced. This includes the revelation of compounded tensions, or examples where, while working to resolve an initial tension, a subsequent tension emerges. This study illustrates how resolution may not always be found through one attempt or a single approach. Future studies that map out the progression, manifestation and resolution of compounded tensions would be fascinating.

### *Attending to teacher candidate responses to tensions*

The vignettes in this study served as a tool for an at-tension, teacher-focused approach to professional learning that encouraged participants to consider and clarify core components of their identity, which brings together personal aspects (i.e., perspectives and beliefs on teaching and learning) and professional aspects (i.e., knowledge, skills, dispositions) of becoming a teacher. Each vignette prompt described a situation wherein teacher candidates' actions did not align with the ideals they had for themselves, resulting in tension (Nickel & Crosby, 2021). The open-ended follow-up questions to each vignette added as a modification to the questionnaire in this study allowed for further insight into candidates' experiences. This is valuable from a research perspective. Through the analysis of these responses, it was possible to gain a more nuanced understanding about participants reasons for identifying with a given vignette, and on the sources and impacts of their tensions, beyond simply stating that they could or could not relate to the vignette. In doing so, this study is one of few that has investigated how professional tensions manifest, particularly in teacher candidates. Additional research that employs Van der Wal et al.'s (2019) framework for studying the impacts of professional identity tensions is needed, including how teachers at varying stages of their initial preparation and career are affectively influenced by various types of tensions (affective appraisals) and how they deal with these tensions (behavioural responses). Similarly, some trends are beginning to

## TEACHER TENSIONS

emerge about the interplay between affective appraisals and behavioural responses (see Shapp et al., 2021), but more research here is needed.

The addition of open-ended follow-up questions was also valuable for the candidates as part of an at-tension pedagogical approach as it promoted what Schön (1983) describes as a ‘reflective conversation with the situation’ (p. 295). That is, it prompted participants to consider their own teaching situations and the struggles they encountered as opportunities to learn from. The space and structure for this sort of reflection was new for most candidates, and welcomed.

There was also evidence of the sort of introspective looking into one’s experience and the underlying conditions of the experiences that are characteristic of double-loop learning (Argyris & Schön, 1974). That is, participants used the activity to lean into their fears and think through intimidating situations as opposed to ignoring or avoiding them. Double-loop learning encourages vulnerability as a part of one’s inquiry and reflection (Argyris, 2002). In their questionnaire responses, all participants shared examples in which they openly admitted personal and professional weaknesses and goals for making change going forward. While most of these responses captured a degree of self-doubt, they also captured a degree of growing self-assurance as candidates recognized the opportunity for professional learning and planned for what they could do differently next time. Even if candidates had not taken direct action in the moment to resolve a particular tension, they took a degree of responsibility for their learning and identity development by reflecting on what took place and speculating about what they might do in the future.

The sort of reflection that took place with the questionnaire in this study is an important aspect of professional learning and professional identity work, which ‘requires cognitive and emotional involvement of teachers, individually and collectively, the



## TEACHER TENSIONS

capacity and willingness to examine where each one stands in terms of convictions and beliefs and the perusal and enactment of appropriate alternatives for improvement or change' (Avalos, 2011, p. 10). Engaging in this identity work of confronting challenges and approaching tensions as identity development and professional learning opportunities is also understood as crucial to teacher retention (Schapp et al., 2021). Kutsyuruba et al. (2019) point specifically to the importance of teachers committing to reflective practices, nurturing a positive mindset, and connecting with others for advice and collaboration. Additional research is needed to explore not only the sources and manifestations of tensions, but the processes that support teachers' negotiation of tensions.

### ***Learning environments for supporting teacher professional learning and identity work***

It is understood that teachers create meaning for their 'self' in and through their lived relations with others (Akkerman & Meijer, 2011). This study contributes to a better understanding the relationship between tensions, responses, and the contexts in which these tensions occur, and are negotiated and deconstructed (Pillen et al., 2013a/b; Schapp et al., 2021; Van der Wal et al., 2019). Findings suggest that the severity of affective responses is at least in part a function of the context in which tensions arise.

The strong trend toward low affective appraisal in this study may be related to participants being in the practicum stage of their program, as opposed to being in student teaching or fully in charge of the classroom. Teacher candidates faced challenging situations within a low-stakes clinical placement in which they had limited and clearly defined roles in the classroom. Rather than being overwhelmed by the difficulties, the situations proved to be full of learning potential within the at-tension pedagogical approach. Findings suggest that the low-stakes practicum experience served as a trial of sorts , and thus candidates were more likely to experience the tensions as manageable. Moreover, candidates felt comfortable sharing challenges as they arose with their mentor

## TEACHER TENSIONS

teachers and university instructor to seek help and advice, and with peers for emotional support and reassurance. The challenges are experienced like an organic feature of teachers' preparation and one that will prime them for the future. This finding aligns with other recent research that also demonstrated the potential of informal and collaborative learning as part of novice teacher support programs (Van der Wal et al., 2019). The protected atmosphere of the clinical placement in this study is in some ways like the working environment of the first-year teachers studied by Schapp et al. (2021), who were found to report overall lower impacts from the tensions they experienced than the second-year teachers studied.

It should be noted that this does not mean the literature suggests avoiding conflict. Rather, early career teachers need to be supported in the face of conflict. Findings of the current study contrast those of Saka et al. (2013), where the focal novice teacher was found to 'avoid situations in which his perceived inadequacies would become apparent and precluded a search for outside ideas or assistance' (p.1241), leaving him distraught and frustrated. This teacher would have benefited from a professional community of learners like the one identified in this study that allowed for recognition and unpacking of the sorts of difficulties that are so common in the first years of teaching. Supportive communities of learners are essential for an at-tension approach. Such communities allow teachers to collaborate and 'provide the safety to bring in one's real concerns and feelings' (Korthagen, 2017, p. 399) and 'augment beginning teachers' professional capacity' (Kutsyuruba et al., 2019, p. 292). Just as attention to teachers' professional identity needs to be prioritized along with knowledge and skills development (Izadinia, 2013), the social and inspiration facets of teacher learning are as integral as the more technical and/or measurable dimensions (Anderson & Olsen, 2006; Korthagen, 2013).

### **Limitations**

## TEACHER TENSIONS

This study's small sample size allowed for deep exploration of participants' experiences and context but was not intended to produce generalizable results. Similarly, while the tensions described in the questionnaire proved to be relevant to the participants of this and previous studies by Van der Wal et al. (2019) and Pillen et al. (2013a/b), future research is needed with teachers from additional and varied racial, ethnic, geographical, language, and other backgrounds. Comparative studies exploring how teachers from varied contexts (regions, educational systems, types of teacher education programs, etc.) experience and respond to tensions is of interest. Further, as secondary instructional settings shift to include a mix of in-person and remote learning following the COVID-19 pandemic, research is needed into the unique tensions that arise within these unique learning contexts. Since these recent scenarios were new to both novice and veteran teachers, new vignettes can be created about the unique challenges that arise within remote learning situations and then be similarly incorporated into an at-tension approach within initial teacher preparation and continued professional learning.

The modified questionnaire used in this study with the addition of open-ended follow-up questions is considered an improvement over the original questionnaire and a productive course assignment, as discussed above. However, future research should consider the addition of interviews that can further probe participants' thinking and follow up on their written responses. Given that this study along with prior research by Lecat et al. (2018), Van der Wal et al. (2019) and Schaap et al. (2021) suggest there may be a benefit to informal group learning activities that facilitate beginning teachers seeking support from others, future research could also consider utilizing focus groups in both formal and informal support initiatives. Transcripts of the reflective dialogues occurring in these settings would be ripe for analysis of participants' challenges, impacts, and the ensuing learning from reflecting on the experiences as part of a group.

## TEACHER TENSIONS

### **Conclusion**

Initial teacher education programs are deemed one of the most important stages in one's ongoing professional learning and identity development (Grossman et al., 2009; Izadinia, 2013). This is where teachers examine their beliefs, priorities, and goals and experiment with strategies and coping mechanisms for resolving challenges (Schatz-Oppenheimer & Dvir, 2014). In doing so, they build greater self-understanding and choices are made more consciously (Kelchtermans et al., 2018). Findings of the present study reiterate the importance of providing early and authentic teaching experiences and supportive learning contexts in which novice teachers can encounter but not be overwhelmed by the sorts of challenging situations that are common to novice teachers. Moreover, they need time and space for individual and group reflection in which they feel comfortable being vulnerable and challenges are approached as learning opportunities (Marco-Bujosa et al., 2019; Meijer et al., 2011, 2014). It is within this type of supportive context that vignettes coupled with reflection can be used as part of an at-tension approach (Meijer et al., 2014) to facilitate double-loop learning (Argyris & Schön, 1974) in which the sources and impacts of common tensions are confronted, investigated, and learned from. Given the connections that have been increasingly drawn between teacher reflection and resilience (Kutsyuruba et al., 2019; Le Cornu, 2009; Leroux & Théorêt, 2014), tools and approaches such as the ones examined in this study deserve further attention.

## References

- Akkerman, S. F., & Meijer, P. C. (2011). A dialogical approach to conceptualizing teacher identity. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 27(2), 308–319. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2010.08.013>
- Alsop, J. (2006). *Teacher identity discourses: Negotiating personal and professional spaces*. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781410617286>
- Anderson, L., & Olsen, B. (2006). Investigating early career urban teachers' perspectives on and experiences in professional development. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 57(4), 359–377. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487106291565>
- Antink-Meyer, A., & Brown, R. A. (2017). Second-career science teachers' classroom conceptions of science and engineering practices examined through the lens of their professional histories. *International Journal of Science Education*, 39(11), 1511–1528. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09500693.2017.1338787>
- Argyris, C. (2002). Double-Loop Learning, Teaching, and Research. *Academy of Management Learning & Education*, 1(2), 206–218. <https://doi.org/10.5465/AMLE.2002.8509400>
- Argyris, C., & Schön, D. (1974). *Theory in practice: Increasing professional effectiveness*. Jossey-Bass Publishers. <https://www.wiley.com/en-ie/Theory+in+Practice:+Increasing+Professional+Effectiveness-p-9781555424466>
- Avalos, B. (2011). Teacher professional development in teaching and teacher education over ten years. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 27(1), 10-20. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2010.08.007>
- Beijaard, D. & Meijer, P. (2017). Developing the personal and professional in making a teacher identity. In D. J. Clandinin & J. Husu (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of research on teacher education* (Vol. 2, pp. 177-192). SAGE Publications Ltd. <https://sk.sagepub.com/reference/the-sage-handbook-of-research-on-teacher-education>
- Beijaard, D., Meijer, P. C., & Verloop, N. (2004). Reconsidering research on teachers' professional identity. *Teacher and Teacher Education*, 20(2), 107–128. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2003.07.001>
- Charmaz, K. (2008). Constructionism and the grounded theory. In J. A. Holstein & J. F. Gubrium (Eds.), *Handbook of constructionist research* (pp. 397–412). The Guilford Press. <https://www.guilford.com/books/Handbook-of-Constructionist-Research/Holstein-Gubrium/9781593853051>
- Cohen, J. (2010). Getting recognized: Teachers negotiating professional identities as learners through talk. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 26 (3). 473-481. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2009.06.005>
- Davis, T. R., Sydnor, J., Daley, S., & Coggin, L. (2017). Purposeful tensions: Lessons learned from metaphors in teacher candidates' digital stories. *The Teacher Educator*, 52(4), 291–307. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08878730.2017.1343883>
- Day, C., & Gu, Q. (2014). *Resilient teachers, resilient schools: Building and sustaining quality in testing times*. Routledge. <https://www.routledge.com/Resilient-Teachers-Resilient-Schools-Building-and-sustaining-quality-in/Day-Gu/p/book/9780415818957>

## TEACHER TENSIONS

- Day, C., P. Sammons, G. Stobart, A. Kington, and Q. Gu. 2007. *Teachers matter: Connecting work, lives and effectiveness*. Open University Press.
- Dugas, D. (2016). The ineffectiveness of “effective” management strategies: First-year teachers, behavior management, and identity. *Action in Teacher Education*, 38(1), 18–33. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01626620.2015.1078754>
- Durksen, T. L., R. M. Klassen, and L. M. Daniels. 2017. Motivation and collaboration: The keys to a developmental framework for teachers’ professional learning. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 67, 53–66. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2017.05.011>.
- Giralt-Romeu, M., Liesa, E. & Castelló, M. (2021). Teacher identity as inquirer: Voices of teacher educators, *European Journal of Teacher Education*. 10.1080/02619768.2021.2015319
- Gray, P. L., & Seiki, S. (2020) Institutional performativity pressure and first-year teachers. *Frontiers in Education*, 5(71). <https://doi.org/10.3389/educ.2020.00071>
- Grossman, P., Hammerness, K., & McDonald, M. (2009). Redefining teaching, re-imagining teacher education. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 15(2), 273–289. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540600902875340>
- Hargreaves, A., & Jacka, N. (1995). Induction or seduction? Postmodern patterns of preparing to teach. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 70(3), 41–63. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01619569509538834>
- Hargreaves. (1998). The emotional practice of teaching. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 14(8), 835–854. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0742-051X\(98\)00025-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0742-051X(98)00025-0)
- Hong, J., Greene, B., & Lowery, J. (2017). Multiple dimensions of teacher identity development from pre-service to early years of teaching: A longitudinal study. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 43(1), 84–98. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02607476.2017.1251111>
- Izadinia, M. (2013). A review of research on student teachers’ professional identity. *British Educational Research Journal*, 39(4), 694–713. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24464790>
- Isenbarger, L. & Zembylas, M. (2006). The emotional labour of caring in teaching. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 22(1), 120–134. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2005.07.002>
- Jones, B. (2016). Enduring in an “impossible” occupation: Perfectionism and commitment to teaching. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 67(5), 437–446. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487116668021>
- Kelchtermans, G., Smith, K., & Vanderlinde, R. (2018). Towards an “international forum for teacher educator development”: an agenda for research and action. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 41(1), 120–134. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2017.1372743>
- Korthagen, F. A. J. (2013). The core reflection approach. In F. A. J. Korthagen, M. K. Younghee, & W. L. Green (Eds.), *Teaching and learning from within: A core reflection approach to quality and inspiration in education* (pp. 24–41). Routledge.

<https://www.routledge.com/Teaching-and-Learning-from-Within-A-Core-Reflection-Approach-to-Quality/Korthagen-Kim-Greene/p/book/9780415522489>

- Korthagen, F. A. J. (2017). Inconvenient truths about teacher learning: Towards professional development 3.0. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 23(4), 387–405. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2016.1211523>
- Kutsyruba, B., Walker, K., Stasel R.S. & al Makhamreh, M. (2019). Developing Resilience and Promoting Well-Being in Early Career Teaching: Advice from the Canadian Beginning Teachers. *Canadian Journal of Education*, 42(1), 285–321. <https://journals.sfu.ca/cje/index.php/cje-rce/article/view/3511>
- Lecat, A., Beusaert, S., & Raemdonck, I. (2018). On the relation between teachers' (in)formal learning and innovative working behavior: The mediating role of employability. *Vocations and Learning*, 11(3), 529e554.
- Le Cornu, R. (2009). Building resilience in pre-service teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 25(5), 717–723. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2008.11.016>
- Leijen, Ä., Lam, I., Wildschut, L., & Simons, P. R. J. (2009). Difficulties teachers report about students' reflection: Lessons learned from dance education. *Teaching in Higher Education* 14, 3, 315–26. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562510902898882>
- Leijen, Ä., & Toom, A. (2017). Supporting the construction of Teacher's Practical Knowledge Through Different Interactive Formats of Oral Reflection and Written Reflection. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research*, 61(5), 600–615.
- Leroux, M., & Théorêt, M. (2014). Intriguing empirical relations between teachers' resilience and reflection on practice. *Reflective Practice*, 15(3), 289–303. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2014.900009>
- Lipka, R. P., & Brinthaupt, T. M. (Eds.). (1999). *The role of self in teacher development*. State University of New York Press. <https://www.sunypress.edu/p-2894-the-role-of-self-in-teacher-dev.aspx>
- Louws, M., van Veen, K., Meirink, J.A. & van Driel, J.H. (2017) Teachers' professional learning goals in relation to teaching experience, *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 40(4), 487-504. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2017.1342241>
- Mankki, V. & Räihä, P. (2022) Primary teachers' professional learning during a COVID-19 school lockdown, *Educational Research*, 64(1), 1-17. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131881.2021.2013127>
- Marco-Bujosa, L. M., McNeill, K. L., & Friedman, A. A. (2019). Becoming an urban science teacher: How beginning teachers negotiate contradictory school contexts. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 57(1), 3–32. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tea.21583>
- Meijer, P., de Graaf, G., & Meirink, J. (2011). Key experiences in student teachers' development. *Teachers and Teaching*, 17(1), 115–129. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2011.538502>
- Meijer, P. C., Oolbekkink, H. W., Pillen, M., & Aardema, A. (2014). Pedagogies of developing teacher identity. In C. Craig & L. Orland-Barak (Eds.), *International teacher education: Promising pedagogies Part A* (pp. 293–310). Emerald Group Publishing Limited. <https://doi.org/10.1108/S1479-368720150000025027>
- Nickel, J., & Crosby, S. (2021): Professional identity values and tensions for early career teachers, *Teaching Education*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10476210.2021.1895107>

## TEACHER TENSIONS

- Noddings. (2012). The caring relation in teaching. *Oxford Review of Education*, 38(6), 771–781.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/03054985.2012.745047>
- O'Connor. (2008). "You choose to care": Teachers, emotions and professional identity. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 24(1), 117–126. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2006.11.008>
- Opfer, V. D., and D. Pedder. 2011. Conceptualizing teacher professional learning. *Review of Educational Research*, 81(3), 376–407.  
doi:10.3102/0034654311413609.
- Pillen, M., Beijaard, D., & Den Brok, P. (2013a). Tensions in beginning teachers' professional identity development, accompanying feelings and coping strategies. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 36(3), 240–260.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2012.696192>
- Pillen, M., Den Brok, P. & Beijaard, D. (2013b). Profiles and change in beginning teachers' professional identity tensions. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 34, 86–97. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2013.04.003>
- Podolsky, A., Kini, T., Bishop, J., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). *Solving the teacher shortage: How to attract and retain excellent educators*. Learning Policy Institute. <https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/product/solving-teacher-shortage>
- Rodgers, C. R., & Scott, K. H. (2008). The development of the personal self and professional identity in learning to teach. In M. Cochran-Smith, S. Feiman-Nemser, D. J. McIntyre, & K. E. Demers (Eds.), *Handbook of research on teacher education* (pp. 732–755). Routledge. <https://www.routledgehandbooks.com/doi/10.4324/9780203938690.ch40>
- Russell, T. (2018) A teacher educator's lessons learned from reflective practice. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 41(1), 4–14.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2017.1395852>
- Saka, Y., Southerland, S.A., Kittleson, J., & Hunter, T. (2013). Understanding the induction of a science teacher: The interaction of identity and context. *Journal of Research in Science Education*, 43, 1221–1244.  
<https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11165-012-9310-5>
- Schatz-Oppenheimer, & Dvir, N. (2014). From ugly duckling to swan: Stories of novice teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 37, 140–149. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2013.10.011>
- Schön, D. A. (1983). *The reflective practitioner: How professionals think in action*. Basic Books. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315237473>
- Shapira-Lishchinsky, O. (2011). Teachers' critical incidents: Ethical dilemmas in teaching practice. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 27(3), 1–9. <https://doi.org/doi:10.1016/j.tate.2010.11.003>
- Schaap, van der Want, A. C., Oolbekkink-Marchand, H. W., & Meijer, P. C. (2021). Changes over time in the professional identity tensions of Dutch early-career teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 100, 103283.  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2021.103283>
- Smith, D., Fisher, D., & Frey, N. (2015). *Better than carrots or sticks: Restorative practices for positive classroom management*. ASCD. <https://www.ascd.org/books/better-than-carrots-or-sticks?variant=116005>
- Sydnor, J. (2017). "I didn't realize how hard it would be!": Tensions and transformations in becoming a teacher. *Action in Teacher Education*, 39(2), 218–236, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01626620.2016.1226202>



## TEACHER TENSIONS

- Taxer, J., Becker-Kurz, B., & Frenzel, A. C. (2018). Do quality teacher–student relationships protect teachers from emotional exhaustion? The mediating role of enjoyment and anger. *Social Psychology of Education, 22*(1), 209–226. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11218-018-9468-4>
- Van der Wal, M., Oolbekkink-Marchand, H. W., Schaap, H., & Meijer, P. C. (2019). Impact of early career teachers' professional identity tensions. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 80*(1), 59–70. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2019.01.001>
- Van Rijswijk, M., Akkerman, S. F., Schaap, H., & van Tartwijk, J. (2016). Past perceptions and future expectations: Sensed dis/continuity at the start of teacher education. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 58*, 99–108. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2016.05.002>
- Volkman, M. J., & Anderson, M. A. (1998). Creating professional identity: Dilemmas and metaphors of a first-year chemistry teacher. *Science Education, 82*(3), 293–310. [https://doi.org/10.1002/\(SICI\)1098-237X\(199806\)](https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1098-237X(199806)82(3)<293::AID-SCE1098-237X(199806)82(3)<293::AID-SCE1098-237X(199806)82(3)>3.0.CO;2-1)
- Webster-Wright, A. (2009). Reframing professional development through understanding authentic professional learning. *Review of Educational Research, 79*(2), 702–739. doi:10.3102/0034654308330970
- Wolff, C. E., van den Bogert, N., Jarodzka, H., & Boshuizen, H. P. A. (2015). Keeping an eye on learning: Differences between expert and novice teachers' representations of classroom management events. *Journal of Teacher Education, 66*(1), 68–85. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487114549810>